ESPS Peer-review Report
Name of Journal: World Journal of Diabetes
ESPS Manuscript NO: 9790
Title: HLA alleles and their role in the type 2 diabetes patients follow up
Reviewer code: 02478683
Science editor: Ling-Ling Wen
Date sent for review: 2014-02-28 22:35
Date reviewed: 2014-03-30 23:19

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
[ ] Grade A (Excellent)	[ ] Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	[Y] Accept
[ ] Grade B (Very good)	[Y] Grade B: minor language polishing	[ ] Existed	[ ] High priority for publication
[Y] Grade C (Good)	[ ] Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	[ ] No records	
[ ] Grade D (Fair)		BPG Search:	[ ]Rejection
[ ] Grade E (Poor)	[ ] Grade D: rejected	[ ] Existed	[ ] Minor revision
		[ ] No records	[ ] Major revision

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

To the Authors,   Nowadays, atypical diabetes is a growing and worrying issue at clinical scenarios. Despite of the limitations of a cross-sectional study, the hypothesis proposed by the authors might be very promising in a longitudinal study.

ESPS Peer-review Report
Name of Journal: World Journal of Diabetes
ESPS Manuscript NO: 9790
Title: HLA alleles and their role in the type 2 diabetes patients follow up
Reviewer code: 00037668
Science editor: Ling-Ling Wen
Date sent for review: 2014-02-28 22:35
Date reviewed: 2014-04-03 04:21

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
[ ] Grade A (Excellent)	[ ] Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	[ ] Accept
[Y] Grade B (Very good)	[Y] Grade B: minor language polishing	[ ] Existed	[ ] High priority for publication
[ ] Grade C (Good)	[ ] Grade C: a great deal of language polishing	[ ] No records	[ ]Rejection
[ ] Grade D (Fair)		BPG Search:	[Y] Minor revision
[ ] Grade E (Poor)	[ ] Grade D: rejected	[ ] Existed	[ ] Major revision
		[ ] No records	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This study is aimed at providing a new tool to enhance identification of those patients with atypical presentation of diabetes. To his end, the authors recruited 93 atypical patients and 106 classical patients classified according to specific requirements. All patients were assessed based upon the same bio-medical and metabolic parameters, and the parameters were entered in a new algorithm foe evaluation. Interestingly, the only points of difference were observed in the lipid profiles of the patients, especially in the total cholesterol and associated HDL and LDL content. Moreover, the main discriminatory parameter was the presence of specific HLA alleles for the susceptibility to autoimmune disease. The results are highly interesting. The next step will be the validation of such a discriminatory parameterin a much larger sample size with a more heterogeneous genetic and racial make-up.   Minor issues: page 2, 2nd line: phrase needs to be revised as some words appear to be missing.   Page 2, last paragraph of Introduction: ..we   pretend to provide... Table 2" TC and not CT Figure 1: peptide and not peptido

---

ESPS Peer-review Report
Name of Journal: World Journal of Diabetes
ESPS Manuscript NO: 9790
Title: HLA alleles and their role in the type 2 diabetes patients follow up
Reviewer code: 02526196
Science editor: Ling-Ling Wen
Date sent for review: 2014-02-28 22:35
Date reviewed: 2014-04-06 21:23

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	RECOMMENDATION	CONCLUSION
[ ] Grade A (Excellent)	[ ] Grade A: Priority Publishing	Google Search:	[ ] Accept
[ ] Grade B (Very good)	[Y] Grade B: minor language polishing	[ ] Existed	[ ] High priority for
[Y] Grade C (Good)	[ ] Grade C: a great deal of	[ ] No records	publication
[ ] Grade D (Fair)	language polishing	BPG Search:	[ ]Rejection
[ ] Grade E (Poor)	[ ] Grade D: rejected	[ ] Existed	[ ] Minor revision
		[ ] No records	[Y] Major revision

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Ms: ESPS Manuscript NO: 9790 Authors: Fernandez M, Fabregat M, Javiel G, Mimbacas A Title: HLA alleles and their role in the type 2 diabetes patients follow up   GENERAL COMMENTS: The authors in this paper want to propose an algorithm including HLA genotyping as a tool to discriminate atypical diabetic patients and to complement international treatment guidelines for complex patients. Author use HLA genotyping in this paper to divide 199 type 2 diabetic patients into two different groups and then compare the differences between these two groups. For me it is not so clear that the purpose of such classification, different prognosis or different treatment.   SPECIFIC COMMENTS: Title: The title is not so well to reflect the major topic and contents of this follow-up study. It may be suggested to change title as "HLA alleles may serve as a tool to discriminate atypical type 2 diabetic patients".   The running title is missing in the paper. Abstract: This abstract should be structured better. Line 1 to 2: The sentence "There is evidence of the existence of patients who cannot be classified in neither of the two principal diabetes groups" is suggested to change as "There is evidence of the existence of patients who cannot be classified in neither of the type 1 or type 2 diabetes."   Line 5 to 7: The sentence "This could be influent in these patients, and led us investigate whether the presence of this marker could add new information." is suggested to change as "This could be influent in these patients; therefore we investigate whether the presence of this marker could add new information."   Line 9 to 10: The sentence "This population was classified in "classic" and "atypical"." is suggested to change as "This population was classified in "classic" and "atypical" according to HLA typing."   INTRODUCTION: The introduction is OK written.   Paragraph 3, line 2: About abbreviation "T1D". I assume it is a abbreviation of type 1

diabetes. If you want to use this abbreviation, you should use it throughout the paper. You should also use abbreviation "T2D for type 2 diabetes.   MATERIAL and METHODS: Generally it is well written, however several issues are needed to clarify: 1, Authors mentioned that "All subjects were interviewed by medical doctors following a standardized protocol.". What is standardized protocol? 2, Suggested making a table presenting the metabolic parameters of f section.   3, Authors mentioned that "Molecular analysis : DNA was obtained from peripheral blood using standard (phenol / chloroform) technique. The HLA typing was performed by reverse ASO technique (Innogenetics Ltd, Belgium, UE)." However, I wonder, why no description of this result in the result section.   RESULTS: It is very simple written. Some sentences are needed to improve the English writing. For example: "When the data from values of cholesterol, HDL, LDL and TG, was analyzed presented significant differences in the first three items   (Table 1)." and "Regarding that, all the factors contribute at dyslipidemia phenotypic classification, a lower proportion of hypercholesterolemia in atypical patients (12.3% vs. 2.2%, with 0.157 ODDs (0035-0716) was the only statistical significance observed data." are needed to improve the English writing.   Furthermore, the molecular results were missing in the results section.   DISCUSSION: It is needed to improve the discussion section writing.   1, First paragraph: Authors seems not provide results of immunity molecular marker, such as HLA genotyping in the paper, how authors can reach the aim of this paper.   2, Third paragraph: Authors mentioned at the beginning of this paragraph "We propose here to add the usage of HLA typing to the international standard criteria.". This is the key point of this paper. However, authors seems not provide more evident to support that HLA typing is very important.   3, Eighth paragraph: Authors also did not answer what point th