

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 23253

Title: Hepatocellular carcinoma and non-alcoholic steatohepatitis: The state of play

Reviewer's code: 02821572

Reviewer's country: United States

Science editor: Jing Yu

Date sent for review: 2015-11-04 15:01

Date reviewed: 2015-11-07 01:08

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Charrez et al reviewed recent progress in the understanding of hepatocellular carcinoma as a consequence of non-alcoholic fatty liver disease. These authors did an insightful critical analysis of current literature and often provided innovative ideas regarding the future research directions. It is an outstanding review for physicians and investigators. This reviewer suggest acceptance after minor revision. Minor issues: The reviewer suggests to discuss the fact that the polymorphisms (such as PNPLA3 GG) associated with NASH/HCC are not required for the development of NASH/HCC, and are not sufficient for the development of NASH/HCC. A large portion of healthy population are GG carriers; while the majority of NASH/HCC are CC or GC carriers. Page 2, Line 4, "later" should be "latter". Page 2, Line 12, "the" should be "that". Page 4, grammatical errors in the last four lines. Page 4, line 2, the first "NASH" should be removed. Page 4, line 12, incomplete sentence.

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 23253

Title: Hepatocellular carcinoma and non-alcoholic steatohepatitis: The state of play

Reviewer's code: 00070138

Reviewer's country: China

Science editor: Jing Yu

Date sent for review: 2015-11-04 15:01

Date reviewed: 2015-11-07 21:33

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		[Y] No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		[Y] No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Reviewers' Comments to Author: This review focus on clinical and genomic associationa between NAFLD and NASH to liver cancer. The authors discuss new candidate genes as markers for increased HCC risk, and present the latest murine models to clarify some of the mechanisms in promoting liver tumor growth. The idea is new in this field and worth to be published.

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 23253

Title: Hepatocellular carcinoma and non-alcoholic steatohepatitis: The state of play

Reviewer's code: 02861277

Reviewer's country: Italy

Science editor: Jing Yu

Date sent for review: 2015-11-04 15:01

Date reviewed: 2015-11-10 18:25

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Charrez and colleagues reviewed the clinical and experimental evidences related to the development of HCC in the evolution of non-alcoholic steatohepatitis (NASH). The authors focused their attention on different aspects strictly related to this serious health burden taking in account polymorphisms, biomarkers, animal models, pathological mechanisms as well as potential therapeutic approaches. The manuscript appears well written and provides a critical and unbiased overview on this specific topic. Minor comments: Page 4 first line from the top: "HCV-related HCC increased from 43.4% to 49.9% NASH, whereas NASH..." should be changed in "HCV-related HCC increased from 43.4% to 49.9%, whereas NASH". Page 10 second paragraph the sentence "fed the mice various diets..." should be modified in "fed the mice with various diets..." Page 14 "rapamycin and its analogues Everolimus" should be changed as "rapamycin and its analogous Everolimus". Page 15 third line from the top "HCC were divided in to sedentary..." looks better as "HCC were divided into sedentary..."