Baishideng Publishing Group

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite 160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA
Telephone: +1-925-223-8242
Fax: +1-925-223-8243
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https://www.wjgnet.com

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

Manuscript NO: 45665

Title: LncRNA HULC promotes exosome secretion from hepatocellular carcinoma cells by sponging miR‐372-3p , which targets Rab11a

Reviewer's code: 00053888

Reviewer's country: United Kingdom

Science editor: Jia-Ping Yan

Reviewer accepted review: 2019-04-30 14:49

Reviewer performed review: 2019-04-30 15:15

Review time: 1 Hour

SCIENTIFIC QUALITY	LANGUAGE QUALITY	CONCLUSION	PEER-REVIEWER STATEMENTS
[Y] Grade A: Excellent	[ ] Grade A: Priority publishing	[ ] Accept (High priority)	Peer-Review:
[ ] Grade B: Very good	[Y] Grade B: Minor language polishing	[Y] Accept (General priority)	[Y] Anonymous
[ ] Grade C: Good	[ ] Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	[ ] Minor revision	[ ] Onymous
[ ] Grade D: Fair	[ ] Grade D: Rejection	[ ] Major revision	Peer-reviewer's expertise on the topic of the manuscript:
[ ] Grade E: Do not publish		[ ] Rejection	[Y] Advanced
			[ ] General
			[ ] No expertise
			Conflicts-of-Interest:
			[ ] Yes
			[Y] No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This is a detailed, complex and well written manuscript that studies the mechanism by which long chain non-coding RNA regulate gene expression in hepatocellular cancer. This is a novel area of research and one of these long chain RNAs is HULC which

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite 160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA
Telephone: +1-925-223-8242
Fax: +1-925-223-8243
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https://www.wjgnet.com

appears to have a role in HCC progression and metastases. The manuscript investigates how up regulation of HULC might influence these actions in HCC. The study is well carried out, detailed and well written. The subject matter is complex and tricky to understand but the manuscript is broken down into bite size pieces. My only criticism is that it is a bit too long with too many figures and could be paired down to make comprehension & reading a little easier. The English is good and the manuscript deserves publication.

INITIAL REVIEW OF THE MANUSCRIPT

Google Search:

[ ] The same title

[ ] Duplicate publication

[ ] Plagiarism

[Y] No

BPG Search:

[ ] The same title

[ ] Duplicate publication

[ ] Plagiarism

[Y] No

Baishideng Publishing Group

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite 160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA
Telephone: +1-925-223-8242
Fax: +1-925-223-8243
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https://www.wjgnet.com

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

Manuscript NO: 45665

Title: LncRNA HULC promotes exosome secretion from hepatocellular carcinoma cells by sponging miR‐372-3p , which targets Rab11a

Reviewer's code: 03648086

Reviewer's country: United States

Science editor: Jia-Ping Yan

Reviewer accepted review: 2019-04-26 13:42

Reviewer performed review: 2019-04-30 18:01

Review time: 4 Days and 4 Hours

SCIENTIFIC QUALITY	LANGUAGE QUALITY	CONCLUSION	PEER-REVIEWER STATEMENTS
[ ] Grade A: Excellent [ ] Grade B: Very good [Y] Grade C: Good [ ] Grade D: Fair [ ] Grade E: Do not publish	[Y] Grade A: Priority publishing [ ] Grade B: Minor language polishing [ ] Grade C: A great deal of language polishing [ ] Grade D: Rejection	[ ] Accept (High priority) [ ] Accept (General priority) [Y] Minor revision [ ] Major revision [ ] Rejection	Peer-Review: [Y] Anonymous [ ] Onymous Peer-reviewer's expertise on the topic of the manuscript: [Y] Advanced [ ] General [ ] No expertise Conflicts-of-Interest: [ ] Yes [Y] No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The authors present a study in which every experiment went through what a standard study would supposedly have completed, from basic measurements of a lncRNA "HULC" in exosomes, in vitro transfection assays, to dual-Luciferase reporter assays.

