

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 32465

Title: Anti-apoptotic effect of Banhasasim-tang on the chronic acid reflux esophagitis-induced esophageal mucosal ulcer

Reviewer's code: 00504462

Reviewer's country: Mexico

Science editor: Ya-Juan Ma

Date sent for review: 2017-01-10 15:54

Date reviewed: 2017-01-13 09:38

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Dear Sir, I want to congratulate you for your research. It is worth publishing. However, there are some points that would be worth discussing further. For instance, it might be worth mentioning the pharmacological actions of the seven herbs in BHSST which are different alone or in combination. You may also want to discuss whether the bioactive molecules are metabolised before it reaches the esophageal mucosa. Finally it is worth highlighting research about the anti-inflammatory properties of this formula. There are some questions left unanswered. You have not explained whether the action of BHSST is local or systemic, direct or indirect. Furthermore, it would be good to clarify whether BHSST has any effect on GI motility, gastric acid and pepsin secretion, or on esophageal sensitivity. I understand that these are questions you may not be able to answer at this time, but it would be good for you to clarify this, or at least mention these as limitations of the study. It would also be good if you could outline or discuss future research goals derived from this manuscript. Thank you for sending it to us, and hope to hear from you soon in order to print it. Sincerely

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 32465

Title: Anti-apoptotic effect of Banhasasim-tang on the chronic acid reflux esophagitis-induced esophageal mucosal ulcer

Reviewer's code: 02438888

Reviewer's country: China

Science editor: Ya-Juan Ma

Date sent for review: 2017-01-10 15:54

Date reviewed: 2017-02-10 22:02

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> [Y] Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> [Y] Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> [] High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> [Y] Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> [] Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> [] Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> [Y] No	<input type="checkbox"/> [] Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> [Y] No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

GERD is a common GI disease which can lead to erosion or ulcer in esophagus. Continuous esophagitis may cause Barrett lesion that is considered as precancerous lesion. Therefore, treatment of GERD is of clinical importance. A herbal formula, known as BHSST, is effective in treating GERD, but the specific mechanism is not clear. The authors tried to elucidate the underlying mechanism by a rat model. Their experiments showed that BHSST could abolish the increase of NADPH oxidase subunit due to CRE exposure. BHSST could also regulate some apoptosis-related genes and exert anti-apoptotic effect. Finally, the authors concluded that BHSST can suppress esophageal ulcer via regulating ROS-dependent apoptosis. This study may provide new regimen for patients suffering from esophageal ulcer and help clinical practitioner understand the relevant mechanism. BHSST includes 13 bioactive components, so the therapeutic mechanism of BHSST must be complex. Further studies are needed to elucidate the mechanism thoroughly.

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 32465

Title: Anti-apoptotic effect of Banhasasim-tang on the chronic acid reflux esophagitis-induced esophageal mucosal ulcer

Reviewer's code: 00831621

Reviewer's country: United States

Science editor: Ya-Juan Ma

Date sent for review: 2017-01-10 15:54

Date reviewed: 2017-02-19 17:56

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

1. Has Banhasasim-tang been used to treat esophageal mucosal ulcer now? If it has, some clinical data or images of endoscopy are more convincing. 2. This research just shows us the result of BHSST, but the mechanism of it is not mentioned in the text. For example, why can the BHSST abolish NOX4 and p47phox? What is the mechanism?