

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 29590 (30694)

Title: Association between Polymorphisms of the APOBEC3G Gene and Chronic Hepatitis B Viral (HBV) Infection and HBV-related Hepatocellular Carcinoma (HCC)

Reviewer's code: 00032933

Reviewer's country: Taiwan

Science editor: Ze-Mao Gong

Date sent for review: 2016-08-23 18:43

Date reviewed: 2016-08-26 14:51

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Association between SNP of the APOBEC3G Gene with CHB and HCC was evaluated in 299 non-HBV healthy control, 287 HBV-HCC and 370 CHB Chinese Han subjects. They found that the A3G rs8177832 polymorphism is associated with a decreased risk of CHB infection and HCC, while the rs2011861 polymorphism is associated with an increased risk of HCC. Comments 1. HBV genotype and viral load were reported to be associated with CHB and HCC. Unfortunately these information was not well study in this study. 2. The Table 2 is complicated. Please use a simple table to demonstrate rs8177832 and rs2011861 polymorphism are more significant to others. 3. A multivariate analysis may be needed to support the role of rs8177832 and rs2011861 in persistent HBV infection or HCC development.

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 29590

Title: Association between Polymorphisms of the APOBEC3G Gene and Chronic Hepatitis B Viral (HBV) Infection and HBV-related Hepatocellular Carcinoma (HCC)

Reviewer's code: 00182114

Reviewer's country: Japan

Science editor: Ze-Mao Gong

Date sent for review: 2016-08-23 18:43

Date reviewed: 2016-08-30 20:27

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Apolipoprotein B mRNA editing enzyme catalytic polypeptide-like 3G (APOBEC3G) is a potent host defense factor, which interferes with HBV. Author has found that the minor alleles of APOBEC3G variants, rs8177832 (H186R) was associated with protection against HBV infection. Author conclude A3G rs8177832 is associated with a decreased risk of CHB and HCC. I ask some questions. 1. Please tell me the etiology which HBV patient go to HCC, from the point of APOBEC 3G. 2. Please comment novel therapeutic therapy by use of APOBEC3G rs8177832 for HCC with HBV.

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 29590

Title: Association between Polymorphisms of the APOBEC3G Gene and Chronic Hepatitis B Viral (HBV) Infection and HBV-related Hepatocellular Carcinoma (HCC)

Reviewer's code: 02992920

Reviewer's country: Taiwan

Science editor: Ze-Mao Gong

Date sent for review: 2016-08-23 18:43

Date reviewed: 2016-08-31 16:11

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This study examined the SNPs of A3G gene in HBV infection and HCC in a Chinese Han population. Authors indicated that A3G rs8177832 polymorphism is associated with a decreased risk of CHB infection and HCC, while the rs2011861 polymorphism is associated with an increased risk of HCC. Comments 1. Hepatitis e antigen (HBeAg) seroconversion is an important event in the natural history of HBV infection. Does the HBeAg seroconversion correlate with the A3G rs8177832 polymorphism? 2. Authors indicated the rs2011861 polymorphism is associated with an increased risk of HCC. Are the healthy individuals also associated with the rs2011861 polymorphism? 3. The sentence "The current report is the first to describe the relationship between rs8177832 and rs2011861 and the risk of HBV infection and occurrence of HCC." in page 12 (discussion section), is difficult to read. English writing should be improved by a native English speaker.