

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

Manuscript NO: 51035

Title: Complete or partial split in associating liver partition and portal vein ligation for staged hepatectomy (ALPPS): A systematic review and meta-analysis

Reviewer's code: 02855194

Position: Peer Reviewer

Academic degree: FRCP (Hon), MD, MRCP

Professional title: Full Professor, Honorary Research Felllow, Professor, Research Scientist

Reviewer's country: United States

Author's country: China

Reviewer chosen by: Artificial Intelligence Technique

Reviewer accepted review: 2019-08-24 00:37

Reviewer performed review: 2019-08-26 00:11

Review time: 1 Day and 23 Hours

SCIENTIFIC QUALITY	LANGUAGE QUALITY	CONCLUSION	PEER-REVIEWER STATEMENTS
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	Peer-Review:
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language	(High priority)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	<input type="checkbox"/> Onymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of	(General priority)	Peer-reviewer's expertise on the
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not	language polishing	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision	topic of the manuscript:
publish	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Advanced
		<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> General
			<input type="checkbox"/> No expertise
			Conflicts-of-Interest:
			<input type="checkbox"/> Yes
			<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This is an interesting system review of on associating liver partition and portal vein ligation for staged hepatectomy (ALPPS). Recent evidence has demonstrated that a partial split of the liver parenchyma in ALPPS is associated with the same amount of FLR hypertrophy as a complete split but with the benefit of lower postoperative morbidity and mortality rates. However, some evidence has also indicated that ALPPS with a p-ALPPS does not have a comparable FLR hypertrophy rate and is associated with the same morbidity and mortality rates as in ALPPS. In this study, the studies comparing the outcomes of p-ALPPS with ALPPS for a small FLR in consecutive patients were included. A subgroup analysis to evaluate patients with and without liver cirrhosis was performed. Overall, this study is very well designed. The title reflects the main subject, and the methods were described in detail. The results are very interesting. I have some minor comments to the authors: 1. Some very minor language publishing should be corrected. 2. The results are interesting, however, if the authors can add some subtitles, the results will be more clear to the readers. 3. The discussion is excellent, and the limitations are listed. Are there any plan to perform a further related study? I am looking forward to read it. 4. The references are updated. I suggest to discuss one more reference: Ernesto Sparrelid and Thomas M. van Gulik. Tumor progression in two-stage liver resections—is the shorter inter-stage period in associated liver partition and portal vein ligation for staged hepatectomy (ALPPS) of benefit to the patient? *Hepatobiliary Surg Nutr.* 2019 Jun; 8(3): 316–317. doi: 10.21037/hbsn.2019.01.18 PMID: 31245425.

INITIAL REVIEW OF THE MANUSCRIPT

Google Search:

[] The same title



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA
Telephone: +1-925-223-8242
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
<https://www.wjgnet.com>

☐ Duplicate publication

☐ Plagiarism

☒ No

BPG Search:

☐ The same title

☐ Duplicate publication

☐ Plagiarism

☒ No

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

Manuscript NO: 51035

Title: Complete or partial split in associating liver partition and portal vein ligation for staged hepatectomy (ALPPS): A systematic review and meta-analysis

Reviewer's code: 02858230

Position: Peer Reviewer

Academic degree: N/A, MD, RCPA

Professional title: N/A, Doctor, Professor, Research Scientist

Reviewer's country: Netherlands

Author's country: China

Reviewer chosen by: Artificial Intelligence Technique

Reviewer accepted review: 2019-08-24 00:38

Reviewer performed review: 2019-08-28 01:15

Review time: 4 Days

SCIENTIFIC QUALITY	LANGUAGE QUALITY	CONCLUSION	PEER-REVIEWER STATEMENTS
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	Peer-Review:
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language	(High priority)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	<input type="checkbox"/> Onymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of	(General priority)	Peer-reviewer's expertise on the
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not	language polishing	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision	topic of the manuscript:
publish	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Advanced
		<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> General
			<input type="checkbox"/> No expertise
			Conflicts-of-Interest:
			<input type="checkbox"/> Yes
			<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA
Telephone: +1-925-223-8242
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https://www.wjgnet.com

This is an excellent system review and meta-analysis for associating liver partition and portal vein ligation for staged hepatectomy. This study is well designed and the manuscript is well written. The results are discussed well, and the references are updated. Only some minor language polishing should be corrected. Congratulations!

INITIAL REVIEW OF THE MANUSCRIPT

Google Search:

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism
- ☒ No

BPG Search:

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism
- ☒ No

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

Manuscript NO: 51035

Title: Complete or partial split in associating liver partition and portal vein ligation for staged hepatectomy (ALPPS): A systematic review and meta-analysis

Reviewer's code: 02857620

Position: Peer Reviewer

Academic degree: MD

Professional title: Full Professor, Professor

Reviewer's country: Australia

Author's country: China

Reviewer chosen by: Artificial Intelligence Technique

Reviewer accepted review: 2019-08-24 00:38

Reviewer performed review: 2019-08-28 01:20

Review time: 4 Days

SCIENTIFIC QUALITY	LANGUAGE QUALITY	CONCLUSION	PEER-REVIEWER STATEMENTS
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept	Peer-Review:
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language	(High priority)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	<input type="checkbox"/> Onymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of	(General priority)	Peer-reviewer's expertise on the
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not	language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision	topic of the manuscript:
publish	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Advanced
		<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> General
			<input type="checkbox"/> No expertise
			Conflicts-of-Interest:
			<input type="checkbox"/> Yes
			<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The morbidity and mortality rates can reflect the safety of this surgical strategy, and the FLR hypertrophy rate can reflect the effectiveness. Recent evidence has demonstrated that a partial split of the liver parenchyma in ALPPS is associated with the same amount of FLR hypertrophy as a complete split but with the benefit of lower postoperative morbidity and mortality rates. But, some evidence has indicated that ALPPS with a partial split does not have a comparable FLR hypertrophy rate and is associated with the same morbidity and mortality rates as in ALPPS. In this system review, the authors reviewed the split completeness and its impact on the FLR hypertrophy, morbidity, and mortality rates in patients with a small FLR. This study is designed well. The methods are described in detail, and the results are very interesting. I have no further comments.

INITIAL REVIEW OF THE MANUSCRIPT

Google Search:

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism
- ☐ [Y] No

BPG Search:

- ☐ The same title
- ☐ Duplicate publication
- ☐ Plagiarism
- ☐ [Y] No