

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 32249

Title: Overexpression of fibrinogen-like protein 2 protects against T cell-induced colitis

Reviewer's code: 00503086

Reviewer's country: Spain

Science editor: Yuan Qi

Date sent for review: 2016-12-30 17:06

Date reviewed: 2017-01-13 21:23

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		[Y] No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Collectively, the studies presented confirm that fibrinogen-like 2 protein (FGL2) is an important immunosuppressive effector and may be explored in inflammatory bowel disease (IBD) treatment. The study was perfectly designed and the methodology is sound. However, I did not find any figure showing FGL2 expression in any of the cell populations studied. Related with this, I don't see an explanation to understand the mechanism of action of FGL2 on lymphocytes. It is expressed on the cell surface to interact with any receptor in the same cell, or in other cells, or it is secreted (by these or other cells) to act through its receptors in the T cell subsets, or through cell-to-cell contacts? I would like to understand better this issue.

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 32249

Title: Overexpression of fibrinogen-like protein 2 protects against T cell-induced colitis

Reviewer's code: 00503126

Reviewer's country: United States

Science editor: Yuan Qi

Date sent for review: 2016-12-30 17:06

Date reviewed: 2017-01-05 07:19

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Bartczak, et. al. present their findings on the effects of FGL2 on the induction of colitis. This report complements and extends their data using other models of immune-mediated diseases. The experiments in this report were performed and described well. Two major effects are described. The first effect is that FGL2-transgenic Treg cells are more potent immunosuppressive agents than wild-type Treg cells both in vitro and in the colitis model. The second effect is that overexpression of FGL2 in effector T cells suppresses their function in vitro and in the colitis model. In either case, the possible mechanism is that soluble FGL2 in cell culture or in vitro could suppress effector T cell function. This mechanism should be tested either by adding soluble FGL2 or adding tissue culture supernatant from transgenic cells to effector T cells. The alternate possibility is that FGL2 alters Treg function, which in turns inhibits effector T cells. The other comment relates to the description of the T cell and Treg infiltrates into the MLN and colon. Whether FGL2 blocks migration, survival, or proliferation has not been thoroughly tested in this paper. Thus, the conclusions should simply reflect the presence of fewer cells and the discussion might elaborate on the possible mechanisms.

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 32249

Title: Overexpression of fibrinogen-like protein 2 protects against T cell-induced colitis

Reviewer's code: 03478396

Reviewer's country: Brazil

Science editor: Yuan Qi

Date sent for review: 2016-12-30 17:06

Date reviewed: 2017-01-19 00:12

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The manuscript is very well written and confirms the action of fibrinogen-like 2 protein (FGL2) in inflammatory bowel diseases model. . However, there are minor concerns: 1. It should be described the clinical signs of colitis that were evaluated. There is no figure or description fo these signs. 2. It should be necessary to show the alteration of the expression of FGL2 after cell transfer.