

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 32170

Title: New flexible endoscopic controlled stapler technique for the treatment of Zenker's diverticulum: a case series

Reviewer's code: 03259215

Reviewer's country: United States

Science editor: Yuan Qi

Date sent for review: 2016-12-28 16:59

Date reviewed: 2016-12-29 04:16

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This paper describes 17 patients who underwent endoscopic treatment for Zenker's diverticulum with an endoscopic stapling device. Overall it is a completely written article with a newer device used for endoscopic treatment. I will like to suggest the following. 1. Add an anatomical picture where the anatomy of the diverticulum is described. 2. It will be desirable to have the operative time needed for this procedure. 3. The technical failure rate was high in this series; (23.5 % complete failure) Is there anything which can be done to avoid it. Any role of X ray neck or barium study to evaluate the thickness of the diverticulum. 4. The major advantage seems to be stapling to avoid the bleeding; a comparison with bleeding rates with other techniques should be included. (i-e simple needle knife technique) 5. The symptoms index is reported as resolution and improved symptoms. An objective dysphagia score should be included. 6. The patients were in hospital for 2 days; any reason they required more than overnight stay in hospital? 7. Is there a cost analysis of using a stapling device to just using a needle knife?

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 32170

Title: New flexible endoscopic controlled stapler technique for the treatment of Zenker's diverticulum: a case series

Reviewer's code: 03552587

Reviewer's country: China

Science editor: Yuan Qi

Date sent for review: 2016-12-28 16:59

Date reviewed: 2016-12-29 15:29

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

There are several issues should be addressed. 1. The symptom scores using questionnaires before and after the therapy could be more detailed. 2. Coronal CT image of the diverticulum before the surgery is useful to understand the anatomy. 3. Please describe the alternatives of diverticulectomy such as laser, needle knife when the endoscopic stapling method is failed. And a control group using other methods to treat Zenker's diverticulum might be helpful to demonstrate the feasibility, safety, advantages, indications and contraindications of flexible endoscopic controlled stapler technique.

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 32170

Title: New flexible endoscopic controlled stapler technique for the treatment of Zenker's diverticulum: a case series

Reviewer's code: 03476021

Reviewer's country: Italy

Science editor: Yuan Qi

Date sent for review: 2016-12-28 16:59

Date reviewed: 2017-01-12 04:53

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The paper from Wilmsen et al presents the results of a new flexible endoscopic stapler device for the treatment of Zenker's diverticulum. 17 patients were treated with a new fully rotatable surgical stapler inserted next to an ultrathin flexible endoscope through an overtube. In 11 patients (64.7 %) the procedure was successful. The paper is interesting as presents a innovative technique. Few points should be addressed. Major revision - The rate of unsuccessful procedures is quite high and data of patients underwent unsuccessful procedure should be presented and in particular: total duration of procedure, rate of complications and length of hospital stay. - The high rate of failure also suggests that a better selection of patients might be useful, I suggest discuss this point and role of imaging in evaluation of the thickness of the diverticulum. - Please consider present in Table 1 separately the data for successful and unsuccessful procedure