

## PEER-REVIEW REPORT

**Name of journal:** *World Journal of Gastroenterology*

**Manuscript NO:** 80647

**Title:** Integrity of the editing and publishing process is the basis for improving an academic journal's Impact Factor

**Provenance and peer review:** Unsolicited manuscript; Externally peer reviewed

**Peer-review model:** Single blind

**Reviewer's code:** 05115000

**Position:** Peer Reviewer

**Academic degree:** PhD

**Professional title:** Senior Lecturer

**Reviewer's Country/Territory:** Nigeria

**Author's Country/Territory:** United States

**Manuscript submission date:** 2022-10-08

**Reviewer chosen by:** Dong-Mei Wang

**Reviewer accepted review:** 2022-10-10 10:19

**Reviewer performed review:** 2022-10-10 10:30

**Review time:** 1 Hour

Scientific quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish
Language quality	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection
Conclusion	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept (High priority) <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept (General priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
Re-review	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No



**Baishideng  
Publishing  
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite  
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA  
**Telephone:** +1-925-399-1568  
**E-mail:** bpgoffice@wjgnet.com  
**https://**www.wjgnet.com

<b>Peer-reviewer statements</b>	Peer-Review: [ <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> ] Anonymous [ <input type="checkbox"/> ] Onymous Conflicts-of-Interest: [ <input type="checkbox"/> ] Yes [ <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> ] No
-------------------------------------	---

### **SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS**

This paper is wonderfully written and I am happy to given the opportunity to assess the quality of the paper.

## PEER-REVIEW REPORT

**Name of journal:** *World Journal of Gastroenterology*

**Manuscript NO:** 80647

**Title:** Integrity of the editing and publishing process is the basis for improving an academic journal's Impact Factor

**Provenance and peer review:** Unsolicited manuscript; Externally peer reviewed

**Peer-review model:** Single blind

**Reviewer's code:** 01551432

**Position:** Editorial Board

**Academic degree:** MD, PhD

**Professional title:** Doctor

**Reviewer's Country/Territory:** Japan

**Author's Country/Territory:** United States

**Manuscript submission date:** 2022-10-08

**Reviewer chosen by:** Dong-Mei Wang

**Reviewer accepted review:** 2022-10-11 04:05

**Reviewer performed review:** 2022-10-13 10:58

**Review time:** 2 Days and 6 Hours

Scientific quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish
Language quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection
Conclusion	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept (High priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Accept (General priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Major revision <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
Re-review	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No



**Baishideng  
Publishing  
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite  
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA  
**Telephone:** +1-925-399-1568  
**E-mail:** bpgoffice@wjgnet.com  
**https://**www.wjgnet.com

<b>Peer-reviewer statements</b>	Peer-Review: <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous <input type="checkbox"/> Onymous Conflicts-of-Interest: <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No
-------------------------------------	---

## **SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS**

Dear Authors, Thank you for your submitting your manuscript entitled, "Integrity in the editing and publishing process is the basis for improving an academic journal's Impact Factor" in WJG. The manuscript is well written and very nice. The topic is very interesting and timely. However, several criticisms should be addressed as the followings. 1) First of all, I would like to express my congratulations, gratitude and respect for the wonderful development of World Journal of Gastroenterology(WJG). Among other medical journals with a high impact factor, confirm whether there has been a journal in the past that has published self-analyzed and self-evaluated content like your submitted article, and confirm whether it is appropriate to publish this content. Please reconsider it. 2) Overall, I think the manuscript is too long. I think it would be better to describe the WJG as it is, and to summarize the remaining six journals in a concise manner and shorten them. 3) The peer review and editing system of Baishideng's journals has been fully completed, and it is wonderful that the review and editing process is clear, open and not closed worldwide. This system enables faster peer review and editing of higher quality, and has greatly contributed to the development of Baishideng's Publishers, which is worthy of admiration. 4) page 8, Table 2: Regarding the ranking of journal names cited by manuscripts that have been published in WJG: I myself am very interested in this content, but it seems to me that it simply shows the number of citations and the percentage of them in real numbers. What does this table mean? Are there any other analytical or statistical methods other than using real numbers? If so, what is its validity? Can it be compared with journals other than Baishideng's journals? It would be more interesting to know the number of cited



