



**PEER-REVIEW REPORT**

**Name of journal:** World Journal of Gastroenterology

**Manuscript NO:** 50861

**Title:** Severe liver injury due to herbal and dietary supplements and the role of liver transplantation

**Reviewer's code:** 00722050

**Position:** Editorial Board

**Academic degree:** FRCP (C), MD, PhD

**Professional title:** Professor

**Reviewer's country:** Canada

**Author's country:** United States

**Reviewer chosen by:** Jia-Ping Yan

**Reviewer accepted review:** 2019-08-20 12:07

**Reviewer performed review:** 2019-08-20 12:33

**Review time:** 1 Hour

SCIENTIFIC QUALITY	LANGUAGE QUALITY	CONCLUSION	PEER-REVIEWER STATEMENTS
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	Peer-Review:
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language	(High priority)	<input type="checkbox"/> Anonymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	<input type="checkbox"/> Onymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of	(General priority)	Peer-reviewer's expertise on the
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not	language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision	topic of the manuscript:
publish	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision	<input type="checkbox"/> Advanced
		<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> General
			<input type="checkbox"/> No expertise
			Conflicts-of-Interest:
			<input type="checkbox"/> Yes
			<input type="checkbox"/> No

**SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS**



**Baishideng  
Publishing  
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite  
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA  
**Telephone:** +1-925-223-8242  
**E-mail:** bpgoffice@wjgnet.com  
**https://**www.wjgnet.com

The manuscript is quite well written and is a very important topic because more and more people choose alternative ways to healthcare pharmaceutical choices. However, the Oxyelite Pro has not been completely perused. More information on the sequelae for the law are necessary. The SLIMQUICK product needs more details about the composition of the product. Finally, the French experience (France data on DILI) is missing and all three data need to be implemented to the best of my knowledge. In 2019, it is not possible to write-up such a review and missing data from the Presse Medical. There is plenty of translating services. Merci!

#### **INITIAL REVIEW OF THE MANUSCRIPT**

##### ***Google Search:***

- The same title
- Duplicate publication
- Plagiarism
- No

##### ***BPG Search:***

- The same title
- Duplicate publication
- Plagiarism
- No



**PEER-REVIEW REPORT**

**Name of journal:** World Journal of Gastroenterology

**Manuscript NO:** 50861

**Title:** Severe liver injury due to herbal and dietary supplements and the role of liver transplantation

**Reviewer's code:** 00001114

**Position:** Editor-in-Chief

**Academic degree:** MD, PhD

**Professional title:** Chief Doctor

**Reviewer's country:** Japan

**Author's country:** United States

**Reviewer chosen by:** Jia-Ping Yan

**Reviewer accepted review:** 2019-08-20 10:20

**Reviewer performed review:** 2019-08-24 04:42

**Review time:** 3 Days and 18 Hours

SCIENTIFIC QUALITY	LANGUAGE QUALITY	CONCLUSION	PEER-REVIEWER STATEMENTS
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	Peer-Review:
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language	(High priority)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	polishing	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept	<input type="checkbox"/> Onymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of	(General priority)	Peer-reviewer's expertise on the
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not	language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision	topic of the manuscript:
publish	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision	<input type="checkbox"/> Advanced
		<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> General
			<input type="checkbox"/> No expertise
			Conflicts-of-Interest:
			<input type="checkbox"/> Yes
			<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No

**SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS**



**Baishideng  
Publishing  
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite  
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA  
**Telephone:** +1-925-223-8242  
**E-mail:** bpgoffice@wjgnet.com  
**https://**www.wjgnet.com

Comments to the Author: Thank you for allowing me to review the manuscript: "Severe Liver Injury Due to Herbal and Dietary Supplements and the Role of Liver Transplantation". I enjoyed this review. This review is well written and comprehensive about this topic. Thank you. I have one suggestion. #1 I think more tables or figures can help readers to easily understand this review. I would recommend providing a table containing characteristics of DILI from HDS in each country. Minor In the introduction, "complimentary" mistype? →complementary

#### **INITIAL REVIEW OF THE MANUSCRIPT**

##### ***Google Search:***

- The same title
- Duplicate publication
- Plagiarism
- No

##### ***BPG Search:***

- The same title
- Duplicate publication
- Plagiarism
- No



**PEER-REVIEW REPORT**

**Name of journal:** World Journal of Gastroenterology

**Manuscript NO:** 50861

**Title:** Severe liver injury due to herbal and dietary supplements and the role of liver transplantation

**Reviewer's code:** 00053419

**Position:** Editorial Board

**Academic degree:** PhD

**Professional title:** Professor

**Reviewer's country:** Spain

**Author's country:** United States

**Reviewer chosen by:** Jia-Ping Yan

**Reviewer accepted review:** 2019-08-22 09:50

**Reviewer performed review:** 2019-08-27 09:54

**Review time:** 5 Days

SCIENTIFIC QUALITY	LANGUAGE QUALITY	CONCLUSION	PEER-REVIEWER STATEMENTS
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	Peer-Review:
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	(High priority)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good		<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	<input type="checkbox"/> Onymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	(General priority)	Peer-reviewer's expertise on the topic of the manuscript:
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision	<input type="checkbox"/> Advanced
		<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> General
		<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> No expertise
			Conflicts-of-Interest:
			<input type="checkbox"/> Yes
			<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No

**SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS**



**Baishideng  
Publishing  
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite  
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA  
**Telephone:** +1-925-223-8242  
**E-mail:** bpgoffice@wjgnet.com  
**https://**www.wjgnet.com

The article discusses on an interesting topic as is the liver complications associated to HDS use. There are no much systematic analyses providing statistically reliable data, but the compilation of the information available with a critical discussion is relevant and highlights the potential risks of an increasing consumption of HDS without any strict regulation as in the case of therapeutic drugs. I would recommend to include incidence figures from the different studies in table 1 and also a new table with the products for which any adverse effects have been documented, indicating the type of complication.

