

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 31978

Title: Quality of life after total vs distal gastrectomy with Roux-en-Y reconstruction: Use of the Postgastrectomy Syndrome Assessment Scale-45

Reviewer's code: 03479537

Reviewer's country: France

Science editor: Jing Yu

Date sent for review: 2016-12-20 09:17

Date reviewed: 2017-01-06 02:45

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The authors have conducted a well-written study based on sound methods. The manuscript flows easily and with clarity. The case selection and choice of the important variables were appropriate and clinically relevant. The graphs and the tables are to the point and summarizing the main results of the study in an appropriate fashion. The retrospective nature limits the study, and the analysis would benefit from a propensity score matching to match the cases better and hence give stronger inference. Also, the study is not powered, and despite the relatively large sample size, we think it's better being powered given a large number of independent variables.

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 31978

Title: Quality of life after total vs distal gastrectomy with Roux-en-Y reconstruction: Use of the Postgastrectomy Syndrome Assessment Scale-45

Reviewer's code: 00068748

Reviewer's country: Greece

Science editor: Jing Yu

Date sent for review: 2016-12-20 09:17

Date reviewed: 2017-01-23 12:30

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Use of innovative questionnaire, but as it not widely known, I would prefer it to be provided in a table, instead of having to search in bibliography about it. Small refinement of the language in some paragraphs would be nice, for the text to flow easier (example: "maintaining" instead of "To maintain quality of life" in the first paragraph of introduction).