



PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

Manuscript NO: 41855

Title: Clinicopathological Parameters Predicting Recurrence of pT1N0 Esophageal Squamous Cell Carcinoma

Reviewer’s code: 02941357

Reviewer’s country: Netherlands

Science editor: Xue-Jiao Wang

Date sent for review: 2018-09-02

Date reviewed: 2018-09-06

Review time: 4 Days

SCIENTIFIC QUALITY	LANGUAGE QUALITY	CONCLUSION	PEER-REVIEWER STATEMENTS
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	Peer-Review:
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	(High priority)	<input type="checkbox"/> Anonymous
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good		<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Onymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	(General priority)	Peer-reviewer’s expertise on the topic of the manuscript:
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Advanced
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Major revision	<input type="checkbox"/> General
		<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> No expertise
			Conflicts-of-Interest:
			<input type="checkbox"/> Yes
			<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Hereby I would like to comment on the article entitled: “Clinicopathological Parameters Predicting Recurrence of pT1N0 Esophageal Squamous Cell Carcinoma” by the authors Li-yan Xue et al. The authors present recurrence rate of pT1N0 tumours in a large cohort



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7901 Stoneridge Drive, Suite 501,
Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA
Telephone: +1-925-223-8242
Fax: +1-925-223-8243
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https://www.wjgnet.com

of 218 patients in a single institute. This is a large series and more insight in recurrence patterns of T1 esophageal cancers is important to customize neoadjuvant and surgical treatment. However, the retrospective nature of the study and the different surgical approaches used may be important confounding factors. For example, most “recurrences” were early and almost always in cervical and/or mediastinal lymph nodes. One could argue whether the surgical lymph node dissection was adequate in these patients. The authors need to address this issue and specify the exact surgical procedures with regard to lymph node dissection. Furthermore, it is unclear how recurrence was measured. Did the authors perform scans/ endoscopies on a regular basis or did only symptomatic cases undergo further diagnostics. Minor comments: The discussion needs to be shortened and repetition of results should be avoided.

INITIAL REVIEW OF THE MANUSCRIPT

Google Search:

- The same title
- Duplicate publication
- Plagiarism
- No

BPG Search:

- The same title
- Duplicate publication
- Plagiarism
- No



PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

Manuscript NO: 41855

Title: Clinicopathological Parameters Predicting Recurrence of pT1N0 Esophageal Squamous Cell Carcinoma

Reviewer's code: 03473712

Reviewer's country: United States

Science editor: Xue-Jiao Wang

Date sent for review: 2018-09-02

Date reviewed: 2018-09-20

Review time: 18 Days

SCIENTIFIC QUALITY	LANGUAGE QUALITY	CONCLUSION	PEER-REVIEWER STATEMENTS
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	Peer-Review:
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	(High priority)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept	<input type="checkbox"/> Onymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	(General priority)	Peer-reviewer's expertise on the topic of the manuscript:
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision	<input type="checkbox"/> Advanced
		<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> General
		<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> No expertise
			Conflicts-of-Interest:
			<input type="checkbox"/> Yes
			<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Well written study. Useful information

INITIAL REVIEW OF THE MANUSCRIPT



Baishideng Publishing Group

7901 Stoneridge Drive, Suite 501,
Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA
Telephone: +1-925-223-8242
Fax: +1-925-223-8243
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https://www.wjgnet.com

Google Search:

- The same title
- Duplicate publication
- Plagiarism
- No

BPG Search:

- The same title
- Duplicate publication
- Plagiarism
- No



PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

Manuscript NO: 41855

Title: Clinicopathological Parameters Predicting Recurrence of pT1N0 Esophageal Squamous Cell Carcinoma

Reviewer's code: 03036083

Reviewer's country: Japan

Science editor: Xue-Jiao Wang

Date sent for review: 2018-09-26

Date reviewed: 2018-09-27

Review time: 1 Day

SCIENTIFIC QUALITY	LANGUAGE QUALITY	CONCLUSION	PEER-REVIEWER STATEMENTS
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	Peer-Review:
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language	(High priority)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	polishing	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept	<input type="checkbox"/> Onymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of	(General priority)	Peer-reviewer's expertise on the
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not	language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision	topic of the manuscript:
publish	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision	<input type="checkbox"/> Advanced
		<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> General
			<input type="checkbox"/> No expertise
			Conflicts-of-Interest:
			<input type="checkbox"/> Yes
			<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Authors showed a very excellent survival for pT1N0M0 ESCC. As the authors mentioned, the recurrence rate for pT1N0M0 ESCC is higher than other gastrointestinal cancers. Detecting the metastasis as fast as possible is important to improve the



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7901 Stoneridge Drive, Suite 501,
Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA
Telephone: +1-925-223-8242
Fax: +1-925-223-8243
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https://www.wjgnet.com

prognosis. Therefore, this article is very interesting and meaningful. 1. Authors showed that cervical or upper thoracic tumor location has a high rate of cervical lymph node metastasis. You might be able to avoid it if 3-field lymphadenectomy was performed; however, the benefit of 3-field lymphadenectomy is still controversial. From your result, do you think that 3-field lymphadenectomy should be performed for cases with cervical or upper thoracic ESCC? Please discuss about it. 2. Tumor located in the cervical should be excluded, because it has poorer prognosis than thoracic esophagus.

INITIAL REVIEW OF THE MANUSCRIPT

Google Search:

- The same title
- Duplicate publication
- Plagiarism
- No

BPG Search:

- The same title
- Duplicate publication
- Plagiarism
- No