

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

Manuscript NO: 45055

Title: MicroRNA-596 acts as a tumor suppressor in gastric cancer and is upregulated by promotor demethylation

Reviewer's code: 02534438

Reviewer's country: Croatia

Science editor: Ruo-Yu Ma

Date sent for review: 2018-12-11

Date reviewed: 2018-12-15

Review time: 1 Hour, 4 Days

SCIENTIFIC QUALITY	LANGUAGE QUALITY	CONCLUSION	PEER-REVIEWER STATEMENTS
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	Peer-Review:
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language	(High priority)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	<input type="checkbox"/> Onymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of	(General priority)	Peer-reviewer's expertise on the
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not	language polishing	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision	topic of the manuscript:
publish	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision	<input type="checkbox"/> Advanced
		<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> General
			<input type="checkbox"/> No expertise
			Conflicts-of-Interest:
			<input type="checkbox"/> Yes
			<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Dear Sir, I read with pleasure the manuscript titled "MicroRNA-596 acts as a tumor suppressor in gastric cancer and is upregulated by promotor demethylation". I only have few remarks: 1. Statistical analyses should be appropriate, i.e. non-parametric



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7901 Stoneridge Drive, Suite 501,
Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA
Telephone: +1-925-223-8242
Fax: +1-925-223-8243
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https://www.wjgnet.com

paired tests should be used for the analysis of results from initial 9 patients (a "repeated measures" t-test) 2. Paired tests (either Student's or ANOVA) should also be used to compare tumor and non-tumor characteristics in the remaining 55 patients. 3. "Paracancerous tissue" (Figure 1) should be explained. Is that normal mucosal tissue ? How far away from the tumor were these specimens taken ? 4. Did authors consider using healthy mucosa from patients without malignancy as a control group ?

INITIAL REVIEW OF THE MANUSCRIPT

Google Search:

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism
- ☐ No

BPG Search:

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism
- ☐ No

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

Manuscript NO: 45055

Title: MicroRNA-596 acts as a tumor suppressor in gastric cancer and is upregulated by promotor demethylation

Reviewer's code: 00531670

Reviewer's country: Turkey

Science editor: Ruo-Yu Ma

Date sent for review: 2018-12-11

Date reviewed: 2018-12-19

Review time: 7 Hours, 8 Days

SCIENTIFIC QUALITY	LANGUAGE QUALITY	CONCLUSION	PEER-REVIEWER STATEMENTS
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	Peer-Review:
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language	(High priority)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	<input type="checkbox"/> Onymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of	(General priority)	Peer-reviewer's expertise on the
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not	language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision	topic of the manuscript:
publish	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Major revision	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Advanced
		<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> General
			<input type="checkbox"/> No expertise
			Conflicts-of-Interest:
			<input type="checkbox"/> Yes
			<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The manuscript investigates the role of miR-596 in gastric cancers. It reports that miR-596 expression is lower in gastric cancer cell lines and human tumor samples. miR-596 is found to inhibit proliferation, migration and invasion in tumor cells and its

promoter region is frequently methylated in the tumors. The study is well designed and presented and the experimental approach is fine. The data may have some merit for publication but some points need to be addressed. -In the present submission it appears that the authors may have overestimated their data in suggesting that the findings are generally valid for gastric cancer. -PRDX1 as the target should be investigated in the remaining cell lines to substantiate the data indicating it is the principal target in gastric carcinogenesis. -Transfection and 5-Aza-dC treatment analyses have been performed using only two cell lines and methylation analysis was performed using the MGC-803 cell line. -Different targets (BCL2L1, MEK1, Smurf1) have been suggested for miR-596 in different studies. What were the other possible targets resulting from bioinformatics database search? Any concordance with the previous reports? The authors should elaborate on this. -Only MGC-803 cells display promoter methylation (Fig. 5a) while others do not, although expression of miR-596 is lower than controls in all cancer cell lines. To suggest that miR-596 is regulated epigenetically in gastric cancer the mechanism should be valid for all cell lines. Please deliberate on this issue. Analysis of all cell lines should clarify this. -How do the authors explain upregulation of PRDX1 mRNA and downregulation of the protein following 5-Aza treatment? -The significances reported for differentiation and Borrmann type are only borderline.

INITIAL REVIEW OF THE MANUSCRIPT

Google Search:

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism
- ☐ No



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7901 Stoneridge Drive, Suite 501,
Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA

Telephone: +1-925-223-8242

Fax: +1-925-223-8243

E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com

<https://www.wjgnet.com>

BPG Search:

[] The same title

[] Duplicate publication

[] Plagiarism

[Y] No