

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 21243

Title: Risk factors for tuberculosis after gastrectomy in gastric cancer

Reviewer's code: 00608210

Reviewer's country: Thailand

Science editor: Jing Yu

Date sent for review: 2015-07-06 10:02

Date reviewed: 2015-07-07 16:33

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Dear Editor, I thank you very much for giving the opportunity to review this manuscript. This is a study exploring the relation between the development of TB and gastrectomy in gastric cancer patients. In addition, the risk factors for TB after gastrectomy are also described. Although this knowledge is well known, the authors emphasizes by this large cohort. However, I have some questions and comments about this retrospective study. 1. Gastrectomy is a risk factor for TB. I wonder why the authors did not enroll all patients who underwent gastrectomies from any causes. 2. Because TB is an indolent disease and may be asymptomatic, I would like to know that every cases in this study performed CXR before gastrectomies. In addition, after gastrectomy, in the authors' institute, how often does CXR routinely perform? 3. The authors showed 95% of patients were followed for more than 1 year. As stated above that TB is an indolent disease. Is it possible to show how many patients were followed more than 2 years after gastrectomies. 4. The authors showed the incidence of TB after gastrectomy. Please also provide the incidence of TB in general population in South Korea during the study period. 5. Some words and grammar error. In conclusion, in my opinion, this study merits to be published with some minor revision.

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 21243

Title: Risk factors for tuberculosis after gastrectomy in gastric cancer

Reviewer's code: 00503062

Reviewer's country: Japan

Science editor: Jing Yu

Date sent for review: 2015-07-06 10:02

Date reviewed: 2015-07-08 16:19

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The manuscript by Jung et al. examined incidence of tuberculosis in gastrectomy patients and analyze risk factors for tuberculosis after gastrectomy in gastric cancer. The topic of this manuscript is interesting and the manuscript is basically well written. Especially, it is interesting that the gastrectomy extent (total versus subtotal gastrectomy) affect the incidence of tuberculosis. The limitation of this study is that the number of active tuberculosis patients is low (n=16) compared with that of not active tuberculosis patients. It is better to show Table 1 and Table 2 in each one page if possible. Minor points are as follows. Page 1, title; Page 3, lines 4, 5 from bottom. "Tuberculosis" is not necessary to start with capital (T) if it is not the first word in a sentence. Page 3, line 13; line 2 from bottom, page 10, line 14; page 7, line 3 from bottom. "per 1 kg/m²" should be "kg/m²". Page 8, line 10. Show the reference number of "one recent study". Page 11, lines 8-14. The title of reference # 3 is too long. Check it again.

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 21243

Title: Risk factors for tuberculosis after gastrectomy in gastric cancer

Reviewer's code: 02860614

Reviewer's country: Pakistan

Science editor: Jing Yu

Date sent for review: 2015-07-06 10:02

Date reviewed: 2015-07-14 17:25

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Grammar mistakes are there. Why all of the patients who went for gastrectomies due to any reason were not enrolled in the study?