**Baishideng  
Publishing  
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite  
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA  
**Telephone:** +1-925-399-1568  
**E-mail:** [bpgoffice@wjgnet.com](mailto:bpgoffice@wjgnet.com)  
<https://www.wjgnet.com>

manuscripts by publisher and their percentage. For example, is it possible to consider whether there are differences in the journals that authors prefer to cite depending on their country of origin? 5) page 9, Table 3: What does this table essentially mean? It seems to me that it makes little or no sense. This is because the record count of each journal is very small, so I feel that the chance factor or other bias is large and there is little meaning in ranking. If posted, please add a full discussion of its implications in the Discussion section. 6) page 16 and 17, Figure 3 and 4: Why are there so many manuscripts submitted or published from these countries? Feel free to comment on why in the Discussion section and add more if you would like to do. 7) page 17, Table 4: To put it bluntly, it's a number-only notation and difficult to be understood for readers in WJG. I think it would be easier to understand if the real numbers (if possible, with percentages) for 2019, 2020, and 2021 from the left for each country were displayed side by side in a bar graph. 8) page 60, line 1 and page 64, line 2: It states that 5.2% of the submitted manuscripts in Baishideng's seven SCIE-indexed journal are not reviewed by external reviewers, but my impression is that there are many manuscripts that are not reviewed by external reviewers. It seems that the ratio of is too small, is this true? If my understanding is wrong, please explain a little more clearly. 9) page 61, line 3 and page 69, line 1: Who did the English editing for the remaining 38.6% of the papers?

## PEER-REVIEW REPORT

**Name of journal:** *World Journal of Gastroenterology*

**Manuscript NO:** 80647

**Title:** Integrity of the editing and publishing process is the basis for improving an academic journal's Impact Factor

**Provenance and peer review:** Unsolicited manuscript; Externally peer reviewed

**Peer-review model:** Single blind

**Reviewer's code:** 02537773

**Position:** Editorial Board

**Academic degree:** MD, PhD

**Professional title:** Academic Research, Associate Professor, Doctor, Lecturer, Professor

**Reviewer's Country/Territory:** Germany

**Author's Country/Territory:** United States

**Manuscript submission date:** 2022-10-08

**Reviewer chosen by:** Dong-Mei Wang

**Reviewer accepted review:** 2022-10-11 12:11

**Reviewer performed review:** 2022-10-13 15:17

**Review time:** 2 Days and 3 Hours

Scientific quality	<input checked="" type="radio"/> Grade A: Excellent <input type="radio"/> Grade B: Very good <input type="radio"/> Grade C: Good <input type="radio"/> Grade D: Fair <input type="radio"/> Grade E: Do not publish
Language quality	<input checked="" type="radio"/> Grade A: Priority publishing <input type="radio"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing <input type="radio"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing <input type="radio"/> Grade D: Rejection
Conclusion	<input checked="" type="radio"/> Accept (High priority) <input type="radio"/> Accept (General priority) <input type="radio"/> Minor revision <input type="radio"/> Major revision <input type="radio"/> Rejection
Re-review	<input type="radio"/> Yes <input checked="" type="radio"/> No

<b>Peer-reviewer statements</b>	Peer-Review: <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous <input type="checkbox"/> Onymous Conflicts-of-Interest: <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No
-------------------------------------	---

## SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The paper deals with an important issues related to the integrity and publishing process. The editorial team provide an overview on the current standing of the Journals published by Baishideng Publishing Groups with an impact factors. As an author and review, I believe that those points are helpful to keep the track on the quality of the journals as well as to contribute to high scientific standards and further strategic developments. The authors provide a valuable assessment of various steps during the publishing process that will lead to further improvement of already high standards of the Journals. The work provides furthermore the insights related to very transparent review process. The table with rank and record count of the journals with Impact factor >10 for example 3 makes primary focus on the Impact factor. An alternative way of presenting the data could be also the focus on the number of citations in top journals for instance: Hepatology, GUT and Gastroenterology and the top journals that cite WJG. If the authors indeed would like to focus on IF - the current view is perfect, however, if the authors would rather focus on the top citing journals with IF over 10, that the sorting according to citation number may be the preferred option. The number in Figures (for example Figure 12) are quite small in relation to the size of the figure. Here the size (of the number and letters) and bold format may be adapted to improve visibility. One point related the reviewer process may be included/considered. The publisher uses IDs that can be referred to particular reviewers. However, matching the IDs with the names published along the work, the data can be used to identify the reviewers making actually the reviewer process "fully" open - therefore the authors can track the reviewers following publication. To my view therefore it is rather a semi-blinded peer review



**Baishideng  
Publishing  
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite  
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA  
**Telephone:** +1-925-399-1568  
**E-mail:** [bpgoffice@wjgnet.com](mailto:bpgoffice@wjgnet.com)  
**https://**[www.wjgnet.com](http://www.wjgnet.com)

process and not a fully single-blind peer review process (4.2 Manuscript peer review and first decision).



## PEER-REVIEW REPORT

**Name of journal:** *World Journal of Gastroenterology*

**Manuscript NO:** 80647

**Title:** Integrity of the editing and publishing process is the basis for improving an academic journal's Impact Factor

**Provenance and peer review:** Unsolicited manuscript; Externally peer reviewed

**Peer-review model:** Single blind

**Reviewer's code:** 05392001

**Position:** Peer Reviewer

**Academic degree:** PhD

**Professional title:** Associate Professor

**Reviewer's Country/Territory:** China

**Author's Country/Territory:** United States

**Manuscript submission date:** 2022-10-08

**Reviewer chosen by:** Dong-Mei Wang

**Reviewer accepted review:** 2022-10-08 04:46

**Reviewer performed review:** 2022-10-19 07:43

**Review time:** 11 Days and 2 Hours

<b>Scientific quality</b>	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish
<b>Language quality</b>	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection
<b>Conclusion</b>	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept (High priority) <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept (General priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<b>Re-review</b>	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No



**Baishideng  
Publishing  
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite  
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA  
**Telephone:** +1-925-399-1568  
**E-mail:** bpgoffice@wjgnet.com  
<https://www.wjgnet.com>

<b>Peer-reviewer statements</b>	Peer-Review: [ <b>Y</b> ] Anonymous [ ] Onymous Conflicts-of-Interest: [ ] Yes [ <b>Y</b> ] No
-------------------------------------	---

### **SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS**

Wang et al. summarized the integrity in the editing and publishing process is the basis for improving an academic journal's Impact Factor. They found that establishing, promoting and actively practicing processes that safeguard and bolster the integrity of the editing and publication process also help to improve the academic influence of academic journals, which itself is the cornerstone for improving JIF. This review is well organized and written.

## RE-REVIEW REPORT OF REVISED MANUSCRIPT

**Name of journal:** *World Journal of Gastroenterology*

**Manuscript NO:** 80647

**Title:** Integrity of the editing and publishing process is the basis for improving an academic journal's Impact Factor

**Provenance and peer review:** Unsolicited manuscript; Externally peer reviewed

**Peer-review model:** Single blind

**Reviewer's code:** 01551432

**Position:** Editorial Board

**Academic degree:** MD, PhD

**Professional title:** Doctor

**Reviewer's Country/Territory:** Japan

**Author's Country/Territory:** United States

**Manuscript submission date:** 2022-10-08

**Reviewer chosen by:** Jing-Jie Wang

**Reviewer accepted review:** 2022-10-28 03:31

**Reviewer performed review:** 2022-10-28 05:08

**Review time:** 1 Hour

<b>Scientific quality</b>	[ <input checked="" type="radio"/> ] Grade A: Excellent [ <input type="radio"/> ] Grade B: Very good [ <input type="radio"/> ] Grade C: Good [ <input type="radio"/> ] Grade D: Fair [ <input type="radio"/> ] Grade E: Do not publish
<b>Language quality</b>	[ <input checked="" type="radio"/> ] Grade A: Priority publishing [ <input type="radio"/> ] Grade B: Minor language polishing [ <input type="radio"/> ] Grade C: A great deal of language polishing [ <input type="radio"/> ] Grade D: Rejection
<b>Conclusion</b>	[ <input checked="" type="radio"/> ] Accept (High priority) [ <input type="radio"/> ] Accept (General priority) [ <input type="radio"/> ] Minor revision [ <input type="radio"/> ] Major revision [ <input type="radio"/> ] Rejection
<b>Peer-reviewer</b>	Peer-Review: [ <input checked="" type="radio"/> ] Anonymous [ <input type="radio"/> ] Onymous



**Baishideng  
Publishing  
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite  
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA  
**Telephone:** +1-925-399-1568  
**E-mail:** bpgoffice@wjgnet.com  
<https://www.wjgnet.com>

statements

Conflicts-of-Interest: [ ] Yes [Y] No

#### **SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS**

Dear Authors, Thank you for your submission of the revised version of the manuscript.  
The manuscript has been properly revised accordingly. I think it is OK as it stands.  
Sincerely yours