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite 160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA
Telephone: +1-925-223-8242
Fax: +1-925-223-8243
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https://www.wjgnet.com

The results from this study are new in hepatocellular carcinoma but lack of substantial progression and genuine novelty for the field of cancer-exosome-non-coding RNA associations. Major points 1. It's well known that the storage conditions can affect the physical and functional properties of exosomes [PMID: 25536933; Lőrincz, et al. J Extracell Vesicles. 2014 Dec 22;3:25465]. Usually the exosome isolation should be completed within 7-28 days to ensure the quality of exosomes. This study collected the samples from serum and liver tissues over a time period of 8 months. It would be good to know how the authors processed these samples when isolating the exosomes. Were these samples processed altogether after all samples collected in the end of patient enrollment, or was processed one by one at each time of a patient enrolled? If it's the latter, how did authors deal with the batch effect? In addition, the authors should show the shape and size for exosomes isolated at early, middle, and late time of sample collection period to validate the integrity of exosomes analyzed throughout the study. 2. The authors started from measuring the levels of HULC in serum and liver tissues, and then focused experiments on miR-372-3p and Rablla. This seemed reasonable by following the literature to find study focuses. Since "Rab11a" was the result from the target prediction analysis, it would be good to show how the authors locked "Rab11a" in the focus. A table showing the prediction scores with a kind of ranking method could fulfil this. Minor points 1. On the Title, authors should change ", which targets" to "that targets". 2. In the "Core tips", the "HULC/miR – 372-3p/Rab11a axis" should be HULC/miR-372-3p/Rab11a axis (remove the space around hyphen sign – and change hyphen to dash). 3. In paragraph of "Transfection" in the Methods section, "miRNA-373-3p" should be "miR-372-3p" (change 373 to 372, miRNA to miR). 4. In Figure 2C, move the "r=0.633,P<0.05" underneath the plots. 5. In Figure 1, the images A and B can be separated with more space and this will allow a better alignment between the images and the labels. The labels C-F can be aligned better with corresponding

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite 160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA
Telephone: +1-925-223-8242
Fax: +1-925-223-8243
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https://www.wjgnet.com

images as well. 6. The font size is too small to be legible in all Figures, and it's even smaller in Figures 3-5. A common standard is that the minimal font size should be above 2 mm. If it's in some difficulties to make the font larger, the authors should re-consider by arranging some charts/plots into supplementary. 7. In addition, the height of Figures 4-5 might exceed the limit of common journal formats, usually it's 247 mm. 8. In Figure 4A, the markers on the lines are not distinguishable between the two groups. It would be better that the authors change the markers to the solid-empty dot pair from the round-triangle pair. 9. Tables 1 and 2 can be combined to show the results efficiently. The sole difference between the two tables is the statistics values and there are plenty of space left blank in the table.

INITIAL REVIEW OF THE MANUSCRIPT

Google Search:

[ ] The same title

[ ] Duplicate publication

[ ] Plagiarism

[Y] No

BPG Search:

[ ] The same title

[ ] Duplicate publication

[ ] Plagiarism

[Y] No

Baishideng Publishing Group

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite 160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA
Telephone: +1-925-223-8242
Fax: +1-925-223-8243
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https://www.wjgnet.com

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

Manuscript NO: 45665

Title: LncRNA HULC promotes exosome secretion from hepatocellular carcinoma cells by sponging miR‐372-3p , which targets Rab11a

