

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: *World Journal of Gastroenterology*

Manuscript NO: 92642

Title: Hepatolithiasis: Epidemiology, presentation, classification and management of a complex disease

Provenance and peer review: Invited Manuscript; Externally peer reviewed

Peer-review model: Single blind

Reviewer's code: 05430684

Position: Peer Reviewer

Academic degree: MD, MSc, PhD

Professional title: Consultant Physician-Scientist, Research Fellow

Reviewer's Country/Territory: Greece

Author's Country/Territory: United Kingdom

Manuscript submission date: 2024-01-31

Reviewer chosen by: AI Technique

Reviewer accepted review: 2024-01-31 19:06

Reviewer performed review: 2024-02-03 13:08

Review time: 2 Days and 18 Hours

Scientific quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish
Novelty of this manuscript	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Good <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: No novelty
Creativity or innovation of this manuscript	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: No creativity or innovation

Scientific significance of the conclusion in this manuscript	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: No scientific significance
Language quality	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection
Conclusion	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept (High priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Accept (General priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Major revision <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
Re-review	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No
Peer-reviewer statements	Peer-Review: <input type="checkbox"/> Anonymous <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Onymous
	Conflicts-of-Interest: <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

I have carefully studied the manuscript entitled "Hepatolithiasis: Epidemiology, Presentation, Classification and Management" by Motta RV et al. The manuscript represents a nearly exhaustive narrative review on hepatolithiasis. Since the topic is not novel, the manuscript deserves a rather low priority. However, since the text is at first well prepared and the content is well organized, the manuscript could be considered for publication if enriched with original and educative content. The references are considered sufficient, representative, and up-to-date. Major issue 1) The authors are kindly requested to provide some representative educative material (e.g. figures, videos) regarding the diagnostic approach and the management of hepatolithiasis. Minor issues 1) The authors are welcome to additionally focus on the pediatric population by adding a relevant paragraph. 2) The authors are encouraged to discuss the potential risk factors of cholangiocarcinoma based on additional relevant references (e.g. Liu ZY, Zhou YM, Shi LH, Yin ZF. Risk factors of intrahepatic cholangiocarcinoma in patients with hepatolithiasis: a case-control study. Hepatobiliary Pancreat Dis Int. 2011 Dec;10(6):626-31. doi: 10.1016/s1499-3872(11)60106-9. PMID: 22146627). 3) Figure 2 is



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA
Telephone: +1-925-399-1568
E-mail: office@baishideng.com
https://www.wjgnet.com

inaccessible; the authors are kindly requested to properly revise it.

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: *World Journal of Gastroenterology*

Manuscript NO: 92642

Title: Hepatolithiasis: Epidemiology, presentation, classification and management of a complex disease

Provenance and peer review: Invited Manuscript; Externally peer reviewed

Peer-review model: Single blind

Reviewer's code: 05185768

Position: Editorial Board

Academic degree: MD, MSc, PhD

Professional title: Associate Professor

Reviewer's Country/Territory: Thailand

Author's Country/Territory: United Kingdom

Manuscript submission date: 2024-01-31

Reviewer chosen by: AI Technique

Reviewer accepted review: 2024-02-01 14:16

Reviewer performed review: 2024-02-04 16:17

Review time: 3 Days and 2 Hours

Scientific quality	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish
Novelty of this manuscript	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: No novelty
Creativity or innovation of this manuscript	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: No creativity or innovation

Scientific significance of the conclusion in this manuscript	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: No scientific significance
Language quality	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection
Conclusion	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept (High priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Accept (General priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
Re-review	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No
Peer-reviewer statements	Peer-Review: <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous <input type="checkbox"/> Onymous
	Conflicts-of-Interest: <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Thank you for the opportunity to review this review article about hepatolithiasis. The topic is very interesting and the article is very well organized and well written. I have just few comments. The title should be conservative like this. However, if changing a bit to be more attractive or flashy will be good. Please add figure 1 into the manuscript. Figure 1 should be cited on the introduction part. Please use the consistent term for the ref authors. (for example Glenn et al, Wang and colleagues... I think using Wang et al might be suitable) and in table 1, the ref authors should be first author et al., not only the name of first author only. The authors mentioned about genetic risk factors of hepatolithiasis (ABCB4 and ABCB11). How about the genetic mutation in cystic fibrosis? Does it play vital role in hepatolithiasis as well?

RE-REVIEW REPORT OF REVISED MANUSCRIPT

Name of journal: *World Journal of Gastroenterology*

Manuscript NO: 92642

Title: Hepatolithiasis: Epidemiology, presentation, classification and management of a complex disease

Provenance and peer review: Invited Manuscript; Externally peer reviewed

Peer-review model: Single blind

Reviewer's code: 05430684

Position: Peer Reviewer

Academic degree: MD, MSc, PhD

Professional title: Consultant Physician-Scientist, Research Fellow

Reviewer's Country/Territory: Greece

Author's Country/Territory: United Kingdom

Manuscript submission date: 2024-01-31

Reviewer chosen by: Cong Lin

Reviewer accepted review: 2024-03-08 04:48

Reviewer performed review: 2024-03-08 05:16

Review time: 1 Hour

Scientific quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish
Language quality	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection
Conclusion	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept (High priority) <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept (General priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
Peer-reviewer	Peer-Review: <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous <input type="checkbox"/> Onymous



**Baishideng
Publishing
Group**

7041 Koll Center Parkway, Suite
160, Pleasanton, CA 94566, USA
Telephone: +1-925-399-1568
E-mail: office@baishideng.com
<https://www.wjgnet.com>

statements

Conflicts-of-Interest: [] Yes [Y] No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

I have studied the revised version of the manuscript entitled "Epidemiology, Presentation, Classification and Management of a complex disease" by Motta RV et al. The authors have successfully responded to all queries raised throughout the review process. The quality of the manuscript has been ameliorated. I have no further comments.