

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

Manuscript NO: 62304

Title: Radiotherapy as an immune checkpoint blockade combination strategy for hepatocellular carcinoma

Reviewer's code: 03505676

Position: Editorial Board

Academic degree: MD, PhD

Professional title: Associate Professor

Reviewer's Country/Territory: China

Author's Country/Territory: South Korea

Manuscript submission date: 2021-01-05

Reviewer chosen by: AI Technique

Reviewer accepted review: 2021-01-08 00:28

Reviewer performed review: 2021-01-08 00:58

Review time: 1 Hour

Scientific quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish
Language quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection
Conclusion	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept (High priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Accept (General priority) <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
Re-review	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No
Peer-reviewer statements	Peer-Review: <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous <input type="checkbox"/> Onymous Conflicts-of-Interest: <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA
Telephone: +1-925-399-1568
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
<https://www.wjgnet.com>

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Recent evidence suggests radiotherapy may modulate a patient's immune system, particularly when delivered in high doses over few fractions with conformal techniques; moreover, stimulation of the immune system by irradiation can convert "nonresponder" to "responder". In clinical practice, the synergistic effect of radiotherapy-immunotherapy has been demonstrated in some cancers such as head and neck cancer. In the review, the authors summarized immune modulation caused by radiation and the current trials of RT-ICI combination treatment as well as future perspectives. This is a good review, which providing an issue to be discussed for novel therapeutic strategies of HCC. If possible, some precise molecular mechanisms of RT activating specific immune cells in HCC should be supplemented; meanwhile, some grammar errors should be corrected, for example, "The different types of radiation-induced immune modulation by different fractionation scheme of radiation is summarized in figure 1." The " is" should be changed to "are".

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

Manuscript NO: 62304

Title: Radiotherapy as an immune checkpoint blockade combination strategy for hepatocellular carcinoma

Reviewer's code: 02734287

Position: Editorial Board

Academic degree: MD, PhD

Professional title: Surgeon

Reviewer's Country/Territory: Croatia

Author's Country/Territory: South Korea

Manuscript submission date: 2021-01-05

Reviewer chosen by: Jin-Lei Wang

Reviewer accepted review: 2021-01-07 13:59

Reviewer performed review: 2021-01-10 16:15

Review time: 3 Days and 2 Hours

Scientific quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish
Language quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection
Conclusion	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept (High priority) <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept (General priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
Re-review	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No
Peer-reviewer statements	Peer-Review: <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous <input type="checkbox"/> Onymous Conflicts-of-Interest: <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

A highly valuable review of exciting new approaches to hepatocellular carcinoma that incorporate radiotherapy and immune checkpoint inhibitors. Useful to all professionals dealing with HCC.

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

Manuscript NO: 62304

Title: Radiotherapy as an immune checkpoint blockade combination strategy for hepatocellular carcinoma

Reviewer's code: 04213406

Position: Editorial Board

Academic degree: MD, MSc

Professional title: Associate Professor

Reviewer's Country/Territory: Egypt

Author's Country/Territory: South Korea

Manuscript submission date: 2021-01-05

Reviewer chosen by: Jin-Lei Wang

Reviewer accepted review: 2021-01-12 04:05

Reviewer performed review: 2021-01-12 05:20

Review time: 1 Hour

Scientific quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish
Language quality	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection
Conclusion	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept (High priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Accept (General priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
Re-review	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No
Peer-reviewer statements	Peer-Review: <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous <input type="checkbox"/> Onymous Conflicts-of-Interest: <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA
Telephone: +1-925-399-1568
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https://www.wjgnet.com

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Thanks for your interesting article, however I have some comments. The reinvigoration of T-cells should be clarified by short paragraph or graph. I recommend to add explanatory graphs demonstrating immune check point inhibitor(ICI) mechanism alone and the combination of ICI and radiotherapy. There are some spelling mistakes.

RE-REVIEW REPORT OF REVISED MANUSCRIPT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

Manuscript NO: 62304

Title: Radiotherapy as an immune checkpoint blockade combination strategy for hepatocellular carcinoma

Reviewer's code: 02734287

Position: Editorial Board

Academic degree: MD, PhD

Professional title: Surgeon

Reviewer's Country/Territory: Croatia

Author's Country/Territory: South Korea

Manuscript submission date: 2021-01-05

Reviewer chosen by: Jia-Ru Fan

Reviewer accepted review: 2021-01-31 07:57

Reviewer performed review: 2021-01-31 08:06

Review time: 1 Hour

Scientific quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish
Language quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection
Conclusion	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept (High priority) <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept (General priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
Peer-reviewer statements	Peer-Review: <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous <input type="checkbox"/> Onymous Conflicts-of-Interest: <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Thank you for the revised paper. I believe that the added figure and explanations will add to the quality of the manuscript. I think that the paper should be published after the spelling and grammar are double checked.

RE-REVIEW REPORT OF REVISED MANUSCRIPT

Name of journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology

Manuscript NO: 62304

Title: Radiotherapy as an immune checkpoint blockade combination strategy for hepatocellular carcinoma

Reviewer's code: 04213406

Position: Editorial Board

Academic degree: MD, MSc

Professional title: Associate Professor

Reviewer's Country/Territory: Egypt

Author's Country/Territory: South Korea

Manuscript submission date: 2021-01-05

Reviewer chosen by: Jia-Ru Fan

Reviewer accepted review: 2021-01-31 07:59

Reviewer performed review: 2021-01-31 13:26

Review time: 5 Hours

Scientific quality	[<input checked="" type="radio"/>] Grade A: Excellent [<input type="radio"/>] Grade B: Very good [<input type="radio"/>] Grade C: Good [<input type="radio"/>] Grade D: Fair [<input type="radio"/>] Grade E: Do not publish
Language quality	[<input checked="" type="radio"/>] Grade A: Priority publishing [<input type="radio"/>] Grade B: Minor language polishing [<input type="radio"/>] Grade C: A great deal of language polishing [<input type="radio"/>] Grade D: Rejection
Conclusion	[<input checked="" type="radio"/>] Accept (High priority) [<input type="radio"/>] Accept (General priority) [<input type="radio"/>] Minor revision [<input type="radio"/>] Major revision [<input type="radio"/>] Rejection
Peer-reviewer statements	Peer-Review: [<input checked="" type="radio"/>] Anonymous [<input type="radio"/>] Onymous Conflicts-of-Interest: [<input type="radio"/>] Yes [<input checked="" type="radio"/>] No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA
Telephone: +1-925-399-1568
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https:// www.wjgnet.com

Thanks for adding simple clarifying paragraph and graph about reinvigoration of T-cells.