

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: *World Journal of Gastroenterology*

Manuscript NO: 89463

Title: Diagnosis and treatment experience of atypical hepatic cystic echinococcosis type 1 at a tertiary center in China

Provenance and peer review: Unsolicited Manuscript; Externally peer reviewed

Peer-review model: Single blind

Reviewer's code: 04025355

Position: Peer Reviewer

Academic degree: MD

Professional title: Professor

Reviewer's Country/Territory: France

Author's Country/Territory: China

Manuscript submission date: 2023-11-01

Reviewer chosen by: Jia-Ru Fan

Reviewer accepted review: 2023-11-22 06:55

Reviewer performed review: 2023-11-27 16:43

Review time: 5 Days and 9 Hours

Scientific quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish
Novelty of this manuscript	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: No novelty
Creativity or innovation of this manuscript	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: No creativity or innovation

Scientific significance of the conclusion in this manuscript	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: No scientific significance
Language quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection
Conclusion	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept (High priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Accept (General priority) <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
Re-review	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No
Peer-reviewer statements	Peer-Review: <input type="checkbox"/> Anonymous <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Onymous
	Conflicts-of-Interest: <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Authors conducted an interesting retrospective study to investigate the high-frequency ultrasound for atypical hepatic cysts, especially to distinguish simple hepatic cysts and some cystic echinococcosis type 1 (CE1) hydatid cysts without clearly defined cyst walls or characteristic endocysts. Laparoscopic exploration and follow-up of the patients made the diagnosis of certainty. Predictive and positive predictive values of high-frequency ultrasound was excellent and in one patient, among 77 patients preoperatively diagnosed as simple hepatic cyst, the high-frequency ultrasound was taken in default but laparoscopy also, and the diagnosis was only corrected by clinical follow-up of the patient end the appearance of an intercostal hydatid cyst. Commentaries: The methodology is clearly exposed. We have however one question: were doctors who performed high-frequency ultrasound were informed of results of routine blood test, liver function test, tumor marker tests, and serum immunoglobulin tests for echinococcosis ? We regret that the authors have not also made a prospective investigation. Discussion is interesting but too long Minor : ref 6. The year of publication is incorrect (Lancet Glob Health 202; 8: e603-e611.): 2020

PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: *World Journal of Gastroenterology*

Manuscript NO: 89463

Title: Diagnosis and treatment experience of atypical hepatic cystic echinococcosis type 1 at a tertiary center in China

Provenance and peer review: Unsolicited Manuscript; Externally peer reviewed

Peer-review model: Single blind

Reviewer's code: 03547288

Position: Peer Reviewer

Academic degree: PhD

Professional title: Professor

Reviewer's Country/Territory: India

Author's Country/Territory: China

Manuscript submission date: 2023-11-01

Reviewer chosen by: Jia-Ru Fan

Reviewer accepted review: 2023-12-05 06:16

Reviewer performed review: 2023-12-05 06:30

Review time: 1 Hour

Scientific quality	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Do not publish
Novelty of this manuscript	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: No novelty
Creativity or innovation of this manuscript	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: No creativity or innovation

Scientific significance of the conclusion in this manuscript	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Good <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Fair <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: No scientific significance
Language quality	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejection
Conclusion	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept (High priority) <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept (General priority) <input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
Re-review	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Yes <input type="checkbox"/> No
Peer-reviewer statements	Peer-Review: <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Anonymous <input type="checkbox"/> Onymous
	Conflicts-of-Interest: <input type="checkbox"/> Yes <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No

SPECIFIC COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Congratulations to the author for this extensive and result oriented retrospective study , the use of HIFU can be of great importance in diagnosing and differentiating CE1 cysts