

## ESPS PEER REVIEW REPORT

**Name of journal:** World Journal of Diabetes

**ESPS manuscript NO:** 14140

**Title:** The role of phytoestrogens in prevention and management of type 2 diabetes

**Reviewer code:** 02446609

**Science editor:** Yue-Li Tian

**Date sent for review:** 2014-09-22 16:33

**Date reviewed:** 2014-10-06 21:39

| CLASSIFICATION                                    | LANGUAGE EVALUATION                                                   | RECOMMENDATION                      | CONCLUSION                                             |
|---------------------------------------------------|-----------------------------------------------------------------------|-------------------------------------|--------------------------------------------------------|
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent       | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing                 | Google Search:                      | <input type="checkbox"/> Accept                        |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good       | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing | <input type="checkbox"/> Existing   | <input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication |
| <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing  | <input type="checkbox"/> No records | <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection                     |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair            | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected                            | <input type="checkbox"/> Existing   | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision     |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor            |                                                                       | <input type="checkbox"/> No records | <input type="checkbox"/> Major revision                |

## COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Current evidence from animal and human studies suggests that diets rich in soy and phytoestrogens have beneficial effects on many aspects of diabetes and obesity. In animals studies it has been found that soy and phytoestrogens are effective at reducing adipose tissue and increasing glucose uptake. However, available data from human studies do not offer clear support. The current review has compared several studies and discussed their limitations which are critical in considering soy products and phytoestrogens as a component of healthy diet and for prevention and management of Type 2 diabetes. C-1: Over-all this review has successfully incorporated the information highlighting the importance of phytoestrogens in prevention and maintenance of T2D. The findings from most of the clinical trials and prospective cohort studies have been compared and commented upon. Clear application possibilities have been defined and reviewed by the author. Here are some minor comments to be considered before publication. 1. In the abstract section there are few typographical errors, like thread instead of threat and global instead of globe. This section may be revised for minor corrections. 2. In Introduction- third paragraph- References are required for showing that phytoestrogens belong to isoflavones, structure and other properties of phytoestrogens.

## ESPS PEER REVIEW REPORT

**Name of journal:** World Journal of Diabetes

**ESPS manuscript NO:** 14140

**Title:** The role of phytoestrogens in prevention and management of type 2 diabetes

**Reviewer code:** 00186017

**Science editor:** Yue-Li Tian

**Date sent for review:** 2014-09-22 16:33

**Date reviewed:** 2014-10-07 03:15

| CLASSIFICATION                                    | LANGUAGE EVALUATION                                                   | RECOMMENDATION                      | CONCLUSION                                             |
|---------------------------------------------------|-----------------------------------------------------------------------|-------------------------------------|--------------------------------------------------------|
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent       | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing                 | Google Search:                      | <input type="checkbox"/> Accept                        |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good       | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing | <input type="checkbox"/> Existing   | <input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication |
| <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing  | <input type="checkbox"/> No records | <input type="checkbox"/> Rejection                     |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair            | <input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected                            | <input type="checkbox"/> Existing   | <input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision                |
| <input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor            |                                                                       | <input type="checkbox"/> No records | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Major revision     |

## COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

In this review, authors examine the current evidence linking phytoestrogens and T2D from epidemiological studies and clinical trials, and explore the potential underlying mechanisms of phytoestrogens' effect on glucose metabolism from animal and experimental studies, and propose research priorities for future investigations in this field. Although plausible arguments to explain possible mechanisms linking phytoestrogens and glucose metabolic disorders has been emphasized, results from epidemiologic studies and clinical trials are controversial. On this regard, the most important issue in a review article, is the inclusion of specific comments from authors focused in their interpretation of data and possible phenomena involved to explain the controversial results. Ax example, the sentence "...lower levels of soy foods, genistein intake was significantly associated with 2-h postchallenge insulin concentrations, but not fasting or 2-h glucose concentrations." (Page 6, 2nd paragraph) how can be interpreted? It was due to improvement of insulin action? In the same way, the sentence "...among 2811 Chinese adults, soy protein intake was significantly associated with increased odds of hyperglycemia in men, ..." (Page 6, 2nd paragraph) imply that soy protein intake is a risk factor for defeloping diabetes? Throughout manuscript, several issues and sentences deserve to be discussed in a rationale way in order to clearly establish the authors' point of view. Studies of metaanalysis (references 47 and 49) should be included in review, rather than the metaanalysis A table that summarizes results of clinical trials and cross-sectional studies is needed. How can be explained that prevalence of diabetes and prediabetes among Chinese population (in whom consumption of soy



## BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC

8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA

Telephone: +1-925-223-8242

Fax: +1-925-223-8243

E-mail: [bpgoffice@wjgnet.com](mailto:bpgoffice@wjgnet.com)

<http://www.wjgnet.com>

---

products is generally high) reach 9.7% and 15.5%?