

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 30919

Title: Therapeutic effect of curcumin treated experimental colitis by inhibiting CD8+CD11c+ cells

Reviewer's code: 03657238

Reviewer's country: India

Science editor: Jing Yu

Date sent for review: 2016-10-25 09:19

Date reviewed: 2016-11-15 17:14

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Dear Author(s) The manuscript is presented in an easy understandable manner. The topic in the manuscript is very well explained. But it requires substantial corrections for the acceptance. A. General suggestions/corrections/comments 1. Grammar corrections and spacing mistakes all over the manuscript were highlighted in the text needs to be corrected. 2. Technical corrections are highlighted in the text. B. Materials and Methods 1. Only female rats were taken not male and comparison between the two could have been made. 2. Disease activity index needs to be modified in the text with clear explanation or presented in the table format as below. Scoring of the disease activity index (DAI) [Chen et al., 2007] Score Decrease in growth (%) or Weight loss Stool consistency Occult/gross rectal bleeding 0 0 Normal Normal 1 1~5 Normal Occult blood + 2 5~10 Loose stools Occult blood ++ 3 10~15 Loose stools Occult blood +++ 4 >15 Diarrhea Gross bleeding C. Discussion 1. Concise the text. Do not exceed more than 2 printed pages. D. References 1. Morris et al., - not included in the reference part 2. Follow the journal format in the reference part. Check the authors instruction section for the format. 3. Citation of too many references in the manuscript

should be avoided. E. Suggestions: The following reports can also be considered which would further help in discussing the results. Satish Kumar CS, Kondal Reddy K, Reddy AG, Vinoth A, Ch SR, Boobalan G, Rao GS (2015) Protective effect of *Lactobacillus plantarum* 21, a probiotic on trinitrobenzenesulfonic acid-induced ulcerative colitis in rats. *Int Immunopharmacol.* 25(2): 504-10. Gopu B, Dileep D, Rani MU, Kumar CS, Kumar MV, Reddy AG. (2015). Protective role of curcumin and flunixin against acetic-acid induced IBD via modulating inflammatory mediators and cytokine profile in rats. *J Environ Pathol Toxicol Oncol.* 34(4): 309-20. Fujiwara D, Chen L, Wei B, Braun J. (2011). Small intestine CD11c⁺ CD8⁺ T cells suppress CD4⁺ T cell-induced immune colitis. *Am J Physiol Gastrointest Liver Physiol.* 300(6):G939-G47. Rutella S, Locatelli F. (2011) Intestinal dendritic cells in the pathogenesis of inflammatory bowel disease. *World J Gastroenterol.* 17(33):3761-75. Notes: Chen Y, Si J, Liu W, et al. 2007. Induction of experimental acute ulcerative colitis in rats by administration of dextran sulfate sodium at low concentration followed by intracolonic administration of 30% ethanol. *Journal of Zhejiang University Science B.* 8(9):632-637.

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 30919

Title: Therapeutic effect of curcumin treated experimental colitis by inhibiting CD8+CD11c+ cells

Reviewer's code: 03569706

Reviewer's country: Romania

Science editor: Jing Yu

Date sent for review: 2016-10-25 09:19

Date reviewed: 2016-11-27 23:57

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> [Y] Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> [Y] Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> [Y] Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> [Y] No	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> [Y] No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Please check the English ("is a transmembrane protein I which") Abstract: - define all abbreviations used in this section (see DAI) - be more specific ... what "significantly decrease" means Statistical analysis: - scores are by definition qualitative ordinal data so the correct summarization is done using medial and (Q1-Q3) while the comparisons are conducted with non-parametric tests instead of parametric (ANOVA). Results: - use boxplot with median and Q1-Q3 instead of column charts. - the results are presented for 10 animals per group while in the material and methods is written that 8 animals per group were used. Conclusion: - "we demonstrated that Cur effectively treated experimental colitis, which was realized by inhibiting CD8 + CD11c + cells". No such demonstration was presented in the manuscript.

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 30919

Title: Therapeutic effect of curcumin treated experimental colitis by inhibiting CD8+CD11c+ cells

Reviewer's code: 03536491

Reviewer's country: Saudi Arabia

Science editor: Jing Yu

Date sent for review: 2016-10-25 09:19

Date reviewed: 2016-12-03 16:13

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Method of induction of colitis by the using agent and its dose should be mentioned (oral or intraperitoneal)