

## ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

**Name of journal:** World Journal of Gastroenterology

**ESPS manuscript NO:** 31423

**Title:** Sustained reduction in IBS symptoms consuming low FODMAP foods and reintroducing them.

**Reviewer's code:** 00814612

**Reviewer's country:** Australia

**Science editor:** Ze-Mao Gong

**Date sent for review:** 2016-11-18 18:55

**Date reviewed:** 2016-12-03 11:44

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

## COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This is a well thought-out and novel design in this investigative space in which important issues are addressed. First, it shows that education in the low FODMAP diet reduced FODMAP intake (using a validated FFQ), that the wait-listed controls did not, and that the reintroduction phase of the diet was associated with an increase in FODMAP intake – all important of the validity of the results. Secondly, it shows the durability of the reduced symptoms and improved QoL with more than just the exclusion ‘induction’ phase of the diet. Finally, despite technical issues, the effects on the faecal microbiota were examined at different time points and do not show the marked changes that were reported with strict low and moderate FODMAP studies where all food was supplied. There are a few minor issues. 1. The title of the paper is a bit ‘limp’. It needs rewriting to have more impact and to better reflect the findings of the study. 2. Line 61 – a diet low in fermentable short-chain carbohydrates is an incorrect statement as reducing sucrose and glucose for instance is consistent with this. The key statement about slowly absorbed or indigestible is important to include for accuracy. 3. The statement starting at line 81 is incorrect (see ref 20). 4. The time interval between



## BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC

8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA

Telephone: +1-925-223-8242

Fax: +1-925-223-8243

E-mail: [bpgoffice@wjgnet.com](mailto:bpgoffice@wjgnet.com)

<http://www.wjgnet.com>

---

faecal collection and freezing should be in the Methods section. The effects of the delay deserve discussion. 5. How was the food analysis performed from the FFQ? Was it manually entered in to what database or was it automated? 6. Line 290: Diversity is also not reduced by lowering FDFODMAP intake in ref 31. There is an error in ref 32. 7. Fig 9 is confusing. There are two horizontal lines that are not explained. 8. It should be noted that the word, 'data', is plural.

## ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

**Name of journal:** World Journal of Gastroenterology

**ESPS manuscript NO:** 31423

**Title:** Sustained reduction in IBS symptoms consuming low FODMAP foods and reintroducing them.

**Reviewer's code:** 00033010

**Reviewer's country:** Italy

**Science editor:** Ze-Mao Gong

**Date sent for review:** 2016-11-18 18:55

**Date reviewed:** 2016-12-04 17:25

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

## COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Harvie et al investigated, in a double crossover study, the effect of a low FODMAP diet on symptoms severity, quality of life and microbiota composition of IBS patients. Main comments: In the "Methods" section of the Abstract, it is important to report that a microbiome analysis was carried out. Page 9 line 156: please specify the type of regression: linear? Binomial? Authors did not discuss about possible placebo effect of FODMAP diet or nocebo effect of FODMAP reintroduction. This is a fundamental point, since such a crossover trial could not be planned as a double blind one. Low FODMAP diet is expected to be more effective in IBS-D than IBS-C, since it reduces the osmotic load, gas production and fecal fermentation (see Pedersen N et al, World J Gastroenterol 2014). However, Authors enrolled both IBS-D and IBS-C patients and a subanalysis of effectiveness according to IBS subtype is lacking. This is a major concern.

## ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

**Name of journal:** World Journal of Gastroenterology

**ESPS manuscript NO:** 31423

**Title:** Sustained reduction in IBS symptoms consuming low FODMAP foods and reintroducing them.

**Reviewer's code:** 00029592

**Reviewer's country:** Italy

**Science editor:** Ze-Mao Gong

**Date sent for review:** 2016-11-18 18:55

**Date reviewed:** 2016-12-11 01:25

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input type="checkbox"/> No	

## COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This is a really interesting paper dealing with the possible long-term effect of a low FODMAP diet on IBS patients and stressing the paramount importance of a skilled nutritionist in not only reaching positive results during this kind of diet but also in carefully reintroducing many (not all) FODMAP foods

**Introduction:** -IBS alternating is an old definition; according Rome III and IV criteria it has to be called "mixed IBS" (IBS-M) -line 50-51: Quotation of the paper "Irritable bowel syndrome: a disease still searching for pathogenesis, diagnosis...." WJG 2014 could be profitably inserted

**Methods:** -Group II was given no dietary education in the first three months: this could be a methodological bias which the authors should briefly discuss

**Discussion:** -Regarding the nutritional adequacy the oral presentation at DDW 2016 "A low FODMAP diet in irritable bowel syndrome improves symptoms without affecting body composition and extracellular body water" by Bellini M et al. could be useful. -Line 325: for the reasons we mentioned above the authors should not define group II as a real "control group".

## ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

**Name of journal:** World Journal of Gastroenterology

**ESPS manuscript NO:** 31423

**Title:** Sustained reduction in IBS symptoms consuming low FODMAP foods and reintroducing them.

**Reviewer's code:** 02441672

**Reviewer's country:** Brazil

**Science editor:** Ze-Mao Gong

**Date sent for review:** 2016-11-18 18:55

**Date reviewed:** 2016-12-14 23:00

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

## COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The study is relevant and offers relevant information regarding the association between food intolerance and IBS symptoms. However, I would like to suggest some modifications 1-methodology:group II should be nominated as a control group 2-discussion: Although the results correlate the improvement of symptoms with dietary re-education in relation to FODMAP in the study, it is necessary to emphasize that it should be emphasized that the pathophysiology of IBS is multifactorial and patients with IBS often have non-specific food intolerance and associate their symptoms with many food groups instead of a specific group.(Discrepancies between the responses to skin prick test to food and respiratory antigens in two subtypes of patients with irritable bowel syndrome World Journal of Gastroenterology. 2008 May 21; 14(19)3044);(Correlation between symptoms of the irritable bowel syndrome and the response to the food extract skin prick test.Braz J Med Biol Res. 2004 May;37(5):659-62. Epub 2004 Apr 22).