

## ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

**Name of journal:** World Journal of Gastroenterology

**ESPS manuscript NO:** 22797

**Title:** M-CSF expressed in non-cancer tissues provides predictive powers for recurrence in HCC

**Reviewer's code:** 02992416

**Reviewer's country:** China

**Science editor:** Yuan Qi

**Date sent for review:** 2015-11-11 19:29

**Date reviewed:** 2015-12-08 13:12

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input type="checkbox"/> No	

### COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

In this paper, the authors aimed at investigating the role of macrophage colony-stimulating factor (M-CSF) in patients with hepatocellular carcinoma (HCC) after resection. They analyze the prognostic value of MCSF, CD163, CD31 and other clinicopathologic parameters for patients' DFS with hepatocellular carcinoma (HCC) and find M-CFS in non-cancer tissues can act as a predictor for patients DFS after resection. However, there are some SPECIFIC CONCERNS worth being addressed to improve the quality of the manuscript: 1, In table 2, "Indx of CD163 <26 vs ≥26" and "M-CSF density <36 vs ≥36" are wrong. The other data in this manuscript showed CD163 and M-CSF are associated with poor DFS. But here the hazard ratios are more than one. So they should be written as Indx of CD163 ≥26 vs <26" and "M-CSF density ≥36 vs <36". Please calculate it again to make sure. 2, On page 12, there is a concept mistake. Univariate analysis can be used to show whether the prognostic factor contribute to patients' survival or not. But it cannot be used to calculate the independent prognostic value of a prognostic factor. So the descriptions in this page are wrong. 3, In figure 3 and figure 4, the range of stratified group are mislabeled.