

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 31822

Title: Comparing acid steatocrit and faecal elastase estimations for use in M-ANNHEIM staging for pancreatitis

Reviewer's code: 00053888

Reviewer's country: United Kingdom

Science editor: Ya-Juan Ma

Date sent for review: 2016-12-11 21:23

Date reviewed: 2017-01-05 21:28

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The authors have produced a well designed and constructed study with useful clinical results. The design is clear, the outcomes well presented and the conclusion is also clear. The authors should be congratulated and the manuscript is worthy of publication with minimal changes only to grammar & typography.

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 31822

Title: Comparing acid steatocrit and faecal elastase estimations for use in M-ANNHEIM staging for pancreatitis

Reviewer's code: 00058446

Reviewer's country: China

Science editor: Ya-Juan Ma

Date sent for review: 2016-12-11 21:23

Date reviewed: 2017-01-15 22:07

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Accurate staging of pancreatitis is important to study the natural history of the disease and the effect of interventions. A 72-hour stool fat excretion and the secretin PZ test are considered the gold standard for assessing steatorrhea and exocrine pancreatic insufficiency (EPI) respectively, but they were not convenient for being applied clinically. The acid steatocrit method correlates well with the 72-hour quantitative faecal fat estimation with more simplicity, reliability and cost-effectiveness for evaluating steatorrhea in chronic pancreatitis (CP). In this study, The exocrine pancreatic function of patients with acute, recurrent acute and chronic pancreatitis was tested by methods of acid steatocrit method and Faecal elastase-1 (FE-1) test according to the classification of M-ANNHEIM stages. A statistically significant difference was found between the M-ANNHEIM stages as classified separately by the two tests. FE-1 test performed better than the acid steatocrit test for use in the staging of pancreatitis by the M-ANNHEIM classification. There are too less case in M-ANNHEIM 0/III stage, and more cases should be accumulated for comparing two methods in testing exocrine pancreatic function of pancreatitis patients.

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 31822

Title: Comparing acid steatocrit and faecal elastase estimations for use in M-ANNHEIM staging for pancreatitis

Reviewer's code: 02544032

Reviewer's country: Norway

Science editor: Ya-Juan Ma

Date sent for review: 2016-12-11 21:23

Date reviewed: 2017-01-13 03:57

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The manuscript presents data on steatorrhea due to pancreatic insufficiency in a total of 194 consecutive patients (inclusion June 2009-June 2014), 13 with acute pancreatitis, 65 recurrent pancreatitis and 116 chronic pancreatitis. Stool fat excretion was estimated by Faecal elastase (FE) 1 test and by the acid steatocrit method, both used for staging of pancreatitis according to the M-ANNHEIM system. The clinical relevance of the presented data is not obvious, and it is neither clarified by the authors. Most important methodological problem: The presented data does not support the conclusion, as no "gold standard" for pancreatic insufficiency is used to assess both the compared methods.

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 31822

Title: Comparing acid steatocrit and faecal elastase estimations for use in M-ANNHEIM staging for pancreatitis

Reviewer's code: 00068348

Reviewer's country: Greece

Science editor: Ya-Juan Ma

Date sent for review: 2016-12-11 21:23

Date reviewed: 2017-01-13 17:20

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The M-ANNHEIM classification system is based on the categorization according to the etiology, clinical stage, and severity of their disease. The M-ANNHEIM classification represents a simple, objective, accurate, and noninvasive tool in clinical practice and gains attention in combining the impact and interaction of a number of risk factors on the course of the disease. The article deal with the comparison of fecal elastase 1 and the acid steatocrit methods for evaluating chronic pancreatitis. Its an interesting comparison and of clinical value. The article is well written, the number of patients is large enough.