

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: *World Journal of Gastroenterology*

Manuscript NO: 77938

Title: Efficacy of cytapheresis in patients with ulcerative colitis showing insufficient or lost response to biologic therapy

Provenance and peer review: Invited Manuscript; Externally peer reviewed

Peer-review model: Single blind

Reviewer's code: 05665395

Position: Peer Reviewer

Academic degree: MD

Professional title: Director, Professor

Reviewer's Country/Territory: China

Author's Country/Territory: Japan

Manuscript submission date: 2022-05-30

Reviewer chosen by: AI Technique

Reviewer accepted review: 2022-05-30 13:08

Reviewer performed review: 2022-05-31 05:39

Review time: 16 Hours

Scientific quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish
Language quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection
Conclusion	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept (High priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Accept (General priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Rejection
Re-review	<input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA
Telephone: +1-925-399-1568
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
<https://www.wjgnet.com>

**Peer-reviewer
statements**

Peer-Review: [☒] Anonymous [☐] Onymous

Conflicts-of-Interest: [☐] Yes [☒] No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Even if the topic is interest, it is not clear which is the purpose of the review and which is the novelty that provides

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: *World Journal of Gastroenterology*

Manuscript NO: 77938

Title: Efficacy of cytapheresis in patients with ulcerative colitis showing insufficient or lost response to biologic therapy

Provenance and peer review: Invited Manuscript; Externally peer reviewed

Peer-review model: Single blind

Reviewer's code: 05076265

Position: Editorial Board

Academic degree: PhD

Professional title: Associate Professor

Reviewer's Country/Territory: China

Author's Country/Territory: Japan

Manuscript submission date: 2022-05-30

Reviewer chosen by: AI Technique

Reviewer accepted review: 2022-05-30 14:46

Reviewer performed review: 2022-06-07 12:14

Review time: 7 Days and 21 Hours

Scientific quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish
Language quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection
Conclusion	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept (High priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Accept (General priority) <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
Re-review	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA
Telephone: +1-925-399-1568
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
<https://www.wjgnet.com>

**Peer-reviewer
statements**

Peer-Review: [☒] Anonymous [☐] Onymous

Conflicts-of-Interest: [☐] Yes [☒] No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The authors systematically summarize the current literature on the use of CAP for UC patients showing insufficient response or LOR to biologics. Their results suggest that CAP has potential for UC refractory to biologics. However, the quality of this manuscript needs further improvement. 1. The English writing needs to be improved. 2. The current review should briefly describe the literature search strategy and study selection procedures. 3. Throughout this review, event rates of each of the included studies were summarised to derive a range of corresponding rates, but the heterogeneity within studies was ignored, and the presence of heterogeneity makes this simple combination of rates potentially unscientific.

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: *World Journal of Gastroenterology*

Manuscript NO: 77938

Title: Efficacy of cytapheresis in patients with ulcerative colitis showing insufficient or lost response to biologic therapy

Provenance and peer review: Invited Manuscript; Externally peer reviewed

Peer-review model: Single blind

Reviewer's code: 05426950

Position: Peer Reviewer

Academic degree: MBBS

Professional title: Assistant Professor

Reviewer's Country/Territory: Jordan

Author's Country/Territory: Japan

Manuscript submission date: 2022-05-30

Reviewer chosen by: AI Technique

Reviewer accepted review: 2022-05-30 15:26

Reviewer performed review: 2022-06-07 17:47

Review time: 8 Days and 2 Hours

Scientific quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish
Language quality	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection
Conclusion	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept (High priority) <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept (General priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
Re-review	<input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA
Telephone: +1-925-399-1568
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
<https://www.wjgnet.com>

**Peer-reviewer
statements**

Peer-Review: [☒] Anonymous [☐] Onymous

Conflicts-of-Interest: [☐] Yes [☒] No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Well-written and referenced, however, it wasn't mentioned how the literature search was done and the timeline of studies that were included in the review.

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: *World Journal of Gastroenterology*

Manuscript NO: 77938

Title: Efficacy of cytapheresis in patients with ulcerative colitis showing insufficient or lost response to biologic therapy

Provenance and peer review: Invited Manuscript; Externally peer reviewed

Peer-review model: Single blind

Reviewer's code: 04091933

Position: Editorial Board

Academic degree: MD, PhD

Professional title: Associate Professor, Senior Researcher

Reviewer's Country/Territory: Russia

Author's Country/Territory: Japan

Manuscript submission date: 2022-05-30

Reviewer chosen by: AI Technique

Reviewer accepted review: 2022-06-01 09:43

Reviewer performed review: 2022-06-12 15:12

Review time: 11 Days and 5 Hours

Scientific quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish
Language quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection
Conclusion	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept (High priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Accept (General priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Major revision <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
Re-review	<input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No

**Peer-reviewer
statements**

Peer-Review: [☒] Anonymous [☐] Onymous

Conflicts-of-Interest: [☐] Yes [☒] No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The topic of the manuscript is very relevant. The authors reviewed current studies using CAP in patients with UC showing poor response or secondary loss of response (LOR) to biologics and concluded that combination therapy with CAP could be an alternative therapeutic strategy for biologic-refractory ulcerative colitis. Despite a generally well-prepared manuscript, the statistical analysis of data from several heterogeneous studies cannot be qualified as acceptable. First of all, we can note the incorrect calculation of the average remission rates. In the submitted form, the manuscript cannot be published. It is recommended to use a more correct statistical analysis or meta-analysis. The manuscript can be recommended for publication only after revision.