



PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

Manuscript NO: 43054

Title: Safety of HBV core antigen-positive grafts in liver transplantation: A single-center experience in China

Reviewer’s code: 02529007

Reviewer’s country: Iran

Science editor: Xue-Jiao Wang

Date sent for review: 2018-11-12

Date reviewed: 2018-11-22

Review time: 10 Days

SCIENTIFIC QUALITY	LANGUAGE QUALITY	CONCLUSION	PEER-REVIEWER STATEMENTS
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	Peer-Review:
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language	(High priority)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	<input type="checkbox"/> Onymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of	(General priority)	Peer-reviewer’s expertise on the
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not	language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision	topic of the manuscript:
publish	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Major revision	<input type="checkbox"/> Advanced
		<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> General
			<input type="checkbox"/> No expertise
			Conflicts-of-Interest:
			<input type="checkbox"/> Yes
			<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Manuscript NO: 43054 entitled, “Safety of HBV core antigen-positive grafts in liver transplantation: A single-center experience in China” is a retrospective study on 1071 successively transplanted patients in West China Hospital Liver Transplantation Center



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7901 Stoneridge Drive, Suite 501,
Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA
Telephone: +1-925-223-8242
Fax: +1-925-223-8243
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https://www.wjgnet.com

where 230 patients received HBcAb positive (HBcAb+) and 841 patients received HBcAb negative (HBcAb-) liver grafts during eleven years (from 2005 to 2016). The survival rates from, post-transplant complication rates and liver function recovery after surgery, in 1 to 5 years follow ups were similar for both groups of patients. Analyses indicated no risk factor for long-term survival in those receiving HBcAb+ liver grafts in both (HBsAg+ and HBsAg- patients. Considering the shortage of suitable liver grafts for liver transplantation, authors conclude that based on the obtained results in this study, utilization of HBcAb+ grafts is rational and feasible. Comments: There are a number of reported studies on the impact of graft survival in liver transplantation by Hepatitis B-core antibody positive donors with sometime controversial results when compared to HbcAb negatives. However, the present study might be somehow considerable due to high number of the included patients and conducting the study in a single center. Taken together the manuscript is well-organized and relatively well written, but it is unnecessarily long and boring and authors should summarize it thoroughly. In specific the discussion section, that is unnecessarily long and boring. It starts with a long background information which should be presented in summarized form in Introduction and just focus to compare the obtained results in the present study, one in each paragraph, with outcome of the previously reported studies. But there are a number of dispersed and unnecessary paragraphs that induce complexity in the aimed concepts.

INITIAL REVIEW OF THE MANUSCRIPT

Google Search:

- [] The same title
- [] Duplicate publication
- [] Plagiarism



Baishideng Publishing Group

7901 Stoneridge Drive, Suite 501,
Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA
Telephone: +1-925-223-8242
Fax: +1-925-223-8243
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https://www.wjgnet.com

[Y] No

BPG Search:

[] The same title

[] Duplicate publication

[] Plagiarism

[Y] No



PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

Manuscript NO: 43054

Title: Safety of HBV core antigen-positive grafts in liver transplantation: A single-center experience in China

Reviewer's code: 02953994

Reviewer's country: Japan

Science editor: Xue-Jiao Wang

Date sent for review: 2018-11-12

Date reviewed: 2018-11-26

Review time: 13 Days

SCIENTIFIC QUALITY	LANGUAGE QUALITY	CONCLUSION	PEER-REVIEWER STATEMENTS
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	Peer-Review:
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	(High priority)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good		<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	<input type="checkbox"/> Onymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	(General priority)	Peer-reviewer's expertise on the topic of the manuscript:
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Advanced
		<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision	<input type="checkbox"/> General
		<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> No expertise
			Conflicts-of-Interest:
			<input type="checkbox"/> Yes
			<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Very interesting study about the safety of HBV core antigen-positive grafts in liver transplantation. The number of the included patients is high. In this aspect, this study is of great significance. The manuscript need to be edited. The discussion is long, should be



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7901 Stoneridge Drive, Suite 501,
Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA
Telephone: +1-925-223-8242
Fax: +1-925-223-8243
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https://www.wjgnet.com

shortten. Some minor language revision is required.

INITIAL REVIEW OF THE MANUSCRIPT

Google Search:

- The same title
- Duplicate publication
- Plagiarism
- No

BPG Search:

- The same title
- Duplicate publication
- Plagiarism
- No



PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

Manuscript NO: 43054

Title: Safety of HBV core antigen-positive grafts in liver transplantation: A single-center experience in China

Reviewer's code: 02953931

Reviewer's country: Japan

Science editor: Xue-Jiao Wang

Date sent for review: 2018-11-12

Date reviewed: 2018-11-26

Review time: 13 Days

SCIENTIFIC QUALITY	LANGUAGE QUALITY	CONCLUSION	PEER-REVIEWER STATEMENTS
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	Peer-Review:
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language	(High priority)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	polishing	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept	<input type="checkbox"/> Onymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of	(General priority)	Peer-reviewer's expertise on the
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not	language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision	topic of the manuscript:
publish	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Advanced
		<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> General
			<input type="checkbox"/> No expertise
			Conflicts-of-Interest:
			<input type="checkbox"/> Yes
			<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Very interesting study. I have no sepcific comments.

INITIAL REVIEW OF THE MANUSCRIPT



Baishideng Publishing Group

7901 Stoneridge Drive, Suite 501,
Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA
Telephone: +1-925-223-8242
Fax: +1-925-223-8243
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https://www.wjgnet.com

Google Search:

- The same title
- Duplicate publication
- Plagiarism
- No

BPG Search:

- The same title
- Duplicate publication
- Plagiarism
- No



PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

Manuscript NO: 43054

Title: Safety of HBV core antigen-positive grafts in liver transplantation: A single-center experience in China

Reviewer's code: 02953927

Reviewer's country: Japan

Science editor: Xue-Jiao Wang

Date sent for review: 2018-11-12

Date reviewed: 2018-11-26

Review time: 13 Days

SCIENTIFIC QUALITY	LANGUAGE QUALITY	CONCLUSION	PEER-REVIEWER STATEMENTS
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	Peer-Review:
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	(High priority)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good		<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	<input type="checkbox"/> Onymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	(General priority)	Peer-reviewer's expertise on the topic of the manuscript:
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Advanced
		<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision	<input type="checkbox"/> General
		<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> No expertise
			Conflicts-of-Interest:
			<input type="checkbox"/> Yes
			<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

In this retrospective study, 1071 patients consecutively transplanted from 2005 to 2016 were enrolled. The safety of using HBV core antibody-positive donors for liver transplantation was evaluated. The outcomes of all recipients were reviewed. Newly



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7901 Stoneridge Drive, Suite 501,
Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA
Telephone: +1-925-223-8242
Fax: +1-925-223-8243
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https://www.wjgnet.com

diagnosed HBV infection had a relatively higher incidence in HBsAg- patients with HBcAb+ liver grafts, in which HBV naïve recipients suffered most, though this difference did not affect patient and graft survival. The patients number of this study is big, and the methods are logical. The results are informative and well discussed. However, the discussion seems long. The authors can shorten it and make it more focus on the subject of the study.

INITIAL REVIEW OF THE MANUSCRIPT

Google Search:

- The same title
- Duplicate publication
- Plagiarism
- No

BPG Search:

- The same title
- Duplicate publication
- Plagiarism
- No