

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

Manuscript NO: 32908

Title: Can a fibrotic liver afford epithelial-mesenchymal transition?

Reviewer's code: 00646291

Reviewer's country: United Kingdom

Science editor: Yuan Qi

Date sent for review: 2017-02-15

Date reviewed: 2017-02-27

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		[Y] No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		[Y] No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The authors should consider whether structuring the manuscript in different order would make it easier for the reader to go through the review. The definition of fibrosis provided in page 10 for example could be the first section of the introduction followed by the types of EMT which appear in the page 14. The role of the TGF- β (described in page 12) followed by the mesenchymal markers could be the next following these sections. Studies providing evidence for or against EMT occurrence during liver fibrogenesis performed in cells, animal models and finally cirrhotic patients could be the next sections. Minor typographical and spelling errors should be corrected: am ample (page 2) et al (page 6)

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

Manuscript NO: 32908

Title: Can a fibrotic liver afford epithelial-mesenchymal transition?

Reviewer's code: 00505473

Reviewer's country: India

Science editor: Yuan Qi

Date sent for review: 2017-02-15

Date reviewed: 2017-03-08

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

In the present review authors want to discuss whether epithelial-mesenchymal transition (EMT) occurs during liver fibrogenesis and whether the parenchymal cells like hepatocytes have any role during this process. For this purpose, authors provide some supporting and opposing observations in in-vitro, in-vivo and patients samples. Authors propose that EMT might occur during chronic liver disease and parenchymal cells might show mesenchymal properties in response to high levels of surrounding pro-EMT factors, e.g. TGF- β . Comments: 1. Several recent articles are available that addressed the issues regarding hepatic EMT and fibrosis. Hence authors should clear the novelty and the aim of this article. 2. The article should be concise and should discuss according to their objectives. 3. Type 1 EMT is not relevant in this regard, if so authors should provide explanation. 4. Authors should provide pictorial representation to explain their hypothesis. 5. Apart from TGF- β pathway, other molecular pathways like Self renewal pathways and their down-stream target genes might regulate EMT in hepatocytes. Thus, Authors should discuss mechanisms of EMT during liver fibrosis. 6.



BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC

7901 Stoneridge Drive, Suite 501, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA

Telephone: +1-925-223-8242

Fax: +1-925-223-8243

E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com

<http://www.wjgnet.com>

Authors should provide prospective therapeutic importance in this article.