

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Diabetes

ESPS Manuscript NO: 2985

Title: Effect of thyroid hormone replacement on insulin resistance in patients with overt hypothyroidism

Reviewer code: 00227496

Science editor: Wen, Ling-Ling

Date sent for review: 2013-03-31 20:50

Date reviewed: 2013-04-10 20:13

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)		BPG Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Aml Mohamed Nada et al. examined the effect of thyroid hormone replacement on insulin resistance in patients with overt hypothyroidism in a small cohort in southern region of Saudi Arabia. They found that hypothyroidism is not related to insulin sensitivity and that thyroid hormone replacement does not change insulin sensitivity. The present observatory finding is basically negative results in a small cohort. Although several studies have been conducting with conflicting results in worldwide, the current observation may be beneficial for understanding the relation between insulin resistance and thyroid function in Saudi Arabia. Specific comments: 1) In Table 1, mislabeled underlines in data with Euthyroid "9.1, 6.7, and 1.5" should be corrected. 2) Length of the discussion is too long. Many sentences of the discussion include largely review of the knowledge not directly related to the present results. Especially, sentences beginning from "There is ample evidence...", "Hypothyroidism is known to be associated with dyslipidemia, ...", and "Total cholesterol was inversely associated..." are already well known knowledge regarding hypothyroidism. Thus, these should be removed or much shortened. In this regard, the discussion should be shortened at least by 30%.

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Diabetes

ESPS Manuscript NO: 2985

Title: Effect of thyroid hormone replacement on insulin resistance in patients with overt hypothyroidism

Reviewer code: 02446580

Science editor: Wen, Ling-Ling

Date sent for review: 2013-03-31 20:50

Date reviewed: 2013-04-22 02:58

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Nada presents us with a cross-sectional and treatment study examining the effect of hypothyroidism on glucose and lipid plasma parameters. The study seems largely confirmatory although the study population is most likely different from previous studies. The number of subjects examined is quite low and the study could be improved by including more subjects followed by stratification on FT4 / TSH levels (see below). Major comments: 1) A p-value of 0.05 is a trend, not significant, please correct this in the entire manuscript. 2) The SD for FT4 values for hypothyroid subjects in table 1 suggests that there is a large variation in the study population in terms of hypothyroidism (this is also mentioned in the discussion). I suggest to try and stratify on for example the lowest 50% (or lowest quartile although that might require a higher N) and see how these compare to controls and how they respond to therapy. Minor comments: 1) The abstract is too long, please correct. 2) Please elaborate a bit on the findings in reference 11-14 in the introduction. 3) Please describe ethnicity of study population and include this information in the discussion. 4) Describe units of insulin / glucose used in HOMA-IR calculation. 5) Leave out the discussion on type 1 diabetes in the discussion section (seems irrelevant for the current study). 6) Table 3 contains duplication of everything, please change to a more easily readable form without duplication of values. 7) Use correct +/- symbols in tables and use/include the same abbreviations in all tables.