

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 21943

Title: Cystic micropapillary neoplasm of peribiliary glands with concomitant perihilar cholangiocarcinoma

Reviewer's code: 00050849

Reviewer's country: Sweden

Science editor: Ya-Juan Ma

Date sent for review: 2015-08-05 09:45

Date reviewed: 2015-09-14 03:28

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This is a case report by Uchida et al. presenting a cystic micropapillary neoplasm of peribiliary glands with concomitant perihilar cholangiocarcinoma. The authors conclude that this case warrants further study as it may be correspond to the combination of IPMN with concomitant pancreatic duct adenocarcinoma. This is the first case of such combination of tumours and deserves publication. The only disadvantage is that no other similar series of cases/case have been reported to make this result more solid.

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 21943

Title: Cystic micropapillary neoplasm of peribiliary glands with concomitant perihilar cholangiocarcinoma

Reviewer's code: 00070776

Reviewer's country: China

Science editor: Ya-Juan Ma

Date sent for review: 2015-08-05 09:45

Date reviewed: 2015-08-05 15:28

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

I have not seen the paper, so can not review it up to now. Can you help me?

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 21943

Title: Cystic micropapillary neoplasm of peribiliary glands with concomitant perihilar cholangiocarcinoma

Reviewer's code: 02512504

Reviewer's country: Switzerland

Science editor: Ya-Juan Ma

Date sent for review: 2015-08-05 09:45

Date reviewed: 2015-09-26 16:35

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Uchida et al. describe a case of cystic micropapillary neoplasm of the peribiliary glands with concomitant perihilar cholangiocarcinoma. The case is consistently documented, however, it remains elusive whether the two rather rare neoplastic lesions do have a common trunk in their neoplastic pathogenesis or whether this is just a coincidence. Some points should be adopted in the manuscript: 1) The authors claim that this is the "first case of...". The world literature is huge and it is wise to add "To our knowledge....the first case". 2) The Figure 2 should be integrated in Figure 1 (at the position with the graft for the enumeration) and the figures labeled directly. 3) Instead, Figure 2 should contain the immunohistochemistry of the markers most differently (i.e. Muc 6, S100P Muc5AC, p53) 4) The internal survey for other similar lesions should be omitted. This is a case report of rare lesion, and the internal review does not add any additional information. Finally, if possible, a molecular analysis of the lesions using deep sequencing would be interesting to see the molecular relationship.