



BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC

8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA

Telephone: +1-925-223-8242

Fax: +1-925-223-8243

E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com

http://www.wjgnet.com

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 30343

Title: Clinical and immunologic effects of faecal microbiota transplantation in a patient with collagenous colitis

Reviewer's code: 02997934

Reviewer's country: United States

Science editor: Ze-Mao Gong

Date sent for review: 2016-09-28 19:20

Date reviewed: 2016-09-29 13:55

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		[Y] No	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Overall well written and novel addition to literature. Please address: 1) Was C diff tested prior to each FMT. With the dysbiosis seen in CC there is likely increased risk of C diff infection and so it would be important to not C diff status to address if the improvement in clinical status seen was due to alteration in CC rather than treatment of intercurrent C diff. 2) please describe more about your protocol and why the intervals you used for repeat FMT were chosen.



BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC

8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA

Telephone: +1-925-223-8242

Fax: +1-925-223-8243

E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com

http://www.wjgnet.com

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 30343

Title: Clinical and immunologic effects of faecal microbiota transplantation in a patient with collagenous colitis

Reviewer's code: 00003692

Reviewer's country: Canada

Science editor: Ze-Mao Gong

Date sent for review: 2016-09-28 19:20

Date reviewed: 2016-09-29 22:08

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Interesting case report result. Authors may wish to add a statement that no medications were being used prior to onset of illness, including proton pump inhibitors, NSAIDs, olmesartan, etc. Added information/speculation on possible mechanisms would be advisable.



BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC

8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA

Telephone: +1-925-223-8242

Fax: +1-925-223-8243

E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com

http://www.wjgnet.com

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

ESPS manuscript NO: 30343

Title: Clinical and immunologic effects of faecal microbiota transplantation in a patient with collagenous colitis

Reviewer's code: 03403189

Reviewer's country: United Kingdom

Science editor: Ze-Mao Gong

Date sent for review: 2016-09-28 19:20

Date reviewed: 2016-10-09 17:26

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The manuscript from Günaltay et al. presents a case of a patient with collagenous colitis receiving faecal microbiota transplantation. The case is interesting and describes a novel application of a procedure already established in other conditions. The manuscript is written quite clearly however the authors are requested to comment on the following points: 1. "Case Report" section: diagnosis of CC is reported as "on usual clinical and histopathological classifications" and references are cited. I would suggest to specify here the typical histopathological characteristics introducing a short sentence to make it clearer to the readers. 2. "Case Report" section and "Table 1": treatment used before FMT are reported. What are dose and duration of each treatment? 3. "Case Report" section: "She had doxycycline in November 2013...for bursitis". What kind of bursitis was it? 4. "Discussion" section: although interesting and novel, this remains a single case description. The authors should discuss, within the limitations of the manuscript, that this is a case report and conclusions on the effect of FMT in this condition cannot be drawn based on a single case.