

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 31013

Title: Experimental Porcine Model of Complex Fistula-in-Ano

Reviewer's code: 02445717

Reviewer's country: Spain

Science editor: Yuan Qi

Date sent for review: 2016-10-27 21:14

Date reviewed: 2016-11-22 01:08

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		[Y] No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		[Y] No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

It is a good original research about the establishment and assess of an experimental porcine model of fistula-in-ano in large animal model. They demonstrate that the surgical method using rubber ligation to establish complex fistula in ano was stable and reliable. This method was better than the artificial damage process. Large animal models of complex anal fistula can be further used for the diagnosis and treatment of anal fistula fields. However there are some issues and recommendations: It is necessary include a conclusion to the end of the discussion. The reference 14 is not correct. Should be corrected. Given that there is few papers about experimental porcine model of fistula-in-ano. The paper (Int Surg. 2013 Apr-Jun;98(2): 122-8) should be included and discussed in the text.

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 31013

Title: Experimental Porcine Model of Complex Fistula-in-Ano

Reviewer's code: 02542015

Reviewer's country: China

Science editor: Yuan Qi

Date sent for review: 2016-10-27 21:14

Date reviewed: 2016-12-14 12:36

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input type="checkbox"/> No	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This is a study evaluating the usefulness of a rubber band ligation method for establishing porcine experimental anal fistula. Animal model is important for pre-clinical studies in the field of diagnosis and treatment of anal fistulas. Therefore, the result of this study is meaningful. However, the manuscript has some problems for authors to address as follows. 1. Could the anal fistulas established with a rubber band ligation method simulate the clinical anal fistula in pathophysiology? How about anal fistula caused by Crohn disease? 2. Does diameter size of rubber band affect the success rate of modeling? 3. Different evaluation methods (MRI, histopathology) were employed at different time points to assess the confirmation of fistula. What is the meaning of the measurement? 4. In "perioperative management" section, "Thirty days after surgery, the two groups of animals received clinical magnetic resonance imaging and histopathological evaluation", which is inconsistent with the expression in "postoperative intervention" section. All animals received MRI on 38th day and were performed pathological examination on 48th day after surgery or both on 30th day? 5. In "surgical intervention" section, the subheadings in part 1 and part 2 are the same. 6. The author should not integrate the figure 1-3. Essential figure legend should be included Corresponding to each



BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC

8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA

Telephone: +1-925-223-8242

Fax: +1-925-223-8243

E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com

<http://www.wjgnet.com>

figure.