



PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: *World Journal of Gastroenterology*

Manuscript NO: 88656

Title: Gut microbiota in women: The secret of psychological and physical well-being

Provenance and peer review: Invited manuscript; Externally peer reviewed

Peer-review model: Single blind

Reviewer's code: 05097657

Position: Editorial Board

Academic degree: PhD

Professional title: Professor

Reviewer's Country/Territory: India

Author's Country/Territory: Italy

Manuscript submission date: 2023-10-03

Reviewer chosen by: AI Technique

Reviewer accepted review: 2023-10-04 03:35

Reviewer performed review: 2023-10-11 04:58

Review time: 7 Days and 1 Hour

Scientific quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish
Novelty of this manuscript	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: No novelty
Creativity or innovation of this manuscript	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: No creativity or innovation



Scientific significance of the conclusion in this manuscript	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: No scientific significance
Language quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection
Conclusion	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept (High priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Accept (General priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Major revision <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
Re-review	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No
Peer-reviewer statements	Peer-Review: <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous <input type="checkbox"/> Onymous
	Conflicts-of-Interest: <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This manuscript addresses a timely topic and makes a relevant contribution to the field which elaborates the important role of microbioata in disease and cited several regulatory mechanisms to intervene for possible therapeutic purpose. However, some major revisions are needed before it can be published. 1. The manuscript tries to achieve too many things for the beneficial role of microbioata in women. The author only describes several points related to the beneficial role of microbioata but fails to justify any with proper molecular mechanism. It is very obvious that when subjected to external changes, the balance of microbiota community can be affected, leading to dysregulation of bodily functions and diseases. The authors must provide a table mentioning summary of pathogenic microbiota and the related signaling pathways. 2. The figures seem to be incomplete, there is absolutely no need for two separate figures which could have been easily merged (Fig1 and Fig 2) citing more details about the factors affecting microbiota-associated chronic inflammation in healthy and disease state. 3. The author should discuss about the human microbiota composition in different locations as it is known that compared with gut, microbiota is also localized in other



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA
Telephone: +1-925-399-1568
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https://www.wjgnet.com

regions including the oral cavity, lung, vagina, and skin. The author must mention those in brief by providing proper reference. 4. To strengthen the paper, the author can provide a figure by illustrating gut-brain axis interactions and the common factors contributing to the gut-brain activity. 5. It is known that several diseases may be regulated by the microbiota in a sex-specific manner. Does microbiota modulate gender or SRY genes? 6. The author may rewrite the discussion part by elaborating the crosstalk between microbiota localization in different regions and also mentioning summary of pathogenic microbiota and the related signalling pathways. 7. There are some repetitive and overlapping contents in introduction and conclusion section which could have been avoided. 8. There are some typos which could have been corrected before the final submission.



PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: *World Journal of Gastroenterology*

Manuscript NO: 88656

Title: Gut microbiota in women: The secret of psychological and physical well-being

Provenance and peer review: Invited manuscript; Externally peer reviewed

Peer-review model: Single blind

Reviewer’s code: 06289675

Position: Peer Reviewer

Academic degree: MD, PhD

Professional title: N/A

Reviewer’s Country/Territory: United States

Author’s Country/Territory: Italy

Manuscript submission date: 2023-10-03

Reviewer chosen by: AI Technique

Reviewer accepted review: 2023-10-06 00:15

Reviewer performed review: 2023-10-19 20:32

Review time: 13 Days and 20 Hours

Scientific quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish
Novelty of this manuscript	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: No novelty
Creativity or innovation of this manuscript	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Good <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: No creativity or innovation



Scientific significance of the conclusion in this manuscript	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: No scientific significance
Language quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection
Conclusion	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept (High priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Accept (General priority) <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
Re-review	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No
Peer-reviewer statements	Peer-Review: <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous <input type="checkbox"/> Onymous
	Conflicts-of-Interest: <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Journal: World Journal of Gastroenterology Manuscript ID: 88656 Authors: Giuseppe Marano et al. Title: “Microbiota in women: the secret of psychological and physical well-being” The scope and topic of this paper are interesting. However, one crucial aspect to consider for enhancing the quality of the paper and improving its readability is the need to restructure the main text. This restructuring should focus on making the role of microbiota in psychological and physical well-being more apparent, particularly during different stages of a woman's life (e.g., puberty, pregnancy, pre/post-menopause). To achieve this goal, creating specific subsections (and their subheadings) may be beneficial. Additionally, the text should emphasize the differences in the impact of microbiota on women compared to men. Furthermore, it is essential to highlight the pathophysiological mechanisms and clinical implications. These changes will enhance the text's flow, facilitate better navigation for readers, and underscore the paper's scope. Some additional points that should be considered: 1. Given the authors' focus on gut microbiota, the authors should consider whether it would be more appropriate to update the title to more accurately reflect this emphasis. 2. In the



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA
Telephone: +1-925-399-1568
E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com
https://www.wjgnet.com

abstract, the authors mention "gut microbiota"; however, in other parts, only the term "microbiota" is used (e.g., "from the intertwining of biological mechanisms between the microbiota and the female genital system). Therefore, it would be helpful if the authors could clarify whether they are referring to the gut only or to other specific types of microbiota such as the vaginal microbiota or the microbiota in general. Likewise in the main text. 3. Please include the appropriate reference for the statement: "Its strength lies in diversity: a microbiota with high diversity can maintain certain functions and is usually a guarantee of a healthy immune system, while a low diversity microbiota can more easily undergo deficiencies and can cause impaired immune defences." Similarly, for the statement: "In the first years of life, a real genetic "imprinting" of the microbiota takes place, which then determines the state of health in the rest of existence: there it is written whether or not there is predisposition toward certain diseases". Other comments: 1. I believe that there are some opportunities to refine the language in the manuscript, which could further enhance overall clarity.



RE-REVIEW REPORT OF REVISED MANUSCRIPT

Name of journal: *World Journal of Gastroenterology*

Manuscript NO: 88656

Title: Gut microbiota in women: The secret of psychological and physical well-being

Provenance and peer review: Invited manuscript; Externally peer reviewed

Peer-review model: Single blind

Reviewer's code: 05097657

Position: Editorial Board

Academic degree: PhD

Professional title: Professor

Reviewer's Country/Territory: India

Author's Country/Territory: Italy

Manuscript submission date: 2023-10-03

Reviewer chosen by: Jing-Jie Wang

Reviewer accepted review: 2023-11-01 03:46

Reviewer performed review: 2023-11-01 07:29

Review time: 3 Hours

Scientific quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish
Language quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection
Conclusion	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept (High priority) <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept (General priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
Peer-reviewer statements	Peer-Review: <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous <input type="checkbox"/> Onymous Conflicts-of-Interest: <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA

Telephone: +1-925-399-1568

E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com

https://www.wjgnet.com

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The authors have satisfactorily responded to all my questions and made the necessary changes to the manuscript.