

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 28549

Title: Naringenin protects against isoniazid and rifampicin-induced apoptosis in hepatic injury

Reviewer's code: 00503536

Reviewer's country: Japan

Science editor: Ze-Mao Gong

Date sent for review: 2016-07-06 18:27

Date reviewed: 2016-08-20 21:39

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The manuscript written by Wang et al. describes the protective effect of naringenin (NRG) on hepatic injury induced by isoniazid (INH) and rifampicin (RIF). The data show significant protective effect of NRG through suppression of apoptosis, which is demonstrated by serum transaminases, liver histology, immunohistochemistry and western blotting. Since liver injury induced by INH and RIF is a serious problem for the treatment of tuberculosis, the data are important and may provide a novel clue for management of tuberculosis. However, there are some concerns that need to be addressed. Major point 1. Mice were pretreated by NRG before administration of INH and RIF. However, the effect is unclear if NRG is given after administration of INH and RIF or development of liver injury. This may be more important for clinical use in the treatment of tuberculosis with INH and RIF. Minor points 1. Adverse effect of NRG should be stated, if there is. 2. It is stated that NRG was dissolved in 5% CMC. What is CMC? Although the experiment includes the control group treated with NSS alone, another control group that should be included is the mice treated with INH/RIF and the dissolved solution with CMC/NSS.

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 28549

Title: Naringenin protects against isoniazid and rifampicin-induced apoptosis in hepatic injury

Reviewer's code: 03521888

Reviewer's country: Egypt

Science editor: Ze-Mao Gong

Date sent for review: 2016-07-06 18:27

Date reviewed: 2016-08-23 00:52

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The authors wrote this manuscript in a good way. However, In Abstract.. Results section in line 13 BCL-2 and Bax gene expression ...it should be protein not gene as they are measured by western blot. In discussion.. line 5 via INH and RFP infusion ... it should be intragastrically not infusion. References written in an organized way.

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 28549

Title: Naringenin protects against isoniazid and rifampicin-induced apoptosis in hepatic injury

Reviewer's code: 02860874

Reviewer's country: Mexico

Science editor: Ze-Mao Gong

Date sent for review: 2016-07-06 18:27

Date reviewed: 2016-08-27 07:06

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Congratulations to the authors, this is a very nice experiment, the manuscript clearly explains the protective effect of naringenin against anti tuberculosis drugs induced liver injury.