



BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC

8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA

Telephone: +1-925-223-8242

Fax: +1-925-223-8243

E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com

http://www.wjgnet.com

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 30153

Title: IL23R SNPs could be either beneficial or harmful in ulcerative colitis

Reviewer's code: 00008221

Reviewer's country: Portugal

Science editor: Ze-Mao Gong

Date sent for review: 2016-09-19 08:55

Date reviewed: 2016-09-20 15:13

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Very interesting, well planned and well written paper. Congratulations



ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 30153

Title: IL23R SNPs could be either beneficial or harmful in ulcerative colitis

Reviewer's code: 00068574

Reviewer's country: France

Science editor: Ze-Mao Gong

Date sent for review: 2016-09-19 08:55

Date reviewed: 2016-09-28 17:32

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The authors studied the association between seven IL23R SNPs and clinical features of UC in Hungarian population. They found that 4 out of 7 SNPs had a significant influence on the clinical picture of UC. The study is well conducted, the results are interesting but, as the number of patients is not very high, the data should be validated in another cohort in a future study. Major concern: - page 4, summary section "results": It is reported that "patients with rs10489629 SNP had a lower risk for weight loss" while in the section "results" page 11, lines 15-16, it is also reported that carriers of this SNP have a higher risk for an extended disease. Why this last observation doesn't appear in the summary? How can the authors explain the fact that rs10489629 SNP can be both beneficial and harmful. This point should be discuss. Minor points - page 11, line 16: please correct the typo. - Discussion, page 13, lines 9-11. Except for rs 1004829 SNP, Glaset al found an association between IL23R variants reported in Table 2 and UC. Similarly, Duerr et al found an association for 2 out of 4 variants in non-Jewish UC patients. Therefore the data of the present study are not in contrast with the results of Duerr and Glas. This point can be specified in the discussion.