

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 20906

Title: Gender Difference in Gastro-esophageal Reflux Diseases

Reviewer's code: 00158975

Reviewer's country: China

Science editor: Ze-Mao Gong

Date sent for review: 2015-06-27 13:45

Date reviewed: 2015-08-13 17:01

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
		BPG Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This is a review with very attractive topic of discussion. However several issues have to be clarified by the author: 1. In the article a number of epidemiological studies have been quoted to support the conclusion of lower incidence of GERD and esophageal cancer in women, and that the protective effect is lost after menopause. However, most of these studies did not adjust for the life style modifications after menopause, including the diet, activity levels and other stress responses, which may be major confounding factors. 2. Obesity was hypothesized to be one of the reasons for the gender difference in the reflux disease spectrum, and the authors suggested a possible relationship due to estrogen exposure. But given the profound evidence about the effect of leptin on obesity, the real significance of effect exerted by estrogen on the clinical outcome has to be carefully considered. 3. Even with well proven protective effect of estrogen on reflux disease, the potential to apply into clinical practice and risk stratification may still be limited. Is there any survival benefit if an elderly lady was identified to be a high risk patient in her 80s? And the potential role of hormone replacement therapy is still in question given the fact that men with heavy estrogen exposure did not reduce the risk of esophageal cancer.

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 20906

Title: Gender Difference in Gastro-esophageal Reflux Diseases

Reviewer's code: 00008633

Reviewer's country: Japan

Science editor: Ze-Mao Gong

Date sent for review: 2015-06-27 13:45

Date reviewed: 2015-08-24 20:23

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

It is an interesting review.