

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

Manuscript NO: 41578

Title: Short-term efficacy of robotic and laparoscopic surgery for Huang's three-step maneuver for spleen-preserving splenic hilar lymphadenectomy for advanced upper gastric cancer: Results from a propensity score-matched study

Reviewer's code: 03478635

Reviewer's country: Japan

Science editor: Ruo-Yu Ma

Reviewer accepted review: 2019-05-24 08:09

Reviewer performed review: 2019-05-27 01:01

Review time: 2 Days and 16 Hours

SCIENTIFIC QUALITY	LANGUAGE QUALITY	CONCLUSION	PEER-REVIEWER STATEMENTS
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	Peer-Review:
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language	(High priority)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	<input type="checkbox"/> Onymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of	(General priority)	Peer-reviewer's expertise on the
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not	language polishing	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision	topic of the manuscript:
publish	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision	<input type="checkbox"/> Advanced
		<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> General
			<input type="checkbox"/> No expertise
			Conflicts-of-Interest:
			<input type="checkbox"/> Yes
			<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This article describes about the short-term efficacy of robotic and laparoscopic surgery for Huang's Three-step Maneuver Spleen-preserving Splenic Hilar lymphadenectomy



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA
Telephone: +1-925-223-8242
Fax: +1-925-223-8243
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
<https://www.wjgnet.com>

for advanced upper gastric cancer. Some revision may be needed in introduction and the text, since some part of the manuscript is not shown appropriately. Table 4 may be revised to clearly show the difference between the first step and the second step.

INITIAL REVIEW OF THE MANUSCRIPT

Google Search:

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism
- ☐ No

BPG Search:

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism
- ☐ No

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

Manuscript NO: 41578

Title: Short-term efficacy of robotic and laparoscopic surgery for Huang's three-step maneuver for spleen-preserving splenic hilar lymphadenectomy for advanced upper gastric cancer: Results from a propensity score-matched study

Reviewer's code: 02573214

Reviewer's country: Italy

Science editor: Ruo-Yu Ma

Reviewer accepted review: 2019-05-24 05:57

Reviewer performed review: 2019-05-29 06:30

Review time: 5 Days

SCIENTIFIC QUALITY	LANGUAGE QUALITY	CONCLUSION	PEER-REVIEWER STATEMENTS
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	Peer-Review:
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language	(High priority)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	polishing	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept	<input type="checkbox"/> Onymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of	(General priority)	Peer-reviewer's expertise on the
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not	language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision	topic of the manuscript:
publish	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Advanced
		<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> General
			<input type="checkbox"/> No expertise
			Conflicts-of-Interest:
			<input type="checkbox"/> Yes
			<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

In this manuscript the authors reported the the short-term efficacy of robotic spleen-preserving splenic hilar lymphadenectomy (RSPSHL) vs laparoscopic



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA
Telephone: +1-925-223-8242
Fax: +1-925-223-8243
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
<https://www.wjgnet.com>

spleen-preserving splenic hilar lymphadenectomy (LPSHL) for advanced gastric cancer (GC). The results reported underline that there are no important differences between the two methods and that robotic surgery has a significantly higher cost. The initial results are interesting and indicate that, at the present time, laparoscopic surgery is the one of choice (results almost comparable at lower cost).

INITIAL REVIEW OF THE MANUSCRIPT

Google Search:

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism
- ☒ No

BPG Search:

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism
- ☒ No