

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 22771

Title: Liver surgery in cirrhosis and portal hypertension

Reviewer's code: 02537303

Reviewer's country: Germany

Science editor: Ze-Mao Gong

Date sent for review: 2015-09-23 12:10

Date reviewed: 2015-09-23 17:38

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Dear Authors, thank you for submitting this highly interesting manuscript to WJG. In my opinion it can be accepted for publication after minor revision. Please try to include results of these highly selected patient Groups more in detail. Although this is not a systematic review, please try to include e.g. Kaplan-Meier Survival Graphs to illustrate the problems of the topic (e.g. results of Liver resection of Child A vs. B vs C?). At all the paper is of outstanding quality and includes all important topics of these challenging patients. Sincerely Gernot Kaiser

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 22771

Title: Liver surgery in cirrhosis and portal hypertension

Reviewer's code: 00058381

Reviewer's country: Austria

Science editor: Ze-Mao Gong

Date sent for review: 2015-09-23 12:10

Date reviewed: 2015-09-24 03:39

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		[Y] No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		[Y] No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Major Comment: This manuscript provides an overview on an important and delicate topic. Some passages remain vague, but this is not the fault of the authors. Minor Comments: For "Philipp Renner" no author contribution is stated. Page 4, first line: "encephatopathy" -> encephalopathy Page 5, end of first paragraph: "thrompocytopenia" -> thrombocytopenia; "<100000/nl"-> did you mean <100/nl? Table 4: "bilirubine" -> bilirubin. Tables 3 and 5: Please provide references for the numbers and percentages (even if some of them are mentioned elsewhere within the text). Language polishing is required (e.g., "...a significantly increase in perioperative morbidity and mortality has been shown..."; "...expertise in shunt surgery is not widespread anymore and therefore should be only performed in specialized centres"; etc.)

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 22771

Title: Liver surgery in cirrhosis and portal hypertension

Reviewer's code: 00053950

Reviewer's country: Finland

Science editor: Ze-Mao Gong

Date sent for review: 2015-09-23 12:10

Date reviewed: 2015-09-27 19:35

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The authors describe in their review the possibilities of liver surgery in patient suffering from liver cirrhosis and possibly also from portal hypertension. Comments: - The paper is well written, and only some minor linguistic inaccuracies as hepatic cirrhosis may be seen. - It seems like the paper is comprised of three different parts written by different authors. By far the best part is between the subtitle Preoperative risk evaluation and Postoperative morbidity. This part describing the actual operative risks and surgical techniques discloses the message of the article. - Table 1. The list of various cirrhoses is rather diffuse. The cirrhoses could be grouped on the ground of the background of the disease. Polycystic degeneration may not be regarded as cirrhosis. Infection as a cause of cirrhosis? May be omitted. - Table 2. VOD is nowadays called SOS. - Postoperative Morbidity. Table 4 is fine, but small chapters dealing with postoperative complications are rather uninformative. They should be put together, and only a mention of wound healing and postoperative hemorrhage is enough. - Results after liver resection... Some repetition to the introduction of the paper is noted. - Surgical therapy of portal hypertension. This part does not belong to the focus of the study. It is fair enough to mention that TIPS may be used before some major abdominal surgery to alleviate portal



BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC

8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA

Telephone: +1-925-223-8242

Fax: +1-925-223-8243

E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com

<http://www.wjgnet.com>

hypertension, but shunt surgery is absolutely beyond of the scope of the study. Thus Table 5 should be omitted. - I would expect that the team would have much more interesting figures than Fig 1 and 2.