



BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC

8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA

Telephone: +1-925-223-8242

Fax: +1-925-223-8243

E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com

http://www.wjgnet.com

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 32300

Title: PIK3CA gene mutations in Northwest Chinese esophageal squamous cell carcinoma

Reviewer's code: 03505688

Reviewer's country: Spain

Science editor: Jing Yu

Date sent for review: 2017-01-04 10:17

Date reviewed: 2017-01-16 18:52

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

A study of 210 patients from Northwest China /Xi'an Jiaotong Univ between 2009-2015. Other similar studies are already published from Japan, China (Mori et al., J Surg Res 2008; Maeng et al., Plos One 2012, with small size (less than 100 patients); a third study, Shigaju et al Clin Cancer Res 2013 with 219 cases; and finally Wang et al.,m PLos One2014 conducted with 406 patients. Two studies only described mutations in exon 9 (aminoacid 545), other two observed mutations in both exon9 and exon 20. They used pyrosequencing and may have help in detecting more accurately respect the others who use normal sequencing (Sanger). Authors suggest that that the genetics and the size of the cohort used could also have contributed to the results. Authors highlight the favorable prognosis among patient with PIK3CA mutations. The novelty of this study is the high prevalence of PIK3CA mutations in exon 9 nearly 23% resulting in 48 individuals; the mutation more prevalent (>70%) was the E545A change, and the second detected, E545K. This manuscript obtains similar % of mutations than Shigaju et al., 2013 but less diversity (all in exon 9 and only two different mutations), in this article they also used pyrosequencing as a method of detection mutations. Technically sound,



BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC

8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA

Telephone: +1-925-223-8242

Fax: +1-925-223-8243

E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com

<http://www.wjgnet.com>

and medium-large sample collection. Seems a bit odd not detecting mutations in exon 20 but could be due to size of collection (others have also this result). mutations in PIK3CA associated to favourable prognosis should be tested with larger sample size. I would find useful if authors could perform a meta-analysis with all the possible studies separating Asian from European. And see whether the favourable prognosis could be more robust



BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC

8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA

Telephone: +1-925-223-8242

Fax: +1-925-223-8243

E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com

http://www.wjgnet.com

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 32300

Title: PIK3CA gene mutations in Northwest Chinese esophageal squamous cell carcinoma

Reviewer's code: 03551565

Reviewer's country: Poland

Science editor: Jing Yu

Date sent for review: 2017-01-04 10:17

Date reviewed: 2017-02-07 01:37

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The authors examined the associations of PIK3CA gene mutations with clinicopathological characteristics and the clinical outcome in esophageal squamous cell carcinoma patients in the population of in Northwest Chinese. The manuscript is complete, with a very clear aim of the research. Material and applied research methods are in my opinion correct. The results are presented clearly and comprehensibly. The discussion is profound and interesting. Authors exploited the most recent literature concerning the subject. The study suggests that PIK3CA gene mutations are associated with a favorable clinical outcome in esophageal squamous cell cancer and in future the evaluation of PIK3CA gene mutations may be potentially applied as a prognostic marker. In my opinion, the manuscript is worth sharing with other researchers. It is concise, clear, comprehensive and convincing.