

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 31008

Title: Effect of treatment failure on the CagA EPIYA motif in Helicobacter pylori isolates

Reviewer's code: 03699937

Reviewer's country: Iran

Science editor: Yuan Qi

Date sent for review: 2016-10-27 20:58

Date reviewed: 2016-10-29 11:15

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

I HAVE READ THE PAPER ENTITLED " Effect of treatment failure on the CagA EPIYA motif in Helicobacter pylori isolates" written by Rengifo et al, AND ENJOYED IT. The paper should be; shorten in introduction, since it is too long and stand with some repeating sections. References are good! Methods are too long as well and contains some unnecessary parts. Not clear conclusion at the end. Major revision for the english is also required.

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 31008

Title: Effect of treatment failure on the CagA EPIYA motif in Helicobacter pylori isolates

Reviewer's code: 00032528

Reviewer's country: Japan

Science editor: Yuan Qi

Date sent for review: 2016-10-27 20:58

Date reviewed: 2016-10-29 16:12

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

General: In this study, the authors investigated to identify effects of treatment failure on the CagA EPIYA motif in Helicobacter pylori isolates. Major comments: 1. Sample power is limited. Please analyze sample power to evaluate significant. If authors add sample number, the value of this study will increase. 2. Volume of this manuscript is too much. Authors should delete 35-50% of whole volume. 3. It is unclear what authors want to show in this study. Was CagA EPIYA motif genotype or status important to clinical outcome of eradication therapy? 4. Please summarize prevalence of cagA, vacA genotype, EPIYA motif genotype in Table. 5. How about vacA i-region type? 6. In general, clinical outcome of eradication therapy depends on susceptibility to antimicrobial agents, CYP2C19 genotype, treatment period, dose of drugs and dosing times. Authors should show any of above parameters. 7. Susceptibility to antimicrobial agents, especially in clarithromycin, can be checked by point mutation of 23S rRNA A2142G, A2142C, and A2143G.

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 31008

Title: Effect of treatment failure on the CagA EPIYA motif in Helicobacter pylori isolates

Reviewer's code: 03476682

Reviewer's country: Thailand

Science editor: Yuan Qi

Date sent for review: 2016-10-27 20:58

Date reviewed: 2016-10-31 02:16

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

October 30th, 2016 Reviewer' Code: 03476682 ESPS Manuscript NO: 31008 Title: Effect of treatment failure on the CagA EPIYA motif in Helicobacter pylori isolates Manuscript Type: BASIC STUDY Comments to Authors This is a potentially interesting manuscript that attempts to evaluate the effect of treatment failure on the CagA EPIYA motif in Helicobacter pylori isolates from Colombia. I have substantial major concerns regarding this manuscript: Majors concern (1) The overall structure of the manuscript is complete, but the volume of this manuscript is too much (9,729 words).The authors should explain the short scientific background and rationale for the investigation being reported and provide specific objectives, including any prespecified hypotheses. (2) In the "Title and abstract" section; authors should provide short explain an informative and balanced summary of what was done and what was found. This manuscript is unclear what authors want to show in this study. (3) In the "Method section"; the sample power is too small. Please analyze correct sample power to evaluate significant. Multicenter study needs to prove the hypothesis and increase the value of the study. (4) In the "Discussion section" ? The result of eradication H.pylori infection depends on multifactor such as drug resistance in this area, duration of treatment, susceptibility to antibiotic etc.



BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC

8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA

Telephone: +1-925-223-8242

Fax: +1-925-223-8243

E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com

<http://www.wjgnet.com>

Authors should provide basic information about your area. ? Authors should be summaries the key results with reference to study objectives and how CagA EPIYA motif genotype or status important to clinical outcome of H.pylori eradication. (5) Please discuss limitations of the study, taking into account sources of potential bias or imprecision and future direction of the study.

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 31008

Title: Effect of treatment failure on the CagA EPIYA motif in *Helicobacter pylori* isolates

Reviewer's code: 03261349

Reviewer's country: Italy

Science editor: Yuan Qi

Date sent for review: 2016-10-27 20:58

Date reviewed: 2016-11-06 01:41

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		[Y] No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		[Y] No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

In the present paper, Bustamante-Rengifo et al demonstrated that failure of *H. pylori* eradication may lead to rearrangements in CagA region, with changes in EPIYA motifs. Main comments: 1) A minor linguistic revision is necessary. 2) Sample size is insufficient. 3) Authors advocate the hypothesis or re-infection of novel *H. pylori* strains in those patients who showed changes in CagA. This explanation is poorly acceptable, since epidemiological data show that this event is very unusual. Therefore, this explanation is not convincing. It is more probable that such patients had co-infection of several strains with heteroresistance. Therefore, after the treatment, only resistant strains survived, thus explaining different CagA motifs after the treatment. 4) Introduction and discussion are too long. They should be more focused on the aim and results of the study, otherwise they may bore the reader.