

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 21734

Title: Genomic characterization of esophageal squamous cell carcinoma: insights from next-generation sequencing

Reviewer's code: 00503623

Reviewer's country: United States

Science editor: Ze-Mao Gong

Date sent for review: 2015-07-30 09:12

Date reviewed: 2015-07-31 03:26

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This well written review details recent advance in esophageal cancer characterization, with the application of NGS technique in cancer genomic studies of ESCC, as well as points to future possibilities of applying the results to facilitate the targeted therapies. The manuscript is well illustrated and the content supported by 78 references. Minor comment: Page 11 under RTK_MAPK-PI3K In this section you are stressing overexpression of EGFR as the major feature of ESCC, whereas the more recent data point to the role of EGFR ligand shedding in the inflammatory process as well as cancer. Hence, the suggested references should be included and discussed in the context to broaden the scope. See Molecular Cell, vol. 37, pp.551-566, 2010) and OA Inflammation 2013 Apr 01;1(1):1.

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 21734

Title: Genomic characterization of esophageal squamous cell carcinoma: insights from next-generation sequencing

Reviewer's code: 00052396

Reviewer's country: United States

Science editor: Ze-Mao Gong

Date sent for review: 2015-07-30 09:12

Date reviewed: 2015-08-24 06:13

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

An interesting and thoughtful review for gastroenterologists

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 21734

Title: Genomic characterization of esophageal squamous cell carcinoma: insights from next-generation sequencing

Reviewer's code: 01557562

Reviewer's country: Japan

Science editor: Ze-Mao Gong

Date sent for review: 2015-07-30 09:12

Date reviewed: 2015-09-05 23:37

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This paper is a well-written review article concerning a current overview of the somatic genetic alterations in ESCC by being emphasized from the recent results of large-scale sequencing efforts using next-generation sequencing (NGS) technology. In the review article, the author well summarized the previous reports and addressed the problems. After minor revisions, this article would be improved and potentially acceptable for publication in World Journal of Gastroenterology. Comments 1. The authors cited 5 famous articles (ref. 31-35) about genomic alterations in ESCC using NGS. However, explanation of the information including the frequency of genomic mutation of TP53, NOTCH1, PI3K and CCND1 was not sufficient. 2. Page 11, line 4 (... mutation rate of 14-33%), some citations should be added. 3. Page 11, line 10 (... through to lead to a loss of function.), some citations should be added. 4. Page 13, line 6 (... over 70% of ESCC samples.), some citations should be added.