

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Diabetes

ESPS manuscript NO: 24775

Title: Relationship between depression and diabetes in pregnancy: A systematic review

Reviewer's code: 00037668

Reviewer's country: United States

Science editor: Jin-Xin Kong

Date sent for review: 2016-02-14 10:51

Date reviewed: 2016-04-01 09:24

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

This manuscript is a systematic review of the literature about the relationship between depression (post-partum depression in particular) and diabetes in pregnancy. After reviewing almost 1200 articles on the subject, the authors included in the review only 48 of them as they were the only pertinent to the topic. The assessment of the articles indicated overall poor study quality as many studies were observational and often lacked stringent, objective criteria to support a diagnosis of clinical depression. Based on these limitations, no clear consensus emerged from the literature review, as well as limited guidance for clinicians. The main conclusion of the authors is that high quality research with stringent criteria and assessable parameters is needed to establish specific guidelines for management of pregnant women with depression and gestational diabetes.

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Diabetes

ESPS manuscript NO: 24775

Title: Relationship between depression and diabetes in pregnancy: A systematic review

Reviewer's code: 00506294

Reviewer's country: Spain

Science editor: Jin-Xin Kong

Date sent for review: 2016-02-14 10:51

Date reviewed: 2016-04-01 18:26

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		[Y] No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		[Y] No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The article: "The relationship between depression and diabetes in pregnancy: a systematic review" is an analysis about the prevalence of depression among women with gestational diabetes that ranged from 4.1 to 80% in 16 studies . The analysis of the review was focused to exam whether diabetes and pregnancy was a risk factor for depression or depression was a risk factor for diabetes in pregnancy. The results are confuse because there was no clear consensus for the relationship and also there are no guides for the management of both situations in pregnancy. The analysis is interesting and data are valuable for clinicians because the presence of both situations are frequent.

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Diabetes

ESPS manuscript NO: 24775

Title: Relationship between depression and diabetes in pregnancy: A systematic review

Reviewer's code: 03469811

Reviewer's country: Germany

Science editor: Jin-Xin Kong

Date sent for review: 2016-02-14 10:51

Date reviewed: 2016-04-02 15:53

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		BPG Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

The submitted reviews article "The relationship between depression and diabetes in pregnancy: a systematic review" summarizes the recent and comprehensive published material on this subject. The article focuses on the current literature and represents an extensive and very broad and systematic overview of the issue. In the introduction the main issues are addressed: gestational diabetes, pre-existing or newly detected type 1, type 2 diabetes or any form of diabetes and depression prior, during pregnancy or postpartum, the issue that depression could be a risk factor for the development of type 2 diabetes and the lacking advice regarding care for these patients. In the method section literature search results and study characteristics are well described. Depression is often not fully developed in the sense of a ICD-10 or DSM-IV diagnosis, subclinical forms which are reported in depression questionnaires could lead to missing signs of worsening of mental states are not ignored. To summarize the paper gives a very complete state of the art view of the current knowledge of the the relationship between depression/depressive symptoms and diabetes in pregnancy.. There are some small issues to take into consideration: Please explain why the studies that reported depressive symptoms on measures of anxiety or bipolar disorder are excluded. Considering study



BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC

8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA

Telephone: +1-925-223-8242

Fax: +1-925-223-8243

E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com

<http://www.wjgnet.com>

quality the selection bias (p 9,) and other biases (p 19) should be characterized in more details. P 10 the abbreviation RCT was used for the first time without specification. The review is limited by the bidirectional nature between diabetes in pregnancy and depression before and during pregnancy and postpartum. Longitudinal studies are missing to clarify in particular the impact of depression on diabetes. The aspect of the shared underlying mechanism between depression and diabetes should be explained in more details. Article category: why this paper is presented under "Allergy"? Keywords: it seems that the keywords are not separated meaningfully References: DSM-IV and ICD-10 are used without references Figures: N and n is not consistently used

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Diabetes

ESPS manuscript NO: 24775

Title: Relationship between depression and diabetes in pregnancy: A systematic review

Reviewer's code: 00058872

Reviewer's country: Italy

Science editor: Jin-Xin Kong

Date sent for review: 2016-02-14 10:51

Date reviewed: 2016-03-29 22:34

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		[Y] No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Authors are requested to give a possible explanation about the link between depression and diabetes mellitus, although work on this topic is not conclusive.