



PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

Manuscript NO: 55392

Title: Expert consensus on management of metabolic disease in Chinese liver transplant recipients

Reviewer's code: 00057659

Position: Editorial Board

Academic degree: FACS, MD, PhD

Professional title: Chief Doctor, Professor

Reviewer's Country/Territory: Germany

Author's Country/Territory: China

Manuscript submission date: 2020-03-15

Reviewer chosen by: Jin-Zhou Tang (Quit in 2020)

Reviewer accepted review: 2020-03-20 10:50

Reviewer performed review: 2020-03-20 10:53

Review time: 1 Hour

Scientific quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish
Language quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection
Conclusion	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept (High priority) <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept (General priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
Re-review	<input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No
Peer-reviewer statements	Peer-Review: <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous <input type="checkbox"/> Onymous Conflicts-of-Interest: <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA
Telephone: +1-925-399-1568
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https://www.wjgnet.com

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This is a well-written, good structured recommendation for post-liver transplantation metabolic disease, The recommendations are good for clinical use.



PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

Manuscript NO: 55392

Title: Expert consensus on management of metabolic disease in Chinese liver transplant recipients

Reviewer's code: 03293832

Position: Peer Reviewer

Academic degree: MD, PhD

Professional title: Senior Research Fellow

Reviewer's Country/Territory: Japan

Author's Country/Territory: China

Manuscript submission date: 2020-03-15

Reviewer chosen by: AI Technique

Reviewer accepted review: 2020-03-16 00:21

Reviewer performed review: 2020-03-23 05:37

Review time: 7 Days and 5 Hours

Scientific quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish
Language quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection
Conclusion	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept (High priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Accept (General priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Rejection
Re-review	<input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No
Peer-reviewer statements	Peer-Review: <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous <input type="checkbox"/> Onymous Conflicts-of-Interest: <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA
Telephone: +1-925-399-1568
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https://www.wjgnet.com

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The manuscript aims to introduce the new version of consensus for the management of liver transplant patients with metabolic disease in China. The contents are all borrowings and rehash of literatures including figures and tables with no originalities. The contents are directed to Chinese domestic transplant doctors. In addition, the manuscript is prepared most carelessly; Abstract is not a summary of the contents but only history of Chinese consensus. Data in Introduction are cited without indicating references and world and domestic data are mixed. Thus, it is inappropriate to publish this sort of things in international scientific journal such as World Journal of Gastroenterology.



PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

Manuscript NO: 55392

Title: Expert consensus on management of metabolic disease in Chinese liver transplant recipients

Reviewer's code: 00053958

Position: Peer Reviewer

Academic degree: BSc, FRCP (Hon), MBChB, MRCP

Professional title: Associate Professor

Reviewer's Country/Territory: United States

Author's Country/Territory: China

Manuscript submission date: 2020-03-15

Reviewer chosen by: Jin-Zhou Tang (Quit in 2020)

Reviewer accepted review: 2020-03-20 17:42

Reviewer performed review: 2020-03-27 22:53

Review time: 7 Days and 5 Hours

Scientific quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish
Language quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection
Conclusion	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept (High priority) <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept (General priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
Re-review	<input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No
Peer-reviewer statements	Peer-Review: <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous <input type="checkbox"/> Onymous Conflicts-of-Interest: <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA
Telephone: +1-925-399-1568
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https://www.wjgnet.com

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Good summary paper with specific recommendations for the Chinese audience. Can the authors explain the COMMIT group? My only minor comment is that recommendation IV for diabetes- to test for gene polymorphisms in donors and recipients- appears to lack a significant practical benefit. Minor grammatical changes needed.