Reviewer's code: 03537407

Reviewer's country: Germany

Science editor: Jia-Ping Yan

Reviewer accepted review: 2019-04-26 05:56

Reviewer performed review: 2019-05-01 10:19

Review time: 5 Days and 4 Hours

SCIENTIFIC QUALITY	LANGUAGE QUALITY	CONCLUSION	PEER-REVIEWER STATEMENTS
[ ] Grade A: Excellent [Y] Grade B: Very good [ ] Grade C: Good [ ] Grade D: Fair [ ] Grade E: Do not publish	[Y] Grade A: Priority publishing [ ] Grade B: Minor language polishing [ ] Grade C: A great deal of language polishing [ ] Grade D: Rejection	[ ] Accept (High priority) [Y] Accept (General priority) [ ] Minor revision [ ] Major revision [ ] Rejection	Peer-Review: [Y] Anonymous [ ] Onymous Peer-reviewer's expertise on the topic of the manuscript: [ ] Advanced [Y] General [ ] No expertise Conflicts-of-Interest: [ ] Yes [Y] No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The authors investigate the role on the lncRNA HULC in a translational Setting of hepatocellular carcinoma. They Show that HULC promotes exosome secretion and that the mir-372-ep Targets Rab11a and thus interferes with cell Proliferation and survival.

Baishideng Publishing Group

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite 160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA
Telephone: +1-925-223-8242
Fax: +1-925-223-8243
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https://www.wjgnet.com

The study is well designed, results are clearly presented. The study also adressed a current Topic and is therefore of high interest and relevance. Minor comments: Please explain "ceRNA" in the introduction part. Please avoid the term "gender" (in Tab 1/2) when you refer to biologic sex. What was the etiology of the investigated HCC cases? Are there differences between e.g. HBV, HCV or NASH triggered HCC? Did patients also have fibrosis/cirrhosis? Please add this Information to the tables.

INITIAL REVIEW OF THE MANUSCRIPT

Google Search:

[ ] The same title

[ ] Duplicate publication

[ ] Plagiarism

[Y] No

BPG Search:

[ ] The same title

[ ] Duplicate publication

[ ] Plagiarism

[Y] No

Baishideng Publishing Group

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite 160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA
Telephone: +1-925-223-8242
Fax: +1-925-223-8243
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https://www.wjgnet.com

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

Manuscript NO: 45665

Title: LncRNA HULC promotes exosome secretion from hepatocellular carcinoma cells by sponging miR‐372-3p , which targets Rab11a

Reviewer's code: 03476433

Reviewer's country: Colombia

Science editor: Jia-Ping Yan

Reviewer accepted review: 2019-04-29 11:23

Reviewer performed review: 2019-05-06 21:09

Review time: 7 Days and 9 Hours

SCIENTIFIC QUALITY	LANGUAGE QUALITY	CONCLUSION	PEER-REVIEWER STATEMENTS
[ ] Grade A: Excellent [ ] Grade B: Very good [Y] Grade C: Good [ ] Grade D: Fair [ ] Grade E: Do not publish	[ ] Grade A: Priority publishing [Y] Grade B: Minor language polishing [ ] Grade C: A great deal of language polishing [ ] Grade D: Rejection	[ ] Accept (High priority) [ ] Accept (General priority) [ ] Minor revision [ ] Major revision [Y] Rejection	Peer-Review: [Y] Anonymous [ ] Onymous Peer-reviewer's expertise on the topic of the manuscript: [ ] Advanced [Y] General [ ] No expertise Conflicts-of-Interest: [ ] Yes [Y] No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

First of all I want to congratilate the authos for their research My annotations: This is a nice paper with a very nice proposal to increase the armamentarium of biological markers of HCC, not only for diagnosis but for staging and prognosis also I think there

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite 160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA
Telephone: +1-925-223-8242
Fax: +1-925-223-8243
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https://www.wjgnet.com

is need more clinical data with their use, to reinforce the importance of including HULC in the protocols for HCC study in the pretreatment scenario I don´t think also that this paper is the kind of articles for World Journal Of Gastroenterology.

INITIAL REVIEW OF THE MANUSCRIPT

Google Search:

[ ] The same title

[ ] Duplicate publication

[ ] Plagiarism

[Y] No

BPG Search:

[ ] The same title

[ ] Duplicate publication

[ ] Plagiarism

[Y] No