

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

Manuscript NO: 38316

Title: Transarterial embolization and low dose continuous hepatic arterial infusion chemotherapy with oxaliplatin and raltitrexed for hepatocellular carcinoma with major portal vein tumor thrombus

Reviewer's code: 03017734

Reviewer's country: Spain

Science editor: Xue-Jiao Wang

Date sent for review: 2018-02-07

Date reviewed: 2018-02-14

Review time: 7 Days

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This is an excellent study about the efficacy and safety of transarterial embolization and low dose continuous hepatic arterial infusion chemotherapy with oxaliplatin and raltitrexed in hepatocellular carcinoma with major portal vein tumor thrombus. In this study, the authors included 94 patients with major portal vein tumor thrombus accepted routine embolization. The authors found that the TACE with low dose continuous hepatic arterial infusion of oxaliplatin and raltitrexed could be a choice in MPVTT patient, it has showed its effective in patients with advanced HCC with MPVTT with less toxicity. The study is well designed and the results are interesting. I suggest to publish this manuscript after a minor revision.

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

Manuscript NO: 38316

Title: Transarterial embolization and low dose continuous hepatic arterial infusion chemotherapy with oxaliplatin and raltitrexed for hepatocellular carcinoma with major portal vein tumor thrombus

Reviewer's code: 02857301

Reviewer's country: Brazil

Science editor: Xue-Jiao Wang

Date sent for review: 2018-02-07

Date reviewed: 2018-02-22

Review time: 14 Days

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Very interesting study. No special comments.

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

Manuscript NO: 38316

Title: Transarterial embolization and low dose continuous hepatic arterial infusion chemotherapy with oxaliplatin and raltitrexed for hepatocellular carcinoma with major portal vein tumor thrombus

Reviewer's code: 00057722

Reviewer's country: China

Science editor: Xue-Jiao Wang

Date sent for review: 2018-02-11

Date reviewed: 2018-02-22

Review time: 11 Days

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The authors described the results of transarterial embolization and low dose continuous hepatic arterial infusion chemotherapy with oxaliplatin and raltitrexed for hepatocellular carcinoma with major portal vein tumor thrombus. I think the results are interesting. However, there are some issues to be addressed. 1. Spelling mistakes: "raltitrexed" in title and abstract should be "raltitrexed". 2. In the first paragraph of the introduction section, citation is lacking in the 8th line. 3. In introduction section, the author state that they have adopted continuous hepatic arterial infusion chemotherapy for the treatment of HCC and have proven its advantage (JH et al., 2017 Feb 28). However, they actually used this treatment for colorectal liver metastasis rather than HCC according to their citation (Hepatic artery infusion with raltitrexed or 5-fluorouracil for colorectal cancer

liver metastasis. World J Gastroenterol 23(8), 1406-1411.) 4. In the last two paragraphs of introduction section, the author state that they “ performed a pharmacokinetics study in a swine model and pharmacodynamics studies in different tumour cell lines ...and observed its efficacy and safety. ” However, these contents are not the purpose and results of the current study. The last paragraph did not appropriately summarize the study’s objective and approach. 5. Ethics statements for human studies are not present. 6. The title and content of attachment in Signed Informed Consent Form Document did not match for the content present study. 7. In materials and methods section, the baseline data of patients should be moved to results section. 8. Of the 94 patients with HCC, 8 patients did not receive embolization due to the existence of fistulas. The heterogeneity of treatment may cause biased results in efficacy and safety. Since the aim of the present study is to determine transarterial embolization and hepatic arterial infusion chemotherapy with oxaliplatin and raltitrexed, these 8 patient should be excluded in analyses. 9. Figures 2 to 9 are not directly related to the study objective. 10. The median follow-up time should be reported in the results. 11. In table 1, the total numbers of patients with different gender, tumor size, Child-Pugh grade are not equal to the number present in the first line of each group. 12. In figure 1, the number of patients at risk should be reported. Figure is not clearly labeled. Detail axis titles are lacking. 13. The analyses of results are not sufficient, what is the progression-free survival of these patients? 14. In the discussion section, the author described their previous finding of pharmacokinetics study in a swine model and pharmacodynamics studies in tumour cell lines, however, these results did not focus on the objectives of the present study.