



ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 27421

Title: Pediatric living donor liver transplantation for congenital hepatic fibrosis using a mother’s graft with von Meyenburg complex: A case report

Reviewer’s code: 03474922

Reviewer’s country: Switzerland

Science editor: Jing Yu

Date sent for review: 2016-05-30 12:06

Date reviewed: 2016-06-22 06:08

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This case report is interesting in the context of pediatric liver transplantation given the organ donor shortage. It gives a solution to the medical team and should not be a limitation to consider donation.

Abstract: Give a good understanding of the case. The part concerning the donor might be a bit long for the abstract.

Background: Good introduction, well structured and easy to read. But the sentence: "due to the lack..." is in contradiction with the sentence above " therefore it may be...". The authors try to persuade the reader that it could be a valid option for a transplant and this part might put a doubt in his mind. Even though one should stay cautious given the lack of data so far.

Case Presentation: The story is well written. However, some more details about the following aspect of the story would be interesting:

- Were there any other symptoms apart from the hematemesis that would have lead to the liver biopsy?
- Why the donor didn't get a biopsy in order to establish the diagnosis with certainty before transplantation? What was the rational?
- Is the CT at POD 28 a standard of care ? if not, what had lead the team to do it?
- What about the follow up ? For how long has she been transplanted? How often does she have medical visits?
- What about



BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC

8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA

Telephone: +1-925-223-8242

Fax: +1-925-223-8243

E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com

<http://www.wjgnet.com>

immunosuppression? Discussion: Also easy to read. End of third paragraph: "to our experience..." please add references when you write about previous report. Again could you please be more specific when you write about oncologic surveillance. What would be your recommendation? Same comment regarding renal function. Figure 3: an arrow would help to better see what lesion we are suppose to see



BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC

8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA

Telephone: +1-925-223-8242

Fax: +1-925-223-8243

E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com

http://www.wjgnet.com

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 27421

Title: Pediatric living donor liver transplantation for congenital hepatic fibrosis using a mother's graft with von Meyenburg complex: A case report

Reviewer's code: 03017199

Reviewer's country: China

Science editor: Jing Yu

Date sent for review: 2016-05-30 12:06

Date reviewed: 2016-07-28 09:50

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input type="checkbox"/> No	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Comments: This manuscript describes Pediatric living donor liver transplantation for congenital hepatic fibrosis using a mother's graft with von Meyenburg complex: A case report. Despite the work is potentially interesting and the phagocytic activation is of great clinical relevance, some point need attention... Specific comments: 1. Markers of liver function should provided. 2. The authors should more discuss what is innovative or profitable of this method in this case.