

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 30173

Title: Risk of alcohol use relapse after liver transplantation for alcoholic liver disease

Reviewer's code: 00504119

Reviewer's country: Brazil

Science editor: Yuan Qi

Date sent for review: 2016-09-18 09:00

Date reviewed: 2016-09-19 22:57

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		[Y] No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		[Y] No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

To investigate factors, including psychosocial factors, associated with alcoholic use relapse after liver transplantation (LT) for alcoholic liver disease (ALD) still remains a Achilles points to avoid relapse after liver transplantation procedure and comprehensive evaluation, including evaluation of psychosocial criteria, to prevent alcoholic recidivism can be necessary.

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 30173

Title: Risk of alcohol use relapse after liver transplantation for alcoholic liver disease

Reviewer's code: 00504392

Reviewer's country: Germany

Science editor: Yuan Qi

Date sent for review: 2016-09-18 09:00

Date reviewed: 2016-09-25 18:41

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

ESPS manuscript NO 30173 General The problem with alcoholic liver disease concerns not only medicine but also ethics. Alcoholism as a disease does not legitimate the alcoholic to be discriminated - otherwise the workaholic - many doctors - could also be discriminated and excluded from health services. Abstinence would be the best what can happen. For some patients it needs a dramatic intervention - such as a liver transplantation - to find the way how to be abstinent. For the treating physician this is not enough. More criteria are needed to state a prognosis since therapy is only indicated if there is prognosis. Suggestions 1. Make clear what different roles play the psychiatry and self-help groups. What comes first ? Can the one replace the other ? 2. Do not use abbreviations such as LT or ALD in table 1. This table might be useful also for many others ... Special Page 6, Paragraph 3, Line 2: What HRAR score was the cut-off ... ? Page 6, Paragraph 3, Line 7 +: What about ethanol measurements in blood, what about carbohydrate deficient transferrin (CDT) ... ? Table 2: Presence of psychiatric comorbidities ...the percentages for present and absent might need changed by mistake ... ? Table 3: what means 17.6 drink ... ? is this 17.6 beer, 17.6 glasses ... ? Is this the standard measure in the literature on alcohol dependence ? 25 sep 2016

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 30173

Title: Risk of alcohol use relapse after liver transplantation for alcoholic liver disease

Reviewer's code: 02860874

Reviewer's country: Mexico

Science editor: Yuan Qi

Date sent for review: 2016-09-18 09:00

Date reviewed: 2016-10-15 22:23

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		[Y] No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		[Y] No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This is a well article that adress an important topic about risk of relapse in alcohol intake after LT, importantly authors identified social, phycological and clinical criteria as risk factors that may be take in count in alcoholic liver disease before LT