

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Diabetes

ESPS manuscript NO: 30121

Title: Association of NFKB1 gene polymorphism (rs28362491) with levels of inflammatory biomarkers and susceptibility to diabetic nephropathy in Asian Indians

Reviewer's code: 00503187

Reviewer's country: Finland

Science editor: Fang-Fang Ji

Date sent for review: 2016-09-19 19:04

Date reviewed: 2016-09-28 21:16

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		<input type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

In their study, Gautam et al. analyze the association of NFKB1 gene polymorphism with inflammatory biomarkers and risk of diabetic nephropathy in 300 Asian Indian subjects presenting either normoglycemia, T2DM or T2DM with diabetic nephropathy. They found that -94 ATTG ins/ins polymorphism might be associated with increased risk of developing nephropathy in the study population. Comments: 1. In abstract in aims, mention the name of the gene that is studied. 2. In the first sentence of discussion (NFKB1 promoter (-94 ins/del) AGGT polymorphism has been associated with many inflammatory diseases like asthma, autoimmune diseases like rheumatoid arthritis, cancers, AIDS, and various diabetic complications.), please, give references for previously published work. Do the 'various diabetic complications' include studies on diabetic nephropathy? 3. The last sentence of the first paragraph in discussion (However our results were in contrast with a genomic study conducted by Yang et al in 2014[28].) leaves open the reasons for the contradictory results. The authors could discuss the reasons for the contradictory findings. 4. I suggest the authors to modify the sentence in discussion saying 'A comparable study showed that p50 null



BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC

8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA

Telephone: +1-925-223-8242

Fax: +1-925-223-8243

E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com

<http://www.wjgnet.com>

mice...'. The comparison is done between a study on mice and a study on patients with T2DM; I don't think that these two setups can really be called comparable. Also, the comparison is made between development of nephropathy and asthma, arthritis, and autoimmune encephalomyelitis. 5. Also the next sentence 'A similar study conducted in sporadic colorectal cancer (CRC)[33] and epithelial ovarian cancer (EOC)[26]' needs modification. It is called 'similar study'. On what basis are the studies similar? The sentence could be modified. 6. The language needs to be improved throughout the manuscript.

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Diabetes

ESPS manuscript NO: 30121

Title: Association of NFKB1 gene polymorphism (rs28362491) with levels of inflammatory biomarkers and susceptibility to diabetic nephropathy in Asian Indians

Reviewer's code: 02533652

Reviewer's country: India

Science editor: Fang-Fang Ji

Date sent for review: 2016-09-19 19:04

Date reviewed: 2016-10-02 15:30

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		BPG Search:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Dear Authors, the manuscript is well informative, however it is based on small sample size which is a limitation of generalising the conclusion. Discussion is also weakly written and there are too many typos and grammatical mistakes all across the manuscript. It is advisable to revamp the discussion and add more comparisons to the other studies in more detailed fashion. Regards

ESPS PEER-REVIEW REPORT

Name of journal: World Journal of Diabetes

ESPS manuscript NO: 30121

Title: Association of NFKB1 gene polymorphism (rs28362491) with levels of inflammatory biomarkers and susceptibility to diabetic nephropathy in Asian Indians

Reviewer's code: 03490249

Reviewer's country: Japan

Science editor: Fang-Fang Ji

Date sent for review: 2016-09-19 19:04

Date reviewed: 2016-10-05 06:16

CLASSIFICATION	LANGUAGE EVALUATION	SCIENTIFIC MISCONDUCT	CONCLUSION
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Excellent	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade A: Priority publishing	Google Search:	<input type="checkbox"/> Accept
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Very good	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade B: Minor language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	<input type="checkbox"/> High priority for publication
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Grade C: Good	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade C: A great deal of language polishing	<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	<input type="checkbox"/> Rejection
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Fair	<input type="checkbox"/> Grade D: Rejected	<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	<input type="checkbox"/> Minor revision
<input type="checkbox"/> Grade E: Poor		[Y] No	<input type="checkbox"/> Major revision
		BPG Search:	
		<input type="checkbox"/> The same title	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Duplicate publication	
		<input type="checkbox"/> Plagiarism	
		[Y] No	

COMMENTS TO AUTHORS

Gautam A et al. investigated -94 ATTG insertion/deletion polymorphism in NFKB1 gene in normoglycemic, type 2 diabetes without complications, and with diabetic nephropathy. The allelic frequencies of -95 ATTG insertion/deletion were 0.655/0.345 (NG), 0.62/0.38 (DM) and 0.775/0.225 (DM-CKD). The -94 ATTG ins allele was associated with elevation of urinary excretion of uMCP-1, and plasma TNF-alpha. The authors demonstrated that -94 ATTG ins allele is risk for the development of diabetic nephropathy. However, they should carefully avoid the selection bias in the case control study. Major comments 1. The authors should mention about the ethnic differences 2.

The authors should define 'normoglycemic' in page 7 line 16. Is it normal fasting glucose or normal glucose tolerance? Did authors perform 75g-OGTT? 3. Why did authors define 'DM-CKD' as subjects with T2DM > 5 years with nephropathy? The patients with T2D develop diabetic nephropathy in 5 years? 4. In page 7 line 27, how did authors measure the proteinuria and microalbuminuria? 5. In page 8 lines 3-4, how did authors check the presence of diabetes in the relatives? 6. In page 8 line 7, please specify 'renal disorders'. 7. In page 8 line 10, why did



BAISHIDENG PUBLISHING GROUP INC

8226 Regency Drive, Pleasanton, CA 94588, USA

Telephone: +1-925-223-8242

Fax: +1-925-223-8243

E-mail: bpgoffice@wjgnet.com

<http://www.wjgnet.com>

authors eliminate the patients with macrovascular complications? How did authors check the presence of macroangiopathy? Minor comments 1. In page 9 line 14, please check the final concentrations of primers, 0.5 mM. 2. In page 11 line 6, please define 'HC'. 3. In page 11 lines 24-26, which -94 ATG insertion/deletion allele links to these autoimmune diseases? 4. In page 12 line 8, please define 'viz.'?