#### **INITIAL REVIEW OF THE MANUSCRIPT**

##### ***Google Search:***

- The same title
- Duplicate publication
- Plagiarism
- No

##### ***BPG Search:***

- The same title
- Duplicate publication
- Plagiarism
- No



**PEER-REVIEW REPORT**

**Name of journal:** World Journal of Gastroenterology

**Manuscript NO:** 50861

**Title:** Severe liver injury due to herbal and dietary supplements and the role of liver transplantation

**Reviewer's code:** 03195661

**Position:** Peer Reviewer

**Academic degree:** MD, PhD

**Professional title:** Professor, Research Scientist

**Reviewer's country:** China

**Author's country:** United States

**Reviewer chosen by:** Jia-Ping Yan

**Reviewer accepted review:** 2019-08-20 06:25

**Reviewer performed review:** 2019-08-29 04:49

**Review time:** 8 Days and 22 Hours

SCIENTIFIC QUALITY	LANGUAGE QUALITY	CONCLUSION	PEER-REVIEWER STATEMENTS
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	Peer-Review:
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language	(High priority)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	<input type="checkbox"/> Onymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of	(General priority)	Peer-reviewer's expertise on the
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not	language polishing	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision	topic of the manuscript:
publish	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision	<input type="checkbox"/> Advanced
		<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> General
			<input type="checkbox"/> No expertise
			Conflicts-of-Interest:
			<input type="checkbox"/> Yes
			<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No

**SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS**



**Baishideng  
Publishing  
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite  
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA  
**Telephone:** +1-925-223-8242  
**E-mail:** bpgoffice@wjgnet.com  
**https://**www.wjgnet.com

Drugs and dietary supplements induced liver injury has increasingly become a major clinical problem worldwide. This work by Priya Grewal et al reviewed the geographic variability of herbal and dietary supplements (HDS) -related DILI in major areas in the world. This review is instructive which includes issues in interpretation and comparison of global data, liver transplantation (LT) in this population, and emphasizes the need for physicians to be aware of the possibility of HDS use in patients with unexplained acute liver injury. This review was well organized and written. The authors are suggested to discuss the situation in patients with underlying liver disease, such as NAFLD and chronic viral infection, since that these patients are more sensitive to HDS-related DILI, particularly in China and other far east regions.

#### **INITIAL REVIEW OF THE MANUSCRIPT**

##### ***Google Search:***

- The same title
- Duplicate publication
- Plagiarism
- No

##### ***BPG Search:***

- The same title
- Duplicate publication
- Plagiarism
- No



**PEER-REVIEW REPORT**

**Name of journal:** World Journal of Gastroenterology

**Manuscript NO:** 50861

**Title:** Severe liver injury due to herbal and dietary supplements and the role of liver transplantation

**Reviewer's code:** 01557283

**Position:** Editorial Board

**Academic degree:** MD, PhD

**Professional title:** Associate Professor, Surgeon

**Reviewer's country:** Japan

**Author's country:** United States

**Reviewer chosen by:** Jia-Ping Yan

**Reviewer accepted review:** 2019-08-22 00:51

**Reviewer performed review:** 2019-08-30 06:13

**Review time:** 8 Days and 5 Hours

SCIENTIFIC QUALITY	LANGUAGE QUALITY	CONCLUSION	PEER-REVIEWER STATEMENTS
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	Peer-Review:
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language	(High priority)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept	<input type="checkbox"/> Onymous
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of	(General priority)	Peer-reviewer's expertise on the
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not	language polishing	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision	topic of the manuscript:
publish	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision	<input type="checkbox"/> Advanced
		<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> General
			<input type="checkbox"/> No expertise
			Conflicts-of-Interest:
			<input type="checkbox"/> Yes
			<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No

**SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS**



**Baishideng  
Publishing  
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite  
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA  
**Telephone:** +1-925-223-8242  
**E-mail:** bpgoffice@wjgnet.com  
**https://**www.wjgnet.com

The review of severe liver injury (LI) due to herbal and dietary supplements (HDS) & the role of liver transplantation is timely and interesting. The description of LI caused by HDS in the respective countries is also interesting, but some analyses may be needed to review the LI due to HDS. The UP-TO-DATE well documents about LI due to HDS, but does not precisely about liver transplantation for the LI due to HDS.

#### **INITIAL REVIEW OF THE MANUSCRIPT**

##### ***Google Search:***

- The same title
- Duplicate publication
- Plagiarism
- No

##### ***BPG Search:***

- The same title
- Duplicate publication
- Plagiarism
- No