

## ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

**Name of journal:** World Journal of Gastroenterology

**ESPS manuscript NO:** 30343

**Title:** Clinical and immunologic effects of faecal microbiota transplantation in a patient with collagenous colitis

**Reviewer's code:** 02997934

**Reviewer's country:** United States

**Science editor:** Ze-Mao Gong

**Date sent for review:** 2016-09-28 19:20

**Date reviewed:** 2016-09-29 13:55

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input type="checkbox"/> No	

## COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Overall well written and novel addition to literature. Please address: 1) Was C diff tested prior to each FMT. With the dysbiosis seen in CC there is likely increased risk of C diff infection and so it would be important to not C diff status to address if the improvement in clinical status seen was due to alteration in CC rather than treatment of intercurrent C diff. 2) please describe more about your protocol and why the intervals you used for repeat FMT were chosen.

## ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

**Name of journal:** World Journal of Gastroenterology

**ESPS manuscript NO:** 30343

**Title:** Clinical and immunologic effects of faecal microbiota transplantation in a patient with collagenous colitis

**Reviewer's code:** 00003692

**Reviewer's country:** Canada

**Science editor:** Ze-Mao Gong

**Date sent for review:** 2016-09-28 19:20

**Date reviewed:** 2016-09-29 22:08

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

## COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Interesting case report result. Authors may wish to add a statement that no medications were being used prior to onset of illness, including proton pump inhibitors, NSAIDs, olmesartan, etc. Added information/speculation on possible mechanisms would be advisable.

## ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

**Name of journal:** World Journal of Gastroenterology

**ESPS manuscript NO:** 30343

**Title:** Clinical and immunologic effects of faecal microbiota transplantation in a patient with collagenous colitis

**Reviewer's code:** 03403189

**Reviewer's country:** United Kingdom

**Science editor:** Ze-Mao Gong

**Date sent for review:** 2016-09-28 19:20

**Date reviewed:** 2016-10-09 17:26

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input type="checkbox"/> No	

## COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The manuscript from Günlaltay et al. presents a case of a patient with collagenous colitis receiving faecal microbiota transplantation. The case is interesting and describes a novel application of a procedure already established in other conditions. The manuscript is written quite clearly however the authors are requested to comment on the following points: 1. "Case Report" section: diagnosis of CC is reported as "on usual clinical and histopathological classifications" and references are cited. I would suggest to specify here the typical histopathological characteristics introducing a short sentence to make it clearer to the readers. 2. "Case Report" section and "Table 1": treatment used before FMT are reported. What are dose and duration of each treatment? 3. "Case Report" section: "She had doxycycline in November 2013...for bursitis". What kind of bursitis was it? 4. "Discussion" section: although interesting and novel, this remains a single case description. The authors should discuss, within the limitations of the manuscript, that this is a case report and conclusions on the effect of FMT in this condition cannot be drawn based on a single case.