

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Diabetes

ESPS Manuscript NO: 7688

Title: Genetic Polymorphisms of Cytokine Genes in Type 2 Diabetes Mellitus

Reviewer code: 02453123

Science editor: Wen, Ling-Ling

Date sent for review: 2013-11-29 14:24

Date reviewed: 2013-12-09 04:41

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

1. The authors have reviewed the role of cytokine polymorphisms in diabetes in an extensive manner. The article underscores the importance of recognizing the genetic polymorphisms in the pathogenesis of diabetes. We suggest having a separate paragraph explaining the pathogenesis for the ease of readership. 2. We also suggest that authors review the effect of anti-inflammatory markers in improving the glycemic control. As most of the studies reviewed by the authors explored the role of inflammation, the data on the role of anti inflammatories in improving the glycemic control would substantiate the subject explored a,b,c 3. A schematic diagram of how the interleukins work would be more useful to the readers not familiar with the inflammatory pathway 4. The role of genetic polymorphisms in the development of micro-vascular complications from diabetes has been explored in the past and review of few of them would add more support to the article. 5. The article reads well and does not have any major grammatical errors

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Diabetes

ESPS Manuscript NO: 7688

Title: Genetic Polymorphisms of Cytokine Genes in Type 2 Diabetes Mellitus

Reviewer code: 01404215

Science editor: Wen, Ling-Ling

Date sent for review: 2013-11-29 14:24

Date reviewed: 2013-12-13 17:47

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The study by Banerjee and Saxena offers a comprehensive view of the influence of genetic polymorphisms of cytokine genes on type 2 diabetes. The authors provide a systematic review of the literature and present a diagram describing the involvement of various cytokines in type 2 diabetes. The review text is appropriate, and the authors' work will be very useful for readers pursuing studies on individuals at risk, advising them to take prior precautionary measures to prevent or delay the onset of the disease. Major Points 1. The authors have not performed specific experiments to correlate mutational polymorphisms and the incidence of type 2 diabetes. They have only taken data from other authors and presented them in a systematic reviewed form. 2. The resulting manuscript is like a review on the topic, but if that is the case, the length and depth of the article are insufficient for the purpose. 3. A detailed interpretation of the molecular mechanisms relating the polymorphic change and the induction of type 2 diabetes is lacking. As a consequence, the manuscript is too descriptive and readers do not learn the mechanistic effects of single mutations on cytokine transcription and translation and the final outcome, i.e., the appearance of type 2 diabetes. 4. Fig 1 (displaying a scheme of the relationship between cytokines and metabolic induction of type 2 diabetes) does not show the biochemical correlation between causes and effects, and as a result, the specific transcription factors interacting with specific parts of cytokine gene promoters are lacking. Minor Points 1. Captions of Tables are too simplistic and do not help the reader to understand the results presented. For example, in Table 1 the meaning of VNTR is not given. The redundant IL-18 in the penultimate line is difficult to understand. The occurrence of 5 SNPs (without detailing the mutations) has not been clarified. The meaning of capitals S or NS used



Baishideng Publishing Group Co., Limited

Flat C, 23/F., Lucky Plaza,
315-321 Lockhart Road, Wan Chai, Hong Kong, China

in column 4 has not been explained 2. Table 3 shows two references to the same populations (the KORA Survey). Detailed polymorphisms are lacking 3. Table 4. It would be of interest to explain how the same polymorphism (-1082 G/A), produced different effects in Indian populations. The same applies to polymorphism (-592 A/C) in the Taiwanese groups (S versus NS). A comment about these points would have been useful. 4. Table 5. A T at the beginning of line 1 is lacking (Tarragonan rather than Arragonan)



Baishideng Publishing Group Co., Limited

Flat C, 23/F., Lucky Plaza,
315-321 Lockhart Road, Wan Chai, Hong Kong, China

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Diabetes

ESPS Manuscript NO: 7688

Title: Genetic Polymorphisms of Cytokine Genes in Type 2 Diabetes Mellitus

Reviewer code: 00597793

Science editor: Wen, Ling-Ling

Date sent for review: 2013-11-29 14:24

Date reviewed: 2014-01-14 02:00

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)		BPG Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The title of the paper suggests that the authors will discuss the effects of variants of cytokines with DM and its complications. This is not done in the text of the paper. There is some information like this in the Tables. The text of the article is a general discussion of cytokines which does not comport with the title. The INTRODUCTION is diffuse and does not add anything to the paper and is off subject. The first 3 paragraphs can be deleted.



Baishideng Publishing Group Co., Limited

Flat C, 23/F., Lucky Plaza,
315-321 Lockhart Road, Wan Chai, Hong Kong, China

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Diabetes

ESPS Manuscript NO: 7688

Title: Genetic Polymorphisms of Cytokine Genes in Type 2 Diabetes Mellitus

Reviewer code: 00106462

Science editor: Wen, Ling-Ling

Date sent for review: 2013-11-29 14:24

Date reviewed: 2014-01-22 23:57

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Nicely oerorganized and well written review of a complicated topic



Baishideng Publishing Group Co., Limited

Flat C, 23/F., Lucky Plaza,
315-321 Lockhart Road, Wan Chai, Hong Kong, China

ESPS Peer-review Report

Name of Journal: World Journal of Diabetes

ESPS Manuscript NO: 7688

Title: Genetic Polymorphisms of Cytokine Genes in Type 2 Diabetes Mellitus

Reviewer code: 01692833

Science editor: Wen, Ling-Ling

Date sent for review: 2013-11-29 14:24

Date reviewed: 2014-01-23 17:10

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A (Excellent)	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B (Very good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C (Good)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D (Fair)	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Existed	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E (Poor)		<input type="checkbox"/> No records	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Major revision

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This manuscript represents an interesting effort to connect polymorphisms of interleukins and inflammatory factors with type 2 diabetes. Indeed there is an extensive literature covered to yield the tables shown in the manuscript; however, what is lacking is the comparison with a number of other diseases (MS is mentioned in one table) in which inflammation plays a major role, such as: various types of arthritis, Crohn's disease, ulcerative colitis, type 1 diabetes, etc. The point made is the following: how specific are these SNPs for T2DM? the manuscript does not yield information in this respect, but this is the most important point.