



ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 28956

Title: Association between Helicobacter pylori status and metachronous gastric cancer after endoscopic resection

Reviewer's code: 00503433

Reviewer's country: Iran

Science editor: Jing Yu

Date sent for review: 2016-07-25 12:33

Date reviewed: 2016-08-14 16:44

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The manuscript entitled: "The association between Helicobacter pylori status and the incidence of metachronous gastric cancer after endoscopic submucosal dissection of early gastric cancer" has aimed determine the effect of HP status test and HP eradication on the occurrence of MGC after ESD of EGC and risk factors of MGC. The goal of this study is unclear: Is the goal of the authors to compare the incidence of MGC among Hp-positive [no data available] versus Hp-negative [N=95, (MCG=7), 7.4%] subjects, prior to treatment? Is the goal to compare the incidence of MCG among subjects before [no data available] versus after Hp eradication [N=120, (MGC=3), 2.5%]? Is the goal to compare Hp-treatment success on the development of MCG, in which case Hp-eradicated group [N=120, (MGC=3), 2.5%] should be compared to Hp-persistent group [N=19, (MGC=1), 5.3%]? The authors should first clarify their goals, before the manuscript can be reviewed accordingly.



**ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT**

**Name of journal:** World Journal of Gastroenterology

**ESPS manuscript NO:** 28956

**Title:** Association between Helicobacter pylori status and metachronous gastric cancer after endoscopic resection

**Reviewer’s code:** 01554907

**Reviewer’s country:** China

**Science editor:** Jing Yu

**Date sent for review:** 2016-07-25 12:33

**Date reviewed:** 2016-08-18 19:18

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

**COMMENTS TO AUTHORS**

The relationship between H. pylori eradication on the development of metachronous gastric cancer (MGC) after endoscopic submucosal dissection (ESD) for early gastric cancer remains controversial. The present retrospective study investigates the effect of H.pylori status and eradication on the occurrence of MGC and risk factors after ESD. The authors declared that the risk factors of MGC after ESD for early gastric cancer were gastric mucosal atrophy and intestinal metaplasia, and H.pylori eradication has no preventive effect on the development of MGC. The paper is well written. However, the differences in the baseline characteristics of patients included, eg., the atrophy and intestinal metaplasia status, the small number of MGC patients, and the determination of H.pylori status, make the results unbelievable.