

## ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

**Name of journal:** World Journal of Gastroenterology

**ESPS manuscript NO:** 32280

**Title:** Indoleamine 2, 3-dioxygenase: As a potential prognostic marker and immunotherapeutic target for hepatocellular carcinoma

**Reviewer's code:** 00503536

**Reviewer's country:** Japan

**Science editor:** Yuan Qi

**Date sent for review:** 2017-01-03 16:43

**Date reviewed:** 2017-01-14 09:05

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

## COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The review summarized by Asghar et al. describes the role of indoleamine 2, 3-dioxygenase (IDO) in the pathogenesis of HBV- or HCV-associated hepatitis and hepatocarcinogenesis. The review is well written, but has some concerns that need to be addressed. Major points 1, Introduction is too long and contains specific statements regarding IDO in the pathogenesis of hepatitis B and C or hepatocellular carcinoma, which should be described in an independent chapter. 2. The title states that IDO is a prognostic marker, but there are few data or descriptions to support that point.

## ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

**Name of journal:** World Journal of Gastroenterology

**ESPS manuscript NO:** 32280

**Title:** Indoleamine 2, 3-dioxygenase: As a potential prognostic marker and immunotherapeutic target for hepatocellular carcinoma

**Reviewer's code:** 03262371

**Reviewer's country:** Iran

**Science editor:** Yuan Qi

**Date sent for review:** 2017-01-03 16:43

**Date reviewed:** 2017-01-26 10:46

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

## COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Dear editor The manuscript entitled "Indoleamine 2, 3-dioxygenase: a prognostic marker and immunotherapeutic target for hepatocellular carcinoma" is an informative review article which presents some useful information about the role of Indoleamine 2, 3-dioxygenase in HCV- and HBV-induced HCC. Author have mentioned about the role of occult HBV and I think they can also speak about the role of occult HCV infection in the HCC as this form of HCV cannot be diagnosed easily with usual laboratory approaches. I think authors should briefly mention their methods (data resources and search strategy) for performing this review and they can bring it in a separate paragraph in the manuscript. Readers need to know the exact criteria which authors used for bringing a description of each study in table 1. In my idea, the manuscript can be accepted after minor revision.