

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 19522

Title: Analysis of peripheral blood dendritic cells as a non-invasive tool in the follow-up of patients with chronic hepatitis C

Reviewer's code: 02450445

Reviewer's country: United States

Science editor: Jing Yu

Date sent for review: 2015-05-12 11:50

Date reviewed: 2015-06-29 23:34

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This is a timely review by Crosignani et al., on the contribution of peripheral blood dendritic cells to HCV pathogenesis, and the potential use of this cell population as a non-invasive tool in the follow-up of patients with chronic HCV. The review is well written and adds on a gap on HCV-related literature analysis. The manuscript would benefit of the addition of at least one figure model that recapitulates the current view on peripheral blood DCs on HCV pathogenesis.

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 19522

Title: Analysis of peripheral blood dendritic cells as a non-invasive tool in the follow-up of patients with chronic hepatitis C

Reviewer's code: 00503536

Reviewer's country: Japan

Science editor: Jing Yu

Date sent for review: 2015-05-12 11:50

Date reviewed: 2015-07-25 15:08

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The review manuscript written by Crosignani et al. describes the role of DCs in the natural course and treatment of HCV infection. The review is interesting and well summarized the reports on the issue. However, there are some concerns that need to be addressed. Major points, 1. The review should focus on the role of DCs in HCV infection. Therefore epidemiology, natural course, and clinical management of HCV infection should be more concise. 2. In page 13, the statement "multiple viral and non-viral mechanisms may directly and indirectly contribute to the decrease of mDCs and pDCs in the circulation" needs reconsideration, because reduction of the numbers of DCs might be due to the enhanced recruitment of DCs to the inflamed liver. Is there a negative correlation between HCV viral load and the numbers of DCs in HCV-infected patients? 3. Regarding the alterations in the function of DCs, most studies examined the cytokine production by DCs after in vitro stimulation with high concentrations of cytokines, which is an extremely abnormal condition in vivo. Therefore, the interpretation of those data may be questionable. Minor points, 1. In page 6, "Both pegIFN and RBV are indirect antiviral agents because they do not target a specific HCV protein or nucleic acid,



BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC

8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA

Telephone: +1-925-223-8242

Fax: +1-925-223-8243

E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com

<http://www.wjgnet.com>

while they have different immunomodulating actions” needs to be revised. Antiviral action of pegIFN is not specific for HCV, but has direct antiviral activity through induction of various antiviral proteins. 2. TIM3, LAG3, and CTLA4 in page 10, and DPP4 in page 11 should be full-spelled. 3. In page 12, the statement “strongly support a role for DCs in the activation of HCV-specific immune responses in the liver environment.” should be reconsidered, because DC activation occurs in the liver but antigen-specific T cell activation by the DCs could mainly occur in the drainage lymph nodes (there is no evidence for antigen-specific T cell activation in the liver).