

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 32487

Title: Esophageal carcinoma originating in the surface epithelium and showing esophageal gland duct differentiation as determined by immunohistochemical analysis: A case report

Reviewer's code: 00052396

Reviewer's country: United States

Science editor: Ya-Juan Ma

Date sent for review: 2017-01-12 08:54

Date reviewed: 2017-02-21 11:25

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This manuscript by Tamura et al reports a very interesting case of esophageal carcinoma. This reviewer suggests two issues: 1. A population of esophageal stem cells may be located in the glandular neck region of the esophageal submucosal gland ducts. If cancer derives from these cells, cancer may appear with features of both the squamous epithelial cells and gland cells. The authors may discuss potential cellular origin of the carcinoma in this case, and potential strategies of identifying cellular origin. For example, next-generation sequencing may provide some help. Further characterization of differentiation markers may also help. 2. Discussion section may be shortened.

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 32487

Title: Esophageal carcinoma originating in the surface epithelium and showing esophageal gland duct differentiation as determined by immunohistochemical analysis: A case report

Reviewer's code: 03473712

Reviewer's country: United States

Science editor: Ya-Juan Ma

Date sent for review: 2017-01-12 08:54

Date reviewed: 2017-02-24 20:12

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Please note that adenocarcinoma of esophagus is no longer a rare tumor ; In some countries, it is overtaking squamous cell cancer in incidence