## PEER-REVIEW REPORT

**Name of journal:** *World Journal of Gastroenterology*

**Manuscript NO:** 80000

**Title:** Immunotherapy for recurrent hepatocellular carcinoma

**Provenance and peer review**: Invited Manuscript; Externally peer reviewed

**Peer-review model:** Single blind

**Reviewer's code:** 05915662

**Position:** Peer Reviewer

**Academic degree:** MD

**Professional title:** Chief Doctor

**Reviewer's Country/Territory:** China

**Author's Country/Territory:** United States

**Manuscript submission date:** 2022-09-15

**Reviewer chosen by:** AI Technique

**Reviewer accepted review:** 2022-11-10 14:37

**Reviewer performed review:** 2022-11-10 14:46

**Review time:** 1 Hour

| Scientific quality | [  ] Grade A: Excellent    [  ] Grade B: Very good    [ Y] Grade C: Good [  ] Grade D: Fair    [  ] Grade E: Do not publish |
|---|---|
| **Language quality** | [ Y] Grade A: Priority publishing    [  ] Grade B: Minor language polishing [  ] Grade C: A great deal of language polishing    [  ] Grade D: Rejection |
| **Conclusion** | [  ] Accept (High priority)    [  ] Accept (General priority) [  ] Minor revision    [  ] Major revision    [ Y] Rejection |
| **Re-review** | [  ] Yes    [ Y] No |
| **Peer-reviewer** | Peer-Review: [ Y] Anonymous    [  ] Onymous |

| statements | Conflicts-of-Interest: [   ] Yes   [ Y] No |
|---|---|

## SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The idea of this article is not novel enough, and it is not deep enough specific

# PEER-REVIEW REPORT

**Name of journal:** *World Journal of Gastroenterology*

**Manuscript NO:** 80000

**Title:** Immunotherapy for recurrent hepatocellular carcinoma

**Provenance and peer review**: Invited Manuscript; Externally peer reviewed

**Peer-review model:** Single blind

**Reviewer's code:** 00503182

**Position:** Editorial Board

**Academic degree:** MBChB, MD, PhD

**Professional title:** Full Professor, Professor, Statistician

**Reviewer's Country/Territory:** Egypt

**Author's Country/Territory:** United States

**Manuscript submission date:** 2022-09-15

**Reviewer chosen by:** Dong-Mei Wang

**Reviewer accepted review:** 2022-12-03 11:29

**Reviewer performed review:** 2022-12-03 11:35

**Review time:** 1 Hour

| | |
|---|---|
| **Scientific quality** | [  ] Grade A: Excellent  [ Y] Grade B: Very good  [  ] Grade C: Good<br>[  ] Grade D: Fair  [  ] Grade E: Do not publish |
| **Language quality** | [  ] Grade A: Priority publishing  [ Y] Grade B: Minor language polishing<br>[  ] Grade C: A great deal of language polishing  [  ] Grade D: Rejection |
| **Conclusion** | [  ] Accept (High priority)  [ Y] Accept (General priority)<br>[  ] Minor revision  [  ] Major revision  [  ] Rejection |
| **Re-review** | [ Y] Yes  [  ] No |
| **Peer-reviewer** | Peer-Review: [ Y] Anonymous  [  ] Onymous |

| statements | Conflicts-of-Interest: [   ] Yes   [ Y] No |
|---|---|

## SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Well designed Review for the topic

| Scientific quality | [ ] Grade A: Excellent  [ Y] Grade B: Very good  [ ] Grade C: Good<br>[ ] Grade D: Fair  [ ] Grade E: Do not publish |
|---|---|
| Language quality | [ Y] Grade A: Priority publishing  [ ] Grade B: Minor language polishing<br>[ ] Grade C: A great deal of language polishing  [ ] Grade D: Rejection |
| Conclusion | [ ] Accept (High priority)  [ ] Accept (General priority)<br>[ Y] Minor revision  [ ] Major revision  [ ] Rejection |
| Re-review | [ ] Yes  [ Y] No |
| Peer-reviewer | Peer-Review: [ Y] Anonymous  [ ] Onymous |

| statements | Conflicts-of-Interest: [ ] Yes [ Y] No |
|---|---|

## SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Please exclude parst of the article about cancer vaccine, immunotherapy in early stage HCC and promising trials including tables. These subjects are unnecessary and we don t know if "promissing" will become